



Community & Economic Development Department

Planning Division

3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522 | Phone: (951) 826-5371 | RiversideCA.gov

CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD MEETING DATE: OCTOBER 19, 2016

AGENDA ITEM NO.: 2

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

I. CASE NUMBER(S): P15-0552

II. PROJECT SUMMARY:

- 1) Proposal:** Proposed Certificate of Appropriateness request to construct an unmanned telecommunication wireless facility consisting of a 203 square-foot, 55 foot-high stealth antenna tower with related equipment inside the antenna structure, a 252 square-foot, 8 foot-high equipment compound with block walls and a chain link security lid, and installation of related underground lines and cables on the property developed with the Magnolia Presbyterian Church sanctuary and parking lot.
- 2) Location:** 7200 Magnolia Avenue (APN 230-142-016)
- 3) Ward:** 3
- 4) Applicant:** Cortel, Inc.
- 5) Case Planner:** Casey Tibbet, Historic Preservation Contract Planner
(951) 781-9310
casey.tibbet@lsa.net

III. RECOMMENDATION:

That the Cultural Heritage Board:

1. **DETERMINE** that Planning Case P15-0552 is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per Sections 15303 of the CEQA Guidelines; and
2. **APPROVE** Planning Case P15-0552, based on the findings outlined in the staff report and summarized below, and subject to the attached conditions, thereby issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project.

FACTS FOR FINDINGS: (From Section 20.25.050 of the Riverside Municipal Code)

The Board and Historic Preservation Officer shall make findings of the following standards when applicable to approving or denying a Certificate of Appropriateness.

FINDINGS: The application proposal is compatible with existing adjacent or nearby Cultural Resources and their character-defining elements;

FACTS: The proposed project is consistent with this finding. The proposed accessory structures (stealth antenna tower and equipment compound) will be located on the southwest side of the 1965 Mid-Century Modern church building which occupies the property. This building was identified in 2013 as being eligible for designation as a City Landmark under the Modern Architecture theme. The proposed structures will be located approximately 76 feet from the frontage road and will be a few feet south of the front (north) wall of the church and the walkway that accesses it. The tower and equipment compound have been designed to be compatible with the architectural period and character-defining elements of this church building, which is constructed of a combination of exposed and stucco-covered concrete masonry units (CMU) and features a steeply-pitched gable roof that gives it a soaring, vertical character. The three-sided tower structure, which has been designed to look like a bell tower, has a vertical emphasis that is accentuated by the three, narrow, rectangular supports that reflect the narrow, rectangular columns supporting the church's full-height entrance portico. Like the north-facing church façade, the antenna tower will be covered with smooth stucco. Also referencing the church, the top of the tower incorporates a cross motif to screen the antenna panels and other equipment from view. The equipment compound is proposed to be constructed of exposed CMUs similar to the southwest elevation of the church.

In addition to being located adjacent to the 1965 church building, the project area is within the potential Old Magnolia Avenue Neighborhood Conservation Area (NCA). The potential NCA is associated with citrus culture and early settlement in Riverside and has a period of significance of 1877 to 1924. The 1965 church building is not a contributor to the potential NCA. Contributors include Magnolia Avenue, properties across Magnolia Avenue to the north of the project area, and the 1881 Gothic Revival style church (City Landmark #4) located on the property adjacent to the northeast of the subject property. The addition of the two proposed accessory structures will not diminish the integrity or historic character of this potential NCA or any other nearby historical resources.

FINDINGS: The colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details, height, scale, massing and methods of construction proposed are consistent with the period and/or compatible with adjacent Cultural Resources.

FACTS: The proposed project is consistent with the relevant aspects of this finding. The proposed stealth tower and equipment compound will be compatible with the church in colors, materials, and textures. The tower will be covered with smooth stucco in a color that matches the church façade and the equipment compound will be exposed CMUs, similar to the southwest elevation of the church. The size, scale, and massing of the 55 foot-high tower is also compatible with the church because the open support structure reduces the overall mass and visual impact of the tower. Although the tower is proposed to be approximately 15 feet taller than the church, that is not uncharacteristic of a church bell tower, which is the intent of this stealth design. The equipment compound, at 252 square-feet and 8 feet in height, is small in scale and massing and is not visually intrusive. For these reasons, the proposed accessory structures will not result in any adverse impacts to the 1965 church building, the potential NCA, or any other nearby historical resources.

FINDINGS: The proposed change does not adversely affect the context considering the following factors: grading; site development; orientation of buildings; off-street parking; landscaping; signs; street furniture; public areas; relationship of the project to its surroundings.

