



PLANNING COMMISSION HEARING DATE: MAY 21, 2015

AGENDA ITEM NO.: #3

PROPOSED PROJECT

Case Numbers	P13-0852 (Environmental Impact Report)	
Request	Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for the demolition of the Riverside Free Methodist Church, which is an Eligible Cultural Resource, on the California Baptist University campus	
Applicant	Steve Smith, California Baptist University (CBU)	
Project Location	8431 Diana Avenue in the southeast portion of the CBU Riverside campus, approximately 107 feet north of State Route 91.	<p style="text-align: center;">Site Location Map</p>
APN	231-070-007	
Project area	Approximately 3.14-acres	
Ward	5	
Neighborhood	Ramona	
Specific Plan	California Baptist University Specific Plan	
General Plan Designation	California Baptist University Specific Plan (CBUSP)	
Zoning Designation	CBUSP – Mixed Use	
Staff Planner	Teri Delcamp, <i>Historic Preservation Senior Planner</i> ; 951-826-2117; tdelcamp@riversideca.gov	

RECOMMENDATIONS

Pursuant to the City's adopted City's California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) guidelines, Resolution No. 21106, the Planning Commission shall review the proposed Draft EIR (DEIR) and make recommendations to the City Council regarding whether the DEIR has been completed in compliance with CEQA; whether the project will have a significant effect on the environment; and if so, whether any project changes or alterations will avoid or substantially lessen the significant environmental effects as identified in the DEIR. Specifically, staff recommends that the City Planning Commission:

1. **RECOMMEND that the City Council APPROVE** Planning Case P13-0852, based on the information outlined in the staff report and summarized in the attached findings, and certify a Final Project EIR in compliance with CEQA.

SITE BACKGROUND

The project site is located within the boundary of the California Baptist University Specific Plan (CBUSP) and was purchased by California Baptist University (CBU) after adoption of the CBUSP by the City Council. The site is developed with a 3,942 square foot church and associated 2,340 square foot fellowship hall (both built 1963-1964), an education building built in 1979, and associated parking and site landscaping. The church was previously home to the Riverside Free Methodist Church (RFMC) congregation. The applicant proposes to demolish all buildings and clear the site for future development that would be allowed under the CBUSP. The church was evaluated for historical significance during the preparation of the CBUSP and was found to be eligible as a Cultural Resource per Title 20 of the Municipal Code, and thus is a historic resource under CEQA. As the proposed demolition project would result in potentially significant impacts to the environment, including Cultural Resources, an EIR was required for this project pursuant to CEQA.

Pursuant to CEQA, a 45-day review and comment period has been provided to receive public comments on the DEIR. This period started on March 27, 2015 and ended on May 11, 2015. All comments generated during the public comment period will receive written responses. Written responses to comments will be incorporated into a Final Project EIR (FEIR), which will be considered for certification by the City Council at a future, separately noticed public hearing. Also, the recommendations of the Planning Commission, as well as the Cultural Heritage Board relative to the Certificate of Appropriateness and DEIR at their meeting on May 20, 2015, will be forwarded to the City Council for consideration at the future, separately noticed public hearing. Staff will verbally update the City Planning Commission on the recommendations of the May 20 CHB meeting.

PROPOSAL

The proposed demolition project will consist of site grubbing and clearing; building demolition, salvage, and removal; removal of an on-site septic system; and rough grading. Project activities will take approximately 28 work days occurring over a period of two to three months. The proposed project is anticipated to occur in the latter half of 2015. The church facility has been served by an on-site septic system. This system will be removed under the proposed project and will not be replaced at this time. Future development in accordance with the CBUSP will need to be connected to the City's sewer system.

The demolition activities associated with the project are:

- Tree and landscape removal;
- Existing structure hazardous materials abatement;
- Removal of the on-site septic system;
- Existing structure demolition; and
- Hardscape and foundations demolition.

Tree and landscape removal and existing structure hazardous materials abatement will occur concurrently, the former lasting three days and the latter 10 days. Next, existing structure demolition will occur over approximately five days. Demolition of hardscape and foundations will follow, taking approximately 10 days.

