

# OPTIONS FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF SPANISH TRANSLATION AT CITY COUNCIL MEETINGS

City Manager's Office

City Council  
December 13, 2022

RiversideCA.gov

1

## BACKGROUND

### RIVERSIDE DEMOGRAPHICS



**53.6%**  
Hispanic or Latino Origin



**37.6%**  
speak Spanish at home



**31.1%**  
of Spanish speakers speak English less than "very well"

\*Based on US Census Bureau's 2021 American Community Survey.



RiversideCA.gov

2

2

# BACKGROUND

## PREVIOUS COMMITTEE MEETINGS



**May 5, 2021** – Options presented to expand language access; Staff was directed to research options regarding Spanish translation of Council & Committee meetings, agendas, and materials.



**July 7, 2021** – Estimated costs and options presented. Staff directed to research less costly options.



**October 6, 2021** – Staff explored automated Spanish caption system used by RivCo; new software release anticipated to eliminate ongoing manual translation costs.



**September 7, 2022** – Staff presented update to automated captioning system and options for implementing translated Agenda's and in-person interpretation of Council and Committee meetings.



3

RiversideCA.gov

3

# DISCUSSION

## BEST PRACTICES FROM NEIGHBORING CITIES



City Council and commission meeting agendas include a standardized statement, in the languages designated, that the agenda or specific items of interests are available for translation upon request



“Accessible Agenda” link on meeting calendar that allows for automated agenda translation through Google Translate (requires specific browser settings)



Automated captioning of meeting video feeds



Contract professional in-person Spanish interpretation of all City Council meetings only. Two separate web streams for virtual viewers



Make headphones available to in-person attendees if a community group provides the translator



4

RiversideCA.gov

4

## AGENDA TRANSLATION PILOT

City Clerk's Office conducted a **trial period** of translating City Council agendas (did not include Committee, Commissions or Boards) into Spanish.

**Estimated annual cost: \$10,600**

### Lessons learned include:



1. Using an outside vendor for translation of agendas does not support timely posting
2. Need an automated solution for equal access



5

RiversideCA.gov

5

## AUTOMATED SPANISH CAPTIONS

- Link Electronics recently released a software update that would **allow automated Spanish captions**.
- Hosted on **unique live-stream, separate from English version**.
- **No Spanish audio** included.



### One-Time Costs (Covered by PEG Funds):

- \$45,300 Automated Captioning Software
- \$4,500 Additional Granicus Encoder



### Ongoing Costs:

- \$1,500 Annual Granicus Service Fee



6

RiversideCA.gov

6

## BEST PRACTICE

In order to **adequately provide Spanish language access of all City Council & Committee meetings (approx. 132)**, staff suggests a combination of:



Translated **agendas**; and



Automated Spanish **captions**; and



An option for **in-person interpretation**



7

RiversideCA.gov

7

## IN-PERSON INTERPRETATION OPTIONS



**Upon Request**

**Approx. \$1,200 per Council Meeting/  
\$420 per Committee**

**All agendas will have a notice stating:**  
"Interpretation is available **upon request** with advanced notice no later than 3 business days prior to the scheduled meeting."



**At All City Council &  
Committee Meetings**

**Approx. \$96,600 per Year\*  
132 meetings**



8

RiversideCA.gov

8

## OPTION 1: UPON REQUEST



SERVICES	ESTIMATED COST
Translated Agendas	\$14,100 per Year
Spanish Captioning, No Audio	\$1,500 per Year
In-Person Interpretation Upon Request*	\$1,200 per Council Meeting / \$420 per Committee**
<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL</b>	<b>\$15,600+</b>

\*Notice on all Agendas: "Interpretation is available upon request with advanced notice no later than 3 business days prior to the scheduled meeting."

\*\*Estimate subject to formal RFP

9



RiversideCA.gov

9

## OPTION 2: ALL TIMES



SERVICES	COST
Translated Agendas	\$14,100 per Year
Spanish Captioning, No Audio	\$1,500 per Year
In-Person Interpretation	\$96,600 per Year*
<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL</b>	<b>\$112,200</b>

**In-person interpreters present at all City Council & Committee meetings.**

\*Estimate subject to formal RFP

10




RiversideCA.gov

10


## STAFF PREFERENCES

RECOMMENDED	SERVICES	ESTIMATED COST
✓	Translated Agendas	\$14,100 per Year
✓	Spanish Captioning, No Audio	\$1,500 per Year
✓	In-Person Interpretation Upon Request	\$200 per Hour
	In-Person Interpretation at ALL times	\$96,600 per Year


11
RiversideCA.gov

11

## STRATEGIC PLAN ALIGNMENT




### Strategic Priority 5 – High Performing Government


**Goal 5.2** – Utilize technology, data, and process improvement strategies to increase efficiencies, guide decision making, and ensure services are accessible and distributed equitably throughout all geographic areas of the city.

---


### Cross-Cutting Threads




Community Trust




Fiscal Responsibility




Sustainability &  
Resiliency



Equity



Innovation


12
RiversideCA.gov

12

## RECOMMENDATIONS

### **That the City Council:**

1. Provide input and guidance to expand language access for Limited English Proficiency persons through the Spanish translation of City Council and Committee meeting agendas; and
2. Provide input and guidance to expand language access for Limited English Proficiency persons through automated Spanish captions of City Council and Committee meetings; and
3. Provide further direction as the Council deems appropriate on in-person interpretation options for City Council and Committee meetings.



13

RiversideCA.gov