



Community & Economic Development Department

Planning Division

3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522 | Phone: (951) 826-5371 | RiversideCA.gov

CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD MEETING DATE: AUGUST 17, 2016

AGENDA ITEM NO.: 2

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

I. CASE NUMBER: P16-0465

II. PROJECT SUMMARY:

- 1) **Proposal:** Certificate of Appropriateness request to construct a weather enclosure for outdoor dining at the Bella Trattoria Bistro and provide accessible entry for a new wine tasting room in the Mission Wing.
- 2) **Location:** 3649 Mission Inn Avenue
- 3) **Ward:** 1
- 4) **Applicant:** AC Atherton, AIA, Core States Group
- 5) **Case Planner:** Jennifer Mermilliod, Contract Senior Planner
(951) 233-6897
jennifer@jmrc.biz

III. RECOMMENDATION:

That the Cultural Heritage Board:

1. **DETERMINE** that P16-0465, Certificate of Appropriateness, is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant Sections 15301 and 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines; and,
2. **APPROVE** Planning Case P16-0465 based on the facts for findings outlined in the staff report, and subject to the attached conditions, thereby issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project.

FACTS FOR FINDINGS: The Cultural Heritage Board and Historic Preservation Officer shall make findings of the following standards when applicable to approving or denying a Certificate of Appropriateness (Section 20.25.050 of the Riverside Municipal Code).

FINDINGS: The application proposal is consistent or compatible with the architectural period and the character-defining elements of the historic building;

FACTS: Bella Trattoria Bistro Enclosure. Both large, glazed panes and multi-paned sash are fill arched openings throughout the Inn, and the segmented arch design within the bays and tower roof element of the conservatory reflect and are compatible with existing design elements. Arched, glass casement windows and French doors allow the bay enclosures to be physically opened, and its view-through design through the use of thin steel and maximum glazing area as well as the skylights allows the open feel and character of the arcade to be maintained and for the arcade to continue to be lit by natural sunlight even when closed.

Wine Tasting Room Accessible Entry. The construction of a small-scale stair and accessible lift entry and their embellishment with salvaged ironwork from the property itself ensures compatibility with the architectural period and character-defining elements of the Mission Inn.

FINDINGS: The application proposal is compatible with existing adjacent or nearby Cultural Resources and their character-defining elements;

FACTS: Bella Trattoria Bistro Enclosure. The Bella Trattoria Bistro enclosure is adjacent to the Main Street pedestrian mall, which is bordered by historic, low-scale retail shops and eateries. The proposed steel-framed, glazed enclosure with arched elements are compatible with the mix of historic wood-framed storefront assemblies and modern metal-and-glass entrance modifications found along these thoroughfares.

Wine Tasting Room Accessible Entry. Although harmonious, compatibility with adjacent or nearby cultural resources is less applicable to this project component as proposed modifications are relatively minor, low to the ground, deeply setback, and shielded from public view by mature landscaping, brick garden wall, and a heavy, stuccoed pergola.

FINDINGS: The colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details, height, scale, massing and methods of construction proposed are consistent with the period and/or compatible with adjacent Cultural Resources;

FACTS: Bella Trattoria Bistro Enclosure. Although steel framing rather than wood is proposed, the segmented arch design and tower-like roof element of the conservatory as well as the deeply articulated profile of the steel frame make this material selection and design compatible with existing historic features, materials, and fenestration. The black finish draws less attention to

the frame structure and is compatible with wrought iron work throughout and directly above the arcade. Height, scale, and massing are consistent with elements of the period and adjacent cultural resources. The glazed bays will contribute a pedestrian-scaled, storefront feel to this portion of the elevation, increasing stylistic harmony along the mall.

Wine Tasting Room Accessible Entry. The use of ironwork from the salvaged materials from the hotel, the preservation and re-use of the existing window through encapsulation, and the low height, scale, massing and custom methods of design and construction ensure compatibility with the period.

FINDINGS: The proposed change does not adversely affect the context considering the following factors: grading; site development; orientation of buildings; off-street parking; landscaping; signs; street furniture; public areas; relationship of the project to its surroundings;

FACTS: Bella Trattoria Bistro Enclosure. Certain design elements serve to lessen effect on the adjacent public area and the relationship with the Main Street pedestrian mall, including the visually open and operational design of the enclosures and placement within the existing and perceived dining space defined by the existing planter walls and fencing, which currently physically and visually separate the bistro from the pedestrian mall. As only six (6) out of twenty-one (21) bays part of the enclosure, which stops short of the corner tower arcade bays, the contextual setting and view is intact north of the mall and along the Sixth Street elevation.