PROJECT ANALYSIS

<i>CEQA Compliance Summary</i>			
	N/A	Yes	No
Compliance with CEQA			
Has the Draft EIR been completed in compliance with CEQA?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Significant Effect on the Environment			
Will the project have a significant effect on the environment?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Changes or Alterations to Avoid or Lessen Effects			
Will any changes or alterations proposed for the project, together with any changes or alterations that come forth as a part of the public hearing on the Draft EIR, avoid or substantially lessen the significant effects as identified in the Draft EIR?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

As noted above, because the project will have a significant effect on the environment that cannot be avoided or lessened to a level below significance, a Statement of Overriding Considerations will be prepared for City Council consideration in conjunction with the FEIR.

The following section summarizes the project objectives, project alternatives analyzed in the DEIR, proposed mitigation measures, and potentially significant effects.

PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The applicant is proposing to demolish the RFMC to fulfill the following objectives:

- Prepare a site in order to maximize future use by CBU, in accordance with the approved CBUSP.
- Accommodate future growth of the CBU campus.
- Remove an on-site septic system to enhance the use of the property and to facilitate a future sewer connection.

PROJECT ALTERNATIVES

The project alternatives that were developed and analyzed in the DEIR (see Section ES.6.1 of the DEIR Executive Summary and Chapter 7 of the DEIR for the analysis) are summarized below:

<i>Project Alternatives</i>				
	Environmentally Superior? ¹		Feasible?	
	Yes	No	Yes	No
<i>No Project Alternative – Continued RFMC or Other Church Use</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
<i>Alternative 1 – Adaptive Reuse</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
<i>Alternative 2 – Relocation</i>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

Because none of the project alternatives met all of the identified project goals, all of the project alternatives were rejected as infeasible in favor of the proposed project.

1. Section 15126.6(e)(2) of the CEQA Guidelines states that if the environmentally superior alternative is the No Project Alternative, the EIR shall also identify an environmentally superior alternative among the other alternatives.

MITIGATION MEASURES

The Initial Study prepared and circulated for public review on the proposed project concluded that the proposed project would not result in significant impacts to aesthetics, agriculture and forestry resources, geology and soils, hydrology and water quality, land use and planning, mineral resources, population and housing, public services, recreation, and utilities and service systems; therefore, these topics are not addressed in the DEIR.

The following table lists the applicable mitigation measures related to identified significant impacts, as well as the level of significance after mitigation is implemented. In all cases except for impacts on Cultural Resources, mitigation measures reduce potential impacts to a less than significant level.

Category and Mitigation Measures		Level of Impact After Mitigation	
		Less Than Significant	Significant
<i>Biology – Impacts to sensitive or special-status species</i>	MM BIO-1: Avoid nesting bird season or conduct survey of nesting birds	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<i>Cultural Resources – Adverse change in significance of historic resource</i>	MM CUL-1: HABS photo documentation	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
	MM CUL-2: Digitize/publish Church history book		
	MM CUL-3: Church history interpretive plaque		
	MM CUL-4: Salvage and offer materials from sanctuary		
	MM CUL-5: Relocate three trees to CBU campus		
<i>Cultural Resources – Adverse change in significance of archaeological resource</i>	MM CUL-6: Archaeologist to assess any unanticipated cultural material during project	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<i>Greenhouse Gases and Climate Change</i>	MM GHG-1: Greenhouse gas reduction BMPs	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Category and Mitigation Measures		Level of Impact After Mitigation	
		Less Than Significant	Significant
<i>Hazards – Expose public or environment to hazardous materials</i>	MM HAZ-1: Lead-based paint and asbestos survey; remediation if indicated	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<i>Noise – In excess of established standards</i>	MM NOISE-1: Fit construction equipment with mufflers	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	MM NOISE-2: Locate staging away from campus apartments		
	MM NOISE-3: Haul truck during construction hours only		
<i>Noise – In excess of established standards continued</i>	MM NOISE-4: Notify campus residents 24 hours before major noise commences	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<i>Noise – Temporary or periodic increase in ambient</i>	SEE MM NOISE-1 THROUGH MM NOISE-4 ABOVE	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

