



Community & Economic Development Department

Planning Division

3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522 | Phone: (951) 826-5371 | RiversideCA.gov

CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD MEETING DATE: JUNE 20, 2018

AGENDA ITEM NO.: 2

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

I. CASE NUMBER(S): P17-0764

II. PROJECT SUMMARY:

- 1) Proposal:** Certificate of Appropriateness request for the construction of a multi-family development consisting of 13 residential units on a vacant lot within the Seventh Street Historic District.
- 2) Location:** 4019 Mission Inn Avenue, situated on the northwest corner of Mission Inn Avenue and Chestnut Street
- 3) Ward:** 1
- 4) Applicant:** Russ Haley of CityMark Communities, LLC
- 5) Case Planner:** Scott Watson, Assistant Planner

III. RECOMMENDATION:

That the Cultural Heritage Board recommend that City Council:

- 1. DETERMINE** that Planning Case P17-0764 will not have a significant effect on the environment and **ADOPT** the Mitigated Negative Declaration and **ADOPT** the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP); and
- 2. APPROVE** Planning Case P17-0764, based on the findings summarized below and subject to the attached conditions, thereby issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project.

IV. BACKGROUND/HISTORY:

- **Background:**

For blight elimination and land assembly purposes, the former Redevelopment Agency authorized the acquisition of 4019 Mission Inn Avenue on May 2, 2006. The property was previously occupied by the Victoria Market, which contained a 7,351 square foot liquor store. Subsequent to the acquisition, the former Redevelopment Agency demolished non-contributor to the historic district to accommodate future development.

On March 15, 2016, Successor Agency staff issued an RFP for the disposition and development of the property. Based on community outreach and as stipulated in the RFP, staff and the neighboring community preferred a low density “pocket neighborhood” project that would increase housing opportunities for downtown residents, enhance the surrounding neighborhood, and provide job opportunities for local residents. Staff also stipulated that “for sale” and “multi-family” development proposals would also be considered with a provision for “affordable housing.”

On June 13, 2016, Successor Agency staff received proposals from Aspire Community Housing Organization, Citymark Development, LLC, and RC Hobbs Company. After review and scoring of the proposals, staff and two members of the community (representing the Downtown Area Neighborhood Alliance and the Pick Group) interviewed all of the respondents to further aid in the decision and recommendation making process. The interviews were held on July 28, 2016. At the conclusion of the interview process, staff and the two community representatives re-scored each proposal and collectively concluded that the Citymark Development, LLC proposal was the most responsive. The project is proposed to include 13 for-sale two-story townhomes, which will range in size from 1,275 – 1,450 square feet.

A Conceptual Development Review was held on March 22, 2018 with the City’s Community Development, Public Works, and Public Utilities Departments, at which time the conceptual application was reviewed and the applicant was advised of all necessary entitlements. Subsequently, Citymark Development, LLC submitted applications to the Planning Division on September 27, 2017 for the following entitlements: 1) a Specific Plan Amendment (P17-0761) to amend the Downtown Specific Plan to permit multi-family residential development and mixed use development and to establish associated development standards within the Neighborhood Commercial District; 2) a Conditional Use Permit (P17-0762) to permit the construction of 13 multi-family dwelling units; 3) a Tentative Tract Map (P17-0763) for a one-lot subdivision for condominium purposes; and 4) a Certificate of Appropriateness for plot plan and building elevations for compatibility with the Seventh Street Historic District. The Specific Plan Amendment, Condition Use Permit, and Tentative Tract Map are scheduled for Public Hearing before the Planning Commission on June 28, 2018. City Council has final approval authority for these entitlements and the Certificate of Appropriateness.

- **History:**

The subject property has been vacant since 2006 and is located within the Seventh Street Historic District.

Seventh Street Historic District: Running the entire length of Riverside's original Mile Square townsite, this locally-designated district (also known as Landmark 40) includes both sides of Mission Inn Avenue and encompasses the Buena Vista Bridge on the west and the Union Pacific and Santa Fe depots on the east. The corridor includes many of the best recognized commercial, municipal, and faith-based buildings in downtown Riverside as well as a number of stately residences in the northwestern end in a dramatic and eclectic assemblage of architectural styles constructed from 1871 through the 1920s, including Pueblo, Mission Revival, Moorish, Churrigueresque, Renaissance Revival, Mediterranean, Classical Revival, Romanesque, and more. The proposed project is located on a non-contributing property in an area that is concentrated with other non-contributors. A smaller portion of the district was identified by AEGIS 1993 & again by MFA 2003 as eligible for the National Register. The project is outside the boundary of the NR-eligible portion, which runs from the Santa Fe railroad tracks at Commerce Street to the Fox Theater on Market Street, east of the project.

