



City of Arts & Innovation

**COMMUNITY & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
DEPARTMENT
Planning Division**

**CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD
LANDMARK DESIGNATION STAFF REPORT**

AGENDA ITEM NO.: 3

WARD: 3

CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD HEARING DATE: NOVEMBER 18, 2015

I. CASE NUMBER: P15-0818

II. PROJECT SUMMARY:

- 1) **Proposal:** Historic Designation request to designate the Willard and Elizabeth Winder House as a City Landmark
- 2) **Location:** 5022 Myrtle Avenue
- 3) **Applicant:** Nicolette Rohr, for Kevin Esterling and Emily Garabedian
- 4) **Case Planner:** Gaby Adame, Assistant Planner
(951) 826-5933
gadame@riversideca.gov

III. RECOMMENDATION:

That the Cultural Heritage Board Recommend that the City Council:

1. **DETERMINE** that P15-0818, City Landmark Designation, is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per Sections 15061(b)(3) and 15308 of the CEQA Guidelines as it can be seen with certainty that there is no possibility that the activity will have a significant effect on the environment, said action is intended to preserve the historic character of the building and site, and to provide notice of the historic status; and,
2. **APPROVE** Planning Case P15-0818 based on the facts for findings outlined below and thereby the designation of the Willard and Elizabeth Winder House as a City Landmark.

FACTS FOR FINDINGS: (From Sections 20.20.030 and 20.50.010(U) of the Riverside Municipal Code)

FINDINGS: Criterion 1: Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history.

FACTS: The Winder House meets Criterion 1 because the Winder Family were significantly involved within Riverside society that included many organizations beneficial to the Riverside community such as the Community Settlement Association.

FINDINGS: Criterion 3: Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;

FACTS: The Winder House meets Criterion 3 because the home is an excellent representative of mid-century modern homes that has maintained much of its integrity due to very little changes.

FINDINGS: Criterion 6: Reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of settlement and growth, particular transportation modes, or distinctive examples of park or community planning, or cultural landscape.

FACTS: The Winder House meets Criterion 6 because its location in the Victoria Hill and Country Club Park neighborhoods, area important to the city's early expansion.

IV. BACKGROUND/HISTORY:

Willard and Elizabeth Winder purchased the property at 5022 Myrtle in 1954 and hired architect Walter C. See and builder Harry Marsh to design and build the custom home for their family. They moved into the house upon its completion in 1955. The design and customization of the home are significant, as are the Winders to the history of Riverside.

Willard Winder, born on April 8, 1915, was a Riverside attorney and son of a prominent Riverside family. His father, A. Herber Winder, also an attorney, was part of the firm Adair & Winder representing Jukichi Harada in the wining landmark Harada case, which tested the legality of the Alien Land Law. Growing up in Riverside, Willard Winder was a boy scout, athlete, and wrote occasional columns on events at Poly High School for the *Riverside Daily Press*.

He graduated from high school in Riverside and went on to Stanford University. He graduated in 1938 and began law school at Hastings School of Law in San Francisco. He completed law school in 1941 and returned to Riverside to practice. In 1943 he was commissioned into the U.S. Navy and served in active duty as an electronic engineer and Radio Material Officer station in New York and Miami from 1943 to 1946, at which time he became a Reserve Officer. After the war, he resumed his law practice in Riverside, where he focused primarily on corporate law. In the Riverside community Winder was involved with the Red Cross, Community Chest, the Masons, Sons of the American Revolution, Soroptimist Club, American Legion, and Republican Party. He also served on the board of directors and as President of the Board for Riverside Community Settlement Association, which sought to provide assistance in the Eastside community, adjacent to Victoria Hill. The Community Settlement Association has a rich history in Riverside, that continues to this day.

Elizabeth Winder was born in Nevada City, California in 1905. She hailed from a Cornish immigrant family and grew up steeped in Cornish cultural traditions, a background that may

have influenced the English Cottage elements of her home. Her father was president of the Nevada City branch of Bank of America. Beth attended the University of California, Berkeley as an English major. While there, she met Willard Winder, who was studying at Stanford. The two married in 1940 and lived first in San Francisco while Willard attended Hasting then returned to Riverside, where their daughter, Judith, was born in 1942. During World War II, Beth lived briefly in Nevada City, San Diego, and Brooklyn while Willard served in the Navy. The Winders returned to Riverside at the end of the war, where their second child, son Bill, was born. Beth was an active member and officer in the Junior League in Riverside. Beth expressed longstanding interests in interior design, antiques, and architecture. These interests and talents came to fruition in 1954, when she began working close with an architect for her family's new home on Victoria Hill.

V. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION:

The 1954 Winder House is an example of a California ranch house with romantic element, including English cottage, modified Tudor, and Swiss chalet influences. The single-family residence, located in Riverside's Victoria Hill neighborhood, sits on a structural concrete stem wall foundation and is of a balloon frame construction with a below grade basement. The front elevation is anonymous to the street, characteristic of the California Ranch style emphasizing outdoor living space in the rear. The street view of the house is partially obscured by hedges and the driveway if framed by a rock retaining wall and driveway curb. The structure's asymmetrical ground plan reflects the long, horizontal orientation and rambling style characteristic of California Ranch homes.

The front elevation features the most ornamentation, including four irregular bays and six windows visible from the front. The central bay, which contains the primary public interior spaces, stands out and above the bay on each side, all with steeply pitched side gable roofs. The attached garage creates a fourth bay. The central bay features a deeply recessed entrance supported by a simple wooden corner post, which frames the diamond pattern wood door, original to the house. The ceiling of the entrance enclosure is board and batten. The cladding of the central bay is of recycled brick punctuated by one square wood double hung oriel bay window with brackets including eight over eight under square panes. A second, double hung window is located on the south elevation of the central bay. The cladding of the south side gable of the central bay from the lower edge of the roofline to the apex of the gable is clapboard with a small louvered attic vent under the peak of the gable. The north elevation of the central bay mirrors the south above the lower edge of the roofline.

The south bay, containing the interior bedrooms and baths, features an asymmetrical modified oriel bay with brackets and one pair of wood casement windows frame and sill with diamond pane lights. The bay is offset by horizontal clapboard cladding and punctuated by the roofline extending over the south edge of the oriel bay with a shed dormer over the casement window. The cladding left of the oriel bay is vertical board and batten, pierced by a similar pair of casement windows. The northerly front facing bay, containing the interior kitchen and dining room, is clad with vertical board and batten, features a large window assembly, composed of a central fixed twelve fixed pane picture window, flanked by two three-pane casement windows. The current owner has added wooden shutter on either side of the picture window. The north bay also features an English cottage style ornamental faux chimney, clad in stucco with two ceramic chimney pots.

The attached garage, the fourth bay, exhibits Swiss Chalet style elements, with steeply pitched, front facing, double step-back gable with dovecote motif and modified brackets. The garage is clad in vertical board and batten. A four-sided tower with weathervane and dovecote motif projects above the roofline to the rear of the garage. The original redwood garage door was replaced by the previous owner due to disrepair. The garage is attached to the residence by a transition storage space clad in vertical board and batten. There is one visible window into the garage. There are visible rafter tails under the upper section of the step back gable on the garage as well as under the roofline on the front and back elevation.

The rear of the property exhibits the house's orientation to the back and the focus on outdoor living spaces typical of California Ranch style homes. The rear elevation consists of two bays: the long horizontal left, or southerly bay, containing the primary living quarters; and the right, or northerly bay, holding guest quarters and the garage. The back yard features a concrete patio with three wood posts supporting an extended shed roof reaching several feet over the patio. The patio and the extended roof run continuously from the garage southerly to approximately four-fifths of the length of the residential structure. The external patio support beams utilize a modified scarf joint, demonstrating the craftsmanship of the homes builder, Harry Marsh. The primary residential bay is pierced by the large centrally located large sliding glass door which opens onto the concrete patio connecting the indoor and outdoor spaces—another characteristic of California Ranch style. The south end of the primary residential bay contains the master bedroom, which is pierced by a window assembly composed of large fixed center pane, flanked by two narrow casement windows over a sill. Adjacent to the window and under the shed roof is four-panel wood door screen, opening onto the patio from the master bedroom.

Since 1954, the property has had three owners who have made few alterations to the original home. In addition to the installation of wood shutters, shake shingle replacement, rain gutters, and two skylights in 1970s.

VI. STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE:

The site is eligible for local listing as a Landmark because it is an exceptional example of mid-century architectural design with custom elements, the place of the Winder family in Riverside history, and its location in the Victoria Hill and Country Club Park neighborhoods, area important to the city's early expansion. This property appears to be eligible for landmark designation under the City of Riverside's criteria set in Title 20 of the Riverside Municipal Code as a structure that:

- Criterion 1: Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;
- Criterion 3: Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;
- Criterion 6: Reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of settlement and growth, particular transportation modes, or distinctive examples of park or community planning, or cultural landscape.

The exterior of the home and garage, terraced landscaping of the backyard, and stone walls lining the driveway all contribute to the significance of the property. Because of its limited turnover in the sixty years since construction and the care that each of the three owners has afforded the house all of these elements remain largely intact and support the integrity of the home.

VII. PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS:

Public notices were published in one newspaper of general circulation within the City, and mailed to property owners and occupants within 300 feet of the site, at least ten (10) days prior to the scheduled hearing. No responses were received to date.

VIII. EXHIBITS:

1. Location Map
2. Zoning Map
3. Designation Application with Photographs
4. Cultural Resources DPR Evaluation Form