



City of Arts & Innovation

Economic Development, Placemaking and Branding/Marketing Committee

TO: ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, PLACEMAKING AND BRANDING/MARKETING COMMITTEE **DATE: APRIL 21, 2022**

FROM: COMMUNITY & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT **WARD: 1**

SUBJECT: PROFESSIONAL CONSULTANT SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH KTUA OF SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA TO LEAD AN INCLUSIVE MULTI-DAY DESIGN CHARETTE AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM FOR THE CITY-OWNED FAIRMOUNT GOLF COURSE, IDENTIFIED AS ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBERS 207-060-005, 207-070-006, 207-070-007 AND 207-090-011, UNDER REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS NO. 2119 – SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATION IN THE AMOUNT OF \$185,378

ISSUE:

Review and consideration of a Professional Consultant Services Agreement with KTUA, of San Diego, under Request for Proposals (“RFP”) No. 2119 to lead an inclusive multi-day design charette and community engagement program for the City-owned Fairmount Golf Course, identified as Assessor Parcel Numbers 207-060-005, 207-070-006, 207-070-007 and 207-090-011, to determine whether there is a community vision for the Fairmount Golf Course that would be desirable as an alternative to its current use as a City-operated public golf course. The proposed contract amount of \$185,378.00 will require a supplemental appropriation.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

That the Economic Development, Placemaking and Branding/Marketing Committee:

1. Review and consider a proposal from KTUA to lead an inclusive multi-day design charette and community engagement program for the City-owned Fairmount Golf Course property; and
2. Direct staff to negotiate a Professional Consultant Services Agreement with KTUA in the amount of \$185,378 to conduct an inclusive multi-day design charette and community engagement program to determine whether there is a community vision for the Fairmount Golf Course that would be desirable as an alternative to its current use as a City operated public golf course to be presented to the City Council for final consideration and approval.

BACKGROUND:

On July 8, 2020, the Fairmount Golf Course (Property) was included on a list with other City-owned properties that was presented to the Financial Performance and Budget Committee to be considered for surplus declaration as a possible way to generate revenue to the General Fund. The Financial Performance and Budget Committee directed staff to present the list of properties to the Budget Engagement Commission (BEC) for their recommendation and then return to the Financial Performance and Budget Committee for further consideration.

On September 10, 2020, the Budget Engagement Commission (BEC) recommended that staff perform an extensive community engagement process regarding the future use of the Fairmount Golf Course Property and present the results to the BEC which would then formulate a recommendation to City Council on whether the property should be retained, leased, or sold.

On October 14, 2020, and on February 12, 2021, staff presented the original list of properties and a revised short list of properties, respectively, to the Financial Performance and Budget Committee which did not recommend including the Property on a final list to be presented to City Council for consideration to be declared as surplus property.

On May 25, 2021, City Council concurred with the BEC recommendation, directing staff to complete the community engagement process for the future use of the Fairmount Golf Course and then return to the BEC in the next 18-24 months with the results for the BEC to formulate a recommendation to City Council on whether the property should be retained, leased, or sold.

DISCUSSION:

The Property is approximately 55 acres, identified as Assessor Parcel Numbers 207-060-005, 207-070-006, 207-070-007 and 207-090-011, and is generally located on the southwest corner of Market Street and the 60 Freeway and southeast of the 60 Freeway and the Santa Ana River as shown on the site map below depicted in red. The Property is currently used as a City-operated public golf course and is situated next to the historic Fairmount Park, which has been a part of the Riverside community since the founding of the City in 1870.

The Riverside Cultural Heritage Board designated Landmark No. 69, Fairmount Park, which included the Property. Later evaluations found the Property does not contribute to the historical significance of Fairmount Park. If the charette process results in a vision other than the golf course, and this vision is approved by City Council, the Landmark Designation would need to be modified to remove the Fairmount Golf Course Property. The City Attorney's Office determined that the Property is not subject to the California Public Park Preservation Act of 1971, which generally requires the acquisition of substitute park land and facilities of equal size when one acre or more of public park property is sold.

In accordance with the direction of the BEC and City Council, staff released RFP No. 2119 seeking a consultant to lead an inclusive multi-day design charette and community engagement program for the Property.



The multi-day design charette intends to invite community stakeholders to identify, over a series of community meetings, one or more possible redevelopment visions, ideally with a preferred development(s) layout, and to plan for and design the public space (including public improvements/amenities) surrounding the Property. For clarification purposes, City staff is not advancing a pre-conceived plan for the redevelopment of the Property, except that any proposal must include a plan and design of the public space, including public improvements/amenities, surrounding the Property throughout the remainder of Fairmount Park. The consultant's scope of services will include project scoping, charette preparation, conducting a multi-day design charette and community engagement program, and a follow up community workshop.

If, upon completion of the multi-day design charette process, the community arrives at a desired vision other than the Property's current use, and the BEC recommends to City Council that the Property should be leased or sold, the implementation of the vision for the Property could be considered by Riverside City Council for further action in accordance with the community vision identified via the multi-day design charette process.

On August 16, 2021, RFP No. 2119 was posted on the City's Online Bid System and closed on September 9, 2021. A total of 66 prospective bidders registered for the bid. As a result of this solicitation, the City received five proposals which were deemed responsive.

To evaluate the proposals received, an RFP evaluation committee comprised of Community & Economic Development Divisions of Neighborhood Engagement, Economic Development, Real Property Services, and Planning staff was formed. The RFP evaluation committee evaluated each proposal based on the following criteria: firm experience, examples of similar projects, project understanding, approach and methodology, cost, schedule and capacity and references.