V. DETAILED PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The proposed project consists of 13 two-story, three bedroom townhomes located on a 0.64 acre site. Townhomes range in size from 1,396 square feet to 1,546 square feet, and will be arranged in two rows of four units, paired, and one row of five contiguous units. Each unit will include a two-car garage which will front onto a new internal drive lane or the existing alley, which runs along the northern edge of the property. This will allow pedestrian entry to the units to be located along Mission Inn Avenue, Chestnut Street, or a landscaped internal common space.

The units are designed in a contemporary style of architecture with similar design elements to Pueblo Revival Style of architecture. These features include flat roofs, stucco, and articulation of massing with varying height, recessed windows, walled courtyards, and architectural canopies. In addition to these features, the design also features select masses clad in composite board siding. All windows are either fixed or single-hung bronze-colored, vinyl-framed windows. Shed roof architectural canopies constructed of wood-framing and standing seam metal roofing are located over select second-floor windows and covered patios. The patio enclosures vary in height and material. They are constructed of either open metal railings, stone veneered half-walls, or walls clad in composite board siding. Garage doors, which have limited visibility from Chestnut Street, will be metal paneled roll-up doors with a single window located at a top corner.

VI. PROJECT ANALYSIS:

- **Compliance with section 20.25.050 of the City of Riverside Municipal Code:**

CHB staff has analyzed the proposed project in accordance with Title 20 of the Riverside Municipal Code and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards (SOIS) and finds the project to be consistent with both.

The Cultural Resources Report prepared by Brian F. Smith and Associates, Inc. includes a Historic Compatibility Assessment which discusses the project's compliance with Title 20 of the Riverside Municipal Code and the SOIS for Rehabilitation, as applied to in-fill within historic districts. The attached facts for findings summarizes the conclusions of the historical assessment and form the

basis for the recommendation of approval. This section briefly summarizes the key findings regarding compliance with Title 20.

The Compatibility Assessment by Brian F. Smith and Associates, Inc. states:

The proposed project would be considered a transitional development, as it is surrounded by multiple types of land-use with varying structures of historic age and architectural style. Further, the current project as designed serves as a barrier between the mixed use and style of the neighborhood, drawing inspiration from adjacent historic structures while differentiating itself to not create a false sense of history.

The proposed 4019 Mission Inn Avenue Project proposes 13 Contemporary-style two-story townhomes on a 0.6-acre lot. In keeping with the spirit of the City of Riverside Design Guidelines for Infill Construction and the SOI's Standards for Rehabilitation, the project is designed with the size, scale, proportion, color, and materials of the new buildings compatible with the existing neighborhood. The Contemporary design with the use of modern technology and materials is achieved in a manner sensitive to the surrounding historic structures.

- **General Plan/Specific Plan/Zoning Conformance:**

General Plan: The proposed project is consistent with the underlying General Plan 2025 land use designation of DSP, which will further the intent of the General Plan. Further, the proposal has been found to be consistent with General Plan Policies HP-1.0, which requires the use of historic preservation principles as an equal component in the planning and development process and HP-5.0, which ensures compatibility between new development and existing cultural resources. The distinct modern design of the project is both compatible with nearby non-contributors as well as maintains the eclectic character of the Seventh Street Historic District.

Specific Plan: The project site is located within the Downtown Specific Plan – Neighborhood Commercial District – Cultural Resources Overlay zone and will further the intent of the Specific Plan. Subject to future approval of the Specific Plan Amendment associated with the project, the proposed multi-family development will be consistent with applicable DSP development standards. Furthermore, the project will add vibrancy to the district while providing a sensitive transition between the commercial uses and the residential neighborhood to the north, as suggested in the Downtown Specific Plan.

Zoning: The underlying DSP-RC-CR – Downtown Specific Plan – Neighborhood Commercial District – Cultural Resources Overlay Zone is consistent with the DSP – Downtown Specific Plan General Plan land use designation.

- **Environmental Compliance:**

A Mitigated Negative Declaration was prepared for this project and determined the project would not directly, indirectly, or cumulatively impact a historical resource under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Further, the project has been designed consistent with applicable standards and guidelines addressing infill projects constructed within historic districts. Thus, while the project would be a new development, it would not adversely impact a historic resource or district.

VII. PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS:

Public Meeting Notice and Notice of Intent to Adopt a Mitigated Negative Declaration was published in the Press Enterprise and notices were mailed to property owners adjacent to the site on May 24, 2018, more than twenty (20) days prior to the scheduled meeting. As of the writing of this report, no comments have been received.