Wine Tasting Room Accessible Entry. The low height, size, scale, features, construction methods, and minimal site and landscaping modifications of the entry ensure a negligible contextual effect on its surroundings.

FINDINGS: The proposed change does not destroy or adversely affect an important architectural, historical, cultural or archaeological feature or features;

FACTS: Bella Trattoria Bistro Enclosure. The dimensions of the bay openings will not be modified, and the proposed glazed assemblies will be constructed in such a way as to cause minimal change to existing features and materials. Installation methods such as expansion bolts, screw anchors and epoxy minimize intrusion. The conservatory itself is entirely freestanding. The proposed changes are easily reversible in the future with minor repair.

Wine Tasting Room Accessible Entry. The existing window will not be removed but preserved and re-used through encapsulation as an entry. All entry work will be within, and without modification to, the existing exterior stuccoed bay and interior articulated archway, and the proposed stair-landing-lift structure will be entirely freestanding.

FINDINGS: The project is consistent with the Citywide Residential Historic District Design Guidelines and the separate guidelines for each Historic District (or applicable guidelines);

FACTS: Bella Trattoria Bistro Enclosure. The applicable reference is the Downtown Specific Plan – Raincross District design standards and guidelines. Pedestrian use of a portion of the prominent arcade as a thoroughfare is precluded by its existing permitted use as outdoor dining space. Materials and design proposed will cause the least visual impact to the open quality of the arcade and is not anticipated to visually obstruct the existing character-defining features and materials beyond.

Wine Tasting Room Accessible Entry. The addition of the low-height accessible, entry made mostly of open ironwork, will not substantially visually obstruct character-defining features and materials.

FINDINGS: The project is consistent with the principles of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties;

FACTS: Staff supports the findings of a Secretary of the Interior's Standards compliance report prepared by Ken Scofield, who meets the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualifications, and submitted by the applicant. The report separately analyzes the bistro enclosure and accessible entry components and concludes that the proposed project, which is both compatible with, and yet differentiated from, existing features is consistent with all applicable standards.

IV. BACKGROUND/HISTORY:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a weather enclosure for outdoor dining at the Bella Trattoria Bistro and accessible entry to a new wine tasting room in the southwest retail area of the Mission Wing, located at 3649 Mission Inn Avenue. The Mission Inn is designated as a City Landmark, California Historical Landmark, National Historic Landmark, Contributor to the Seventh Street Historic District and Mission Inn Historic District, and listed in the National Register.

Begun as a small hotel in 1876, the Mission Inn was enlarged and embellished over time and travel by Frank A. Miller from 1902 through 1948 to the large, varied-height complex that now encompasses an entire city block adjacent to the Main Street pedestrian mall. Prominent features include distinct wings, courts, patios, arcades, terraces, gardens, towers, and a rotunda, and collected historic architectural features from around the world, including fountains, fireplaces, a chapel, bells, windows, grilles and iron work.

The Mission Inn was designed by Arthur B. Benton, Myron Hunt, Elmer Gray, and G. Stanley Wilson, some of the most illustrious architects of the era, whose principal works may be found in Riverside and throughout the region. Mainly designed in the Mission Revival,

Spanish Revival styles, the Mission Inn is a uniquely cohesive collection of distinct stylistic design elements, features, and materials, as well as cultural, religious, and artistic objects.

Popular in Riverside from ca. 1890 to 1920, the Mission Revival style is defined by low pitched, red-tiled roofs, a traditionally shaped mission dormer or roof parapet, widely overhanging eaves, stuccoed wall surfaces, quatrefoil windows, porches supported by large, square piers, and the conservative use of decorative detailing. The style emerged in the late 1880s and early 1890s in a regional architectural movement that celebrated pride in local heritage. Instead of reacting to Eastern styles, which focused on the Colonial Revival style architecture that reflected their regional past, California architects took inspiration from the region's rich Hispanic heritage in their architectural designs. The Mission Revival style is thus an assertion of the state's individuality and a celebration of its cultural heritage through the simplicity of large, unadorned expanses of plain, stuccoed surfaces and arched openings.

Initially spawned by the popularity of the Mission style, following the 1915 Panama-California Exposition, held in San Diego, California, the Spanish Colonial Revival style was redefined by the entire history of Spanish architecture. Buildings in the style were generally constructed from 1915 to 1940, but in Riverside, most examples are typically from the 1920s and 1930s, a time when period revival architecture dominated construction. Character-defining features include square or rectangular plans, a low-pitched roof topped with red tiles, and close eaves. Arches are common above doors and prominent windows, and walls are most often sheathed in stucco. Round or square towers and arcades are sometimes present, and decorative details include patterned tiles and the use of wrought iron grille work.