SIGNIFICANT EFFECTS

Cultural Resources

The RFMC is eligible for designation as a City of Riverside Structure of Merit. Based on this status, the City of Riverside has determined that RFMC qualifies as a historic resource under CEQA. The contributors to the historic resource include the RFMC Sanctuary and Fellowship Hall. The proposed project involves on-site building demolition and vegetation removal. Under CEQA, the demolition of a historic resource cannot be mitigated to a level of less than significant. Although mitigation measures have been imposed, none can reduce these impacts to less than significant levels. Thus, potential impacts on Cultural Resources will result in a Significant Unavoidable Environmental Effect.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Public hearing notices were published in the newspaper and mailed to property owners within 300 feet of the site. As of the writing of this report, no responses have been received by staff.

APPEAL INFORMATION

Actions by the City Planning Commission, including any environmental finding, may be appealed to the City Council within ten calendar days after the decision. Appeal filing and processing information may be obtained from the Planning Department Public Information Section, 3rd Floor, City Hall, 3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522.

EXHIBITS LIST

1. Staff Recommended Findings
2. Staff Recommended Conditions of Approval
3. Aerial Photo/Location
4. General Plan Map
5. Zoning Map
6. Draft Project Environmental Impact Report (previously provided to Planning Commission)
7. Draft EIR Appendices A and B
8. Draft EIR Appendix C
9. Draft EIR Appendices E through G
10. Draft EIR Appendix D, "California Baptist University Free Methodist Church Property, Cultural Resources Impacts Report, 8431 Diana Avenue, Riverside, CA APN: 231-070-007," prepared by Wilkman Historical Services March 26, 2015

Report and Recommendations Prepared by:
Report and Recommendations Reviewed by:
Report and Recommendations Approved by:

Teri Delcamp, Historic Preservation Sr Planner
Gabriel Perez, Principal Planner
Emilio Ramirez, Interim Community &
Economic Development Director



City of Arts & Innovation

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

Planning Division

EXHIBIT 1- STAFF RECOMMENDED FINDINGS

PLANNING CASE: P13-0852 (Environmental Impact Report)

Environmental Impact Report Findings pursuant to City CEQA Resolution No. 21106 m

The Planning Commission recommends that the City Council find that:

- a. The Draft EIR has been completed in compliance with CEQA because the City has reviewed the project description and fully understands the project and project alternatives proposed for development. Further, all potential adverse environmental impacts and all feasible mitigation measures to reduce the impacts from the project have been identified in the EIR. A reasonable range of alternatives was considered in the EIR. The preparation of the EIR followed all applicable regulations regarding analysis, noticing and public review periods.
- b. The project will have a significant effect on the environment because the Riverside Free Methodist Church qualifies as a historic resource under CEQA and will be demolished. Under CEQA, the demolition of a historic resource cannot be mitigated to a level of less than significant. Although mitigation measures have been imposed, none can reduce these impacts to less than significant levels. Thus, potential impacts on Cultural Resources will result in a Significant Unavoidable Environmental Effect.
- c. There are no changes or alterations proposed for the project, together with any changes or alterations that came forth as part of the public hearing on the Draft EIR, that will avoid or substantially lessen the significant environmental effects as identified in the Draft EIR because a reasonable range of project alternatives was considered but were rejected as infeasible, and the mitigation measures will not substantially lessen significant effects to a less than significant level.



City of Arts & Innovation

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT Planning Division

EXHIBIT 2 - STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

PLANNING CASES: P13-0852 (Environmental Impact Report)

Case Specific

- **Planning**

1. A demolition permit shall be secured from the City prior to removal of the Riverside Free Methodist Church and associated buildings and site improvements.
2. The Mitigation Measures contained within the Project EIR shall be implemented, as follows:
 - a. Sensitive Biological Species – Initial ground-disturbing activities (e.g., demolition, grading) should be conducted outside the bird nesting season (February 15 through August 31). If project activities are planned during the bird nesting season, nesting bird surveys should be conducted within 30 days prior to disturbance to ensure birds protected under the MBTA are not disturbed by demolition-related activities such as noise and increased human presence.