Proposals received are summarized as follows:

Table 1 - Summary of Proposals:

Scoring Rank	Proposer	Location	Fixed Bid	Est. Completion Timeline
1	KTUA	San Diego	\$199,333	12 Months
2	AVRP Skyport	San Diego	\$171,435	4-5 Months
3	The Altum Group	Palm Desert	\$272,159	7 Months
4	Novus Group International Corp.	Riverside	\$110,000	3-4 Months
5	Forma Design Inc.	Costa Mesa	\$29,000	4-5 Months

During the initial review of proposals, the RFP evaluation committee identified three top candidates for the project: KTUA, AVRP Skyport, and the Altum Group. However, while the two additional proposals from the Novus Group and Forma Design met the minimum requirements to be deemed responsive and scored well on the cost criteria element, their respective proposals scored significantly lower overall due to the RFP evaluation committee's determination that the vendors did not demonstrate a clear understanding of the full scope and breadth the work the project requires.

As such, the RFP evaluation committee conducted interviews on November 3, 2021, with AVRP, KTUA and the Altum Group. After the interviews, and careful review and re-scoring of the proposals based on the aforementioned scoring criteria, the RFP evaluation committee concluded that the KTUA proposal is the most qualified submittal to Request for Proposals No. 2119. Although KTUA wasn't ranked the lowest price submission, the evaluation committee's rationale is based on the following:

- **Experience:** The KTUA team brings together three firms: KTUA, PlaceWorks and Origins Golf Design, combining more than 50 years of relevant and diverse project experience, including local and regional projects. Together this team has expertise in planning, zoning, economics, market and fiscal analysis, landscape architecture, visualization techniques, the use of GIS techniques, virtual engagement experience, and golf course development in addition to their significant experience with community outreach and design charettes.
- **Methodology:** KTUA's organized, comprehensive charette strategy encourages equitable and accessible participation through a process that can be tailored to the needs of the community, utilizing virtual and in-person components as needed with a combination of tools, activities, materials, and software to support a positive experience. KTUA will coordinate all logistics for the charette and manage a timeline that paces the process to maximize engagement without community burnout. Their proposal also includes 11 staff across a variety of disciplines to meet the demands of the process.
- **Marketing:** KTUA will develop and execute a multi-faceted marketing and communication plan including but not limited to the use of social media, surveys, and hosting and managing a website for the charette, while meeting any language translation needs.
- **Approach:** KTUA's comprehensive approach to the charette considers the Property's history and spans all disciplines including, but not limited to, economics, land use, parks and transportation, for a visioning process that balances public benefit and community interests with an understanding that final recommendations must be implementable. It also reflects an engagement philosophy that encourages exploration of a variety of options without pre-conceived notions as to desired

outcomes. KTUA’s proposal includes a team member specifically experienced with golf course design and development, adding a perspective of compromise, broad possibilities, and innovative thinking.

- **Demonstrated Engagement Skill:** During the interview process, the KTUA team gave the RFP evaluation committee a firsthand demonstration of their ability to communicate professionally, effectively and with confidence, including comfortably handling virtual meetings. KTUA exemplified a clear understanding of how they work to anticipate communication challenges and encourage open dialogue. They clearly demonstrated an understanding of and ability to handle the core intent of the RFP and conduct a thoughtful and inclusive visioning process.
- **Competitive pricing:** KTUA was both flexible and competitive in their pricing, and staff negotiations resulted in a further 7% price reduction in their best and final offer without any changes or modifications to the scope of work.

Table 2 - Project Breakdown

Work Type	Hours	Cost
Task 1: Project Scoping Session and Administration	124	\$21,203
Task 2: Charette Preparation	372	\$59,490
Task 3: Multi-Day Charette	255	\$43,235
Task 4: Final Workshop and Summary	404	\$61,450
Materials		\$1,420
TOTAL	1,155	\$185,378

The Purchasing Manager concurs that the recommended actions are in compliance with Purchasing Resolution No. 23812.

STRATEGIC PLAN ALIGNMENT:

This item contributes to **Strategic Priority 5 – High Performing Government** and **Goal 5.3 – Enhancing communication and collaboration with community members to improve transparency, build public trust and encourage shared decision-making.** This item aligns with each of the five Cross-Cutting Threads as follows:

1. **Community Trust** – Engaging community stakeholders in an inclusive design charette provides staff with information to ensure transparent decision making based on sound policy in a timely and reliable manner that serves the public interest.
2. **Equity** – Engaging community stakeholders in an inclusive design charette demonstrates commitment to advancing fair treatment, recognition of rights and equitable distribution of services, and it ensures every member of the community has equal access to share in the benefits of community progress.
3. **Fiscal Responsibility** – Engaging community stakeholders in an inclusive design charette and conducting negotiations to ensure a competitive best and final offer for services shows that Riverside is a prudent steward of public funds and ensures responsible management of the City’s financial resources while providing quality public services to all.

4. **Innovation** – Engaging community stakeholders in an inclusive design charette ensures fresh and inventive ideas for meeting the community’s changing needs and prepares for the future through collaboration and adaptation.
5. **Sustainability & Resiliency** – Engaging community stakeholders in an inclusive design charette demonstrates that Riverside is committed to meeting the needs of the present without compromising the needs of the future.

FISCAL IMPACT:

The total fiscal impact of this action is \$185,378. A supplemental appropriation will be requested with the Council report for the costs of this action, in the amount of \$185,378. Upon Council approval, an appropriation will be recorded to the General Fund, Community & Economic Development- Economic Development, Professional Services account number 2815001-421000.

Prepared by: Chris Christopoulos, Acting Community & Economic Development Director

Certified as to availability of funds: Edward Enriquez, Chief Financial Officer / City Treasurer

Approved by: Rafael Guzman, Assistant City Manager

Approved as to form: Phaedra A. Norton, City Attorney

Attachment: Presentation