An important presence in the early development of Riverside, the Mission Inn and Frank Miller promoted citriculture, tourism, rail service, settlement and local development, as well as international relationship. Over the decades, the Inn has been host to presidents, royalty, celebrities, and local personalities, and has emerged in excellent condition and integrity from difficult financial times and deteriorating conditions in the 1970s as a prosperous local and destination hotel resort, which has prompted the need for functional modifications and upgrades to support its continued use.

V. DETAILED PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The proposed project includes two distinct components - a weather enclosure for outdoor dining at the Bella Trattoria Bistro and an accessible entry to a new wine tasting room in the southwest retail area of the Mission Wing.

Bella Trattoria Bistro Weather Enclosure

The weather enclosure is focused on the northwest corner of the Mission Inn near Sixth Street and the Main Street pedestrian mall, where current open air restaurant seating extends from under an arcade of stacked concrete buttresses. The arcade runs from the middle of the west elevation to the middle of the north elevation and includes twenty-one (21) arched openings facing the Main Street pedestrian mall and Sixth Street. In order to provide protected dining space during inclement weather, the project proposes to enclose the north- and south-facing openings at the project area limits on the west

elevation and the six west-facing bays between them, which would also be lit by added skylights.

The north- and south-facing arcade openings, which measure approximately 15 feet wide and 13 feet high, would be enclosed with a complimentary, fixed glass pane design with metal infill panels at the base. Five of the west-facing arcade opening, which measure approximately 11 feet wide and 14 feet high, would with filled with a steel-framed, clear laminated glass assembly in a segmented arch design surrounding double, glass French doors with a metal infill panel base. Of these, the existing entry bay enclosure would be enhanced with ironwork salvaged from historic pieces stored at the Mission Inn and topped with a new awning. The southernmost, west-facing arcade opening would be enclosed by a freestanding 525-square-foot steel-framed glass conservatory with operable casement windows, south-facing glass French door entry, and cement tile flooring. The gabled glass roof would end in a half-pyramidal tower-like cap. The approximately 16-foot-high, 19-foot wide conservatory would rest on a concrete stem wall clad with metal panels and extend approximately 20 feet from the southernmost west-facing arcade bay within the existing landscaped planter area. A small open patio with concrete flooring is proposed at the conservatory entry.

The existing planter wall, light poles, trees, and landscaping are proposed to remain, and planters will be repopulated with complimentary species, as needed. Existing irrigation will be modified to accommodate proposed patio.

Wine Tasting Room Accessible Entry

A freestanding stair, landing, and accessible lift is proposed. The approximately 14-foot-long landing will be elevated by approximately 3 feet, supported by a concrete foundation and steel supports, and bordered by a 3.5-foot railing for an overall height of nearly 7 feet. The stairs and landing will be constructed of black painted steel, and original metal railings and ornamentation from the facility presently in storage at the Mission Inn will be used to custom embellish the handrails, guardrails, and wheel chair lift. An existing, previously encapsulated and sealed shut, leaded glass window will be preserved within laminated glass for re-use as the entry door to the wine tasting room. A canvas awning supported by salvaged decorative iron supports will be installed over the entry.

A modern, tiled service station will be removed to accommodate the entry, but most existing paving and landscaping will be retained. Minor landscape adjustments in existing planters is anticipated, and some plants will be relocated or potted.

VI. PROJECT ANALYSIS:

Compliance with Section 20.25.050 of the City of Riverside Municipal Code:

The arcade enclosure and conservatory at the Bella Trattoria Bistro as well as the accessible entry for the wine tasting room are located and scaled so as to not adversely affect the site, orientation of the existing property, setting, or adjacent cultural resources. The new structures will be constructed with similar massing, elements, details, and materials like segmented arched glass, fully-glazed arched windows and French

doors, and salvaged ironwork from the property. Design and material selections are both compatible with, and yet differentiates from, existing features.

General Plan/Specific Plan/Zoning Conformance

General Plan: The proposed project is consistent with the existing General Plan land use designation for the project site because it maintains the existing use of the property.

Specific Plan: The proposed project is consistent with the Downtown Specific Plan – Raincross District land uses, development standards, and design standards and guidelines. The arcade element of the Bella Trattoria Bistro is a character-defining feature whose existing permitted use as outdoor dining space precludes pedestrian use as a thoroughfare through a portion of the arcade. The materials proposed for the glass enclosure of the arched openings will cause the least visual impact to the open quality of the arcade, and the addition of the glass conservatory at the Bella Trattoria Bistro and the accessible entry for the wine tasting room will not substantially visually obstruct character-defining features and materials.