The survey shall consist of full coverage of the on-site trees. If no active nests are found, no additional measures are required. If active nests are found, the nest locations shall be mapped by the biologist utilizing GPS equipment. The nesting bird species will be documented and, to the degree feasible, the nesting stage (e.g., incubation of eggs, feeding of young, near fledging). The biologist shall establish a no-disturbance buffer around each active nest. The buffer will be determined by the biologist based on the species present and surrounding habitat. No construction or ground disturbance activities shall be conducted within the buffer until the biologist has determined the nest is no longer active and has informed the construction supervisor that activities may resume.

- b. HABS - Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit, California Baptist University (CBU) shall produce evidence it has hired a qualified professional and funded the preparation of a HABS Level II (35 mm photography) documentation of the property. The report shall be submitted to the City of Riverside Historic Preservation staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a demolition permit.
- c. Church History Book - Prior to issuance of a demolition permit, and in cooperation with the RFMC, CBU shall produce evidence it has hired a qualified graphic arts professional and funded the preparation of a digital version of the church history book titled "The Riverside Free Methodist Church Record." CBU shall secure RFMC's approval of the final design of the document. CBU shall also provide the church with a copy of the digital file and 125 bound copies of the document prior to the issuance of a building permit for the future use of the property.

- d. Interpretation – Prior to issuance of a demolition permit, CBU shall produce evidence it has hired a qualified professional to design an interpretive plaque, describing and illustrating the history of RFMC. The design and text of the plaque shall be subject to the approval of the Riverside Historic Preservation staff and RFMC. The design, fabrication, and installation shall be paid for by CBU, and shall be coordinated with the design and completion of the future use of the site. The interpretive plaque shall be on or in the immediate vicinity of the RFMC site.
- e. Salvage – Prior to issuance of a demolition permit, CBU shall provide for architectural salvage from the Sanctuary, with the first priority given to RFMC. Once RFMC has identified what it wants to salvage, CBU shall give a nonprofit historic preservation advocacy group an opportunity to identify what it wants to salvage. All salvage operations shall be completed within 45 days of notice to RFMC and the historic preservation advocacy group identified CBU.
- f. Tree Relocations - CBU shall annotate on the demolition plans for the RFMC property, the relocation of the two *Phoenix canariensis* and one of the *Washingtonia robusta* palm trees from the church property to fill in gaps among the trees on Palm Drive as specified in Figure 31 of the WHS cultural resources report.
- g. Archaeology - Should archaeological resources be unearthed during project activities, all work must be halted and redirected until a qualified archaeologist can examine the site and determine an appropriate course of action.
- h. Greenhouse Gas Reduction – To ensure reductions below the expected “Business As Usual” (BAU) scenario, the project will implement a variety of measures that will reduce its greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions. To the extent feasible, and to the satisfaction of the City of Riverside (City), the following measure will be incorporated into the project construction:
 - 1) Divert at least 50 percent of the demolished and/or grubbed construction materials (including, but not limited to, soil, vegetation, concrete, lumber, metal, and cardboard).
- i. Hazardous Materials - Prior to demolition activities of the proposed project, a lead-based paint and asbestos survey shall be conducted. Should lead-based paint or asbestos-containing materials be identified during survey, abatement of these materials will be accomplished in accordance with local, State, and Federal guidelines.
- j. To reduce noise impacts, the following mitigation measures shall be implemented:
 - 1) During all project site excavation and grading on site, demolition contractors shall equip all equipment, fixed or mobile, with properly operating and maintained mufflers, consistent with manufacturers' standards. All stationary equipment shall be placed so that emitted noise is directed away from the campus apartments nearest the project site.
 - 2) Equipment staging areas shall be located as far as feasible from the on-campus apartments.
 - 3) Haul truck deliveries shall be limited to the demolition hours. Haul routes shall not pass sensitive land uses to the extent feasible.

- 4) On-campus residents shall be notified, via postings on the project site, 24 hours before major demolition-related noise impacts commence.