IX. EXHIBITS:

1. Staff Recommended Findings
2. Staff Recommended Conditions of Approval
3. Aerial Photo/Location
4. Project Plans
5. Site Photos
6. Cultural Resource Report and Historic Compatibility Assessment
7. CEQA Document (Draft Mitigated Negative Declaration)



EXHIBIT 1 – STAFF RECOMMENDED FINDINGS

CASE NUMBER: P17-0764

MEETING DATE: June 20, 2018

FACTS FOR FINDINGS: (From Section 20.25.050 of the Riverside Municipal Code)

The Board and Historic Preservation Officer shall make findings of the following standards when applicable to approving or denying a Certificate of Appropriateness.

FINDINGS: The application proposal is consistent or compatible with the architectural period and the character-defining elements of the historic building.

FACTS: This finding is not applicable as the site contains no historic buildings. The project site is currently vacant.

FINDING: The application proposal is compatible with existing adjacent or nearby Cultural Resources and their character-defining elements.

FACTS: The Seventh Street Historic District and various individually significant historic buildings, most noticeably the Fox Theater as referenced by the Downtown Specific Plan, are the relevant cultural resources. As the historic district is an eclectic collection of property types and architectural styles, no single individual resource or architectural style can provide inspiration for compatible design. However, the proposed project makes use of character defining feature of Pueblo Revival Style architecture, which is found in the historic district at the Santa Fe Depot. These features include flat roofs, articulation of massing with varying height, recessed windows, walled courtyards, architectural canopies, and stucco cladding. Additionally, as stated in the Compatibility Assessment, “The design of the development draws inspiration from the historic development of the area, with a central walkway from Mission Inn Avenue into the interior of the development, leading to separate, smaller single-family dwellings, reminiscent of a bungalow court. However, the muted contemporary design of the structures differentiates the development from neighboring historic structures, and, therefore, will not create a false sense of historical development.”

FINDING: The colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details, height, scale, massing and methods of construction proposed are consistent with the period and/or compatible with adjacent Cultural Resources.

FACTS: The Compatibility Assessment asserts that the materials of the new construction are similar to that of the adjacent Cultural Resources. It states, “...there are a variety of differing materials incorporated within neighboring historic structures. Major materials used for the proposed project include stucco, composite board siding, and stone veneer. The stucco is not only appropriate to the Pueblo Revival style, it is also reminiscent of the exterior covering found on the surrounding Spanish and Mission Revival-style buildings, as well as the neighboring Mid-Century modern

buildings. Composite siding, although of a different material, references both the use of wood beams and rafters in the Pueblo Revival style and the wood siding-clad single-family residences located in the general area of the property, while the stone-veneered masonry ledge draws inspiration from short retaining walls found throughout the neighborhood that separate the sidewalk from raised front yards. With regard to fenestration, the Compatibility Assessment states “Because of the mixed nature of the neighborhood, there are varying degrees of solid-to-void ratios found on neighboring historic structures. Nevertheless, the proposed development does not deviate from the general ratio exhibited on the neighboring Mission Revival-style bungalow court. Further, the project does not propose any large expanses of glass.”

FINDING: The proposed change does not adversely affect the context considering the following factors: grading; site development; orientation of buildings; off-street parking; landscaping; signs; street furniture; public areas; relationship of the project to its surroundings.

FACTS: As stated in the compatibility assessment, “The new construction is oriented on the block with acceptable setbacks as to not deter from existing surrounding historic structures, such as the neighboring bungalow court. This setback allows the proposed development to act as a transitional development leading into the historic residential core to the west.” Furthermore, “The rectangular massing of the project harmonizes with the surrounding environment and historic structures. The central pedestrian entrances and orientation of the townhomes draw inspiration from the common design features of the adjacent bungalow court, while the elevation of the townhomes draws inspiration from the mixed use of the two story multi-family dwellings and commercial structures located on the block.” Additionally, the orientation of the units will provide a residential presence along Mission Inn Avenue and Chestnut Street

FINDING: The proposed change does not adversely affect an important architectural, historical, cultural or archaeological feature or features.

FACTS: The existing project site is a vacant and therefore a non-contributor to the Seventh Street Historic District, and architectural, historical, or cultural feature or features of the district are safeguarded from adverse effects by demonstrated consistency with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards relative to in-fill properties and the DSP Raincross District standards and guidelines. The Cultural Resources Report states, “Given that no archaeological sites, features, or artifacts have been identified within the project, no potential impacts to known buried cultural resources are associated with the proposed development of the project.”

FINDING: The application proposal is consistent with the Citywide Residential Historic District Design Guidelines and the separate guidelines for each Historic District.