Zoning: The property is zoned Downtown Specific Plan Raincross District with CR Overlay Zone. The proposed project is consistent with the existing Zoning code for the project site as both components of the project maintain the existing use of the property. The 525-square-foot conservatory addition is within the allowable limit under Title 19. The weather enclosure of the arcade at the Bella Trattoria Bistro and the accessible entry for the wine tasting room meet all setback and height requirements of the zoning code. Because the addition of the glass conservatory extends into the public right-of-way of the Main Street pedestrian mall, the Public Works Department has indicated the need for an encroachment permit.

VII. PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS:

Public notices were mailed to property owners adjacent to the site at least ten (10) days prior to the scheduled hearing. No responses have been received to date.

VIII. EXHIBITS:

1. Location Map
2. Zoning Map
3. Project Plans
4. Secretary of the Interior's Standards Compliance Report

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Case Number: P16-0465

MEETING DATE: August 17, 2016

General Conditions

1. The project must be complete per the Cultural Heritage Board's approval, including all conditions listed below. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Board or the Cultural Heritage Board staff. Upon completion of the project, a Cultural Heritage Board staff inspection must be requested to ensure that the approved plans have been executed and that all conditions have been implemented before **FINAL INSPECTION** hold can be released.
2. There is a ten (10) day appeal period that will lapse at 5:00 p.m. on August 27, 2016. Appeals of the Board's action will not be accepted after this time. The appeal fee is \$1,531.20. Appeal processing information may be obtained from the Community & Economic Development Department, Planning Division, Public Information Section, 3rd Floor, City Hall.
3. This approval will expire in one year on August 17, 2017.

Specific Conditions of Approval

3. Applicant shall obtain Encroachment Permit, as necessary, for construction and landscaping within the Main Street pedestrian mall and any other required permits.
4. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall revise the Northwest Corner Context Plan to clearly show existing conditions and indicate all elements, features, materials, and site work to be removed.
5. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall revise the plans to include detail of window encapsulation and conversion to entry door.
6. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall revise the plans to indicate each location where salvaged ironwork will be installed.
7. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall revise the plans to indicate and state type, material and function of all windows and doors.
8. The steel frame of the arcade bay enclosures and conservatory shall be custom fabricated to fit properly around the stepped reveal of concrete arcade columns; the columns shall not be modified to accommodate the enclosure.
9. Custom ironwork from salvaged material shall be appropriate to the building's age and architecture. The applicant shall submit design of bistro entry door

embellishment, stairs, landing, wheelchair lift, and awning supports to the Cultural Heritage Board staff for approval prior to fabrication and installation.

10. Aside from the new awning over the existing entry of the Bella Trattoria Bistro, no exterior coverings or interior window treatments shall be installed over glazed arcade bay assemblies or the conservatory to maintain visual continuity, openness, and character of the historic arcade.
11. Proposed door hardware shall be appropriate to the building's age and architecture. The applicant shall submit design or a product information sheet or manufacturer's brochure showing the proposed exterior door and window hardware to Cultural Heritage Board staff for approval prior to fabrication or purchase and installation.
12. Proposed lighting fixtures shall be appropriate to the building's age and architecture. The applicant shall submit design or a product information sheet or manufacturer's brochure showing the proposed outdoor lighting fixtures to Cultural Heritage Board staff for approval prior to fabrication or purchase and installation.
13. The granting of this request shall in no way exclude or excuse compliance with all other applicable rules and regulations in effect at the time this permit is exercised.

APPEAL INFORMATION:

The Board's decision or any conditions of approval can be appealed by the applicant or any interested person. To appeal this decision, submit a letter stating what you wish to appeal and why, the General Application form, and the corresponding appeal fee. The Community & Economic Development Department offers a packet on filing an appeal that you might find helpful. Appeals may be delivered in person or mailed, but they must be received by August 27, 2016 at 5:00 p.m. ten (10) days following approval of this case. The Community & Economic Development Department's address is:

City of Riverside
Community & Economic Development Department
Planning Division
3900 Main Street, 3rd Floor
Riverside, CA 92522

Appeals will be considered by the Land Use Committee of the City Council at their next available meeting.

G:\CHB\2016 CHB\08-17-16\P16-0465 3649 Mission Inn COA\P16-0465_jen.docx
Jennifer Mermilliod