FACTS: Citywide Residential Historic District Design Guidelines do not specifically apply to this project, though it is in-line with the spirit of the guidelines. Architectural design guidelines in the Downtown Specific Plan for new construction in the Raincross District recommend maintaining the district’s character and unique sense of identity. The proposed building’s new exterior elevations cannot be “historic,” but

are stylistically compatible with the historic district through similar massing, fenestration, materials, and architectural features to adjacent historic buildings.

FINDING: The application proposal is consistent with the Principles of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

FACTS: With regard to new in-fill construction in a historic district, the project meets guidelines for massing, height, color, and setbacks. As the project site is currently vacant, Standards 9 and 10 of the SOIS for Rehabilitation, as applied to in-fill within a historic district, are the main focus of SOIS compliance. With regard to Standard 9, the Compatibility Assessment states, "The new construction is oriented on the block with acceptable setbacks to differentiate it from the surrounding historic properties, such as the neighboring bungalow court. The size and scale of the proposed project is compatible with neighboring structures, and the placement of the townhomes draws inspiration from the neighboring bungalow court. The rectangular footprint and rectangular horizontal massing are also compatible with the general design of neighboring Spanish and Mission Revival and Mid-Century modern buildings. Therefore, the infill project will not destroy the historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property and the surrounding area." For Standard 10, the assessment states, "The proposed project will be located on a currently vacant lot. Therefore, the development could always be removed in the future without degrading the potential historic integrity of the property or its environment." Because of these, the proposed project is considered in compliances with the SOIS.



EXHIBIT 2 – STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

CASE NUMBER: P17-0764

MEETING DATE: June 20, 2018

General Conditions

1. The project must be complete per the Cultural Heritage Board's approval, including all conditions listed below. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Board or the Cultural Heritage Board staff. Upon completion of the project, a Cultural Heritage Board staff inspection must be requested to ensure that the approved plans have been executed and that all conditions have been implemented.
2. Actions by the Cultural Heritage Board, including any environmental finding may be appealed. There is a ten day appeal period that will lapse at 5:00 p.m. on July 2, 2018, which is twelve days following action on the case. Appeals of the Board's action will not be accepted after this time. The appeal fee is \$2,529.00. Appeal processing information may be obtained from the Community & Economic Development Department, Planning Division, Public Information Section, 3rd Floor, City Hall, 3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522.
3. If a building permit is not issued, this approval will expire in two years on June 20, 2020.
4. This approval is for design concept only and does not indicate the project has been thoroughly checked for compliance with all requirements of law. As such, it is not a substitute for the formal building permit plan check process, and other changes may be required during the plan check process.
5. The granting of this request shall in no way exclude or excuse compliance with all other applicable rules and regulations in effect at the time this permit is exercised.

Specific Conditions of Approval

6. All applicable conditions of related Planning Cases P17-0761 (Specific Plan Amendment), P17-0762 (Conditional Use Permit), and P17-0763 (Tentative Tract Map) shall apply. Action by the Planning Commission, or City Council, of the related planning cases may result in modifications to the project and may require submittal and review of a revised Certificate of Appropriateness application.
7. The intent of this approval is for the project's colors to appear as indicated on the colored elevations. All approved colors and materials shall be reflected on the construction plans submitted for plan check. Should modification of color scheme occur, revised color elevations and material board shall be submitted to CHB staff for approval.

8. During grading, excavations and/or construction, if buried archaeological resources are uncovered, all work must be halted in the vicinity of the discovery until a registered professional archaeologist/architectural historian (as applicable) can be retained by the applicant to visit the site of discovery and assess the significance and origin of the archaeological resource. If the resource is determined to be of Native American origin, the applicable Tribe(s) shall be consulted. If the archaeological resource is determined to be a potentially significant cultural resource, the City, in consultation with the project archaeologist - and the Tribe(s) if applicable - shall determine the course of action which may include data recovery, retention in situ, or other appropriate treatment and mitigation depending on the resources discovered. Procedures shall follow all applicable federal, state and local laws and regulations.

APPEAL INFORMATION:

The staff's decision or any condition of approval can be appealed by the applicant or any interested person. To appeal this decision, submit a letter stating what you wish to appeal and why, the General Application form and the corresponding appeal fee. The Community & Economic Development Department offers a packet on filing an appeal that you might find helpful. Appeals may be delivered in person or mailed, but they must be received by July 2, 2018 at 5:00 p.m. twelve days following action on this case. The Community & Economic Development Department's address is:

City of Riverside
Community & Economic Development Department
Planning Division
3900 Main Street, 3rd Floor
Riverside, CA 92522

Appeals will be considered by the Land Use Committee of the City Council at their next available meeting.

G:\CHB\2018 CHB\06-20-18\P17-0764 - Mission Inn Townhomes