FACTS: The proposed project is consistent with the relevant aspects of this finding. The proposed accessory structures will not change the orientation of buildings, parking, signs, or walls. All trees will be retained, including the 13 fruit trees between the church building and parking area and the 3 trees in the lawn area where the structures are proposed to be located. If for some reason any of the trees must be removed, they will be replaced. The new structures will also be set further back from the street than the adjacent church building, allowing that building to remain the focal point of the property. The proposed accessory structures will not result in any physical changes to the contributing properties or character-defining features of the potential NCA.

FINDINGS: The application proposal is consistent with the Principles of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

FACTS: The proposed project is consistent with this finding. The project utilizes materials and design details compatible with the historic structure, but will not alter the historic building in any way. Alterations to the grounds will not change the spatial relationships, size, scale, or massing in a way that adversely affects the significance of the historic building, the potential NCA, or any nearby historical resources.

IV. BACKGROUND/HISTORY:

Located at 7200 Magnolia Avenue, this Mid-Century Modern-style church building is part of a larger church complex that includes (on a separate parcel) the 1881 Gothic Revival style Magnolia Presbyterian Church. The older church is designated City Landmark #4 and is located northeast of the 1965 church building and proposed new structures. The project area

is also within the Old Magnolia Avenue Potential NCA, which includes Magnolia Avenue (including parkway and center divider) from San Rafael Way to the north and Arlington Avenue to the south. Properties within the potential NCA are predominantly developed with bungalows and Craftsman and Mediterranean style houses, as well as the small parent navel orange tree park and the City's oldest church (Magnolia Presbyterian Church). The NCA is potentially significant for its association with Riverside's citrus culture and early settlement patterns. Its period of significance is 1877 to 1924. The 1965 church building is outside the potential NCA's period of significance and, therefore, is not a contributor to the potential NCA.

In 2013, the 1965 church building was evaluated as eligible for designation as a City Landmark as part of the Citywide Modernism Intensive Survey. Building permits indicate it was built by the locally significant contractor Harry Marsh, but no architect is listed. The church was evaluated as significant under the theme of Modern Architecture because it is a good example of Mid-Century Modern institutional/religious architecture in Riverside.

V. DETAILED PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The proposed project at 7200 Magnolia Avenue includes the construction of a Verizon wireless unmanned telecommunication wireless facility consisting of:

- A 55 foot-high, approximately 203 square-foot stealth antenna tower that will include the following:
 - 12 panel antennas in the stealth tower structure;
 - 12 remote radio units (RRUs) in the stealth tower structure;
 - 12 A2 backpacks behind the RRUs in the stealth tower structure;
 - 2 raycap boxes in the stealth tower structure; and
 - DC and fiber cables routed on the inside of the tower.
- An 8 foot-high, approximately 252 square-foot equipment compound and lease area constructed of concrete masonry units (CMUs) with a chain link security lid and a 5 foot-wide metal access gate. The compound will be on a new concrete pad and will include the following:
 - 2 equipment cabinets;
 - 1 standby generator with a fuel tank; and
 - 1 GPS antenna mounted on the CMU wall or the equipment cabinet. The top of the antenna will have a maximum height of 7 feet 10 inches.
- 100 AMP Verizon wireless power service with proposed 100 AMP meter connection as required for power and fiber services located outside the southeast corner of the equipment compound;
- Installation of a 17 inch by 30 inch electrical pullbox in the southern corner of the property (in the parking lot);
- Installation of an underground electrical line extending from the electrical pullbox approximately 210 feet northeast through the parking lot to the equipment compound;
- Installation of an underground fiber line extending northwest approximately 115 feet from the rear (southeast) property line to the equipment compound; and
- Installation of 5 foot-wide subsurface antenna cable between the tower and the equipment compound.

To facilitate the project, some of the lawn area will be replaced with concrete, but as previously discussed all of the existing trees are proposed to be retained. If any trees must be

removed, they will be replaced. Although not indicated on the plans, the applicant has stated that any materials removed during trenching for the electrical, fiber, and/or antenna cable lines will be replaced in kind. Similarly, although the photographic simulations indicate that the tower will be illuminated, the plans have been revised to eliminate the proposed lighting and applicant has verified that no lighting is proposed.

VI. PROJECT ANALYSIS:

- **Compliance with section 20.25.050 of the City of Riverside Municipal Code:**

The proposed accessory structures (stealth antenna tower and equipment compound) are designed and located in a manner that will not adversely affect the site or orientation of the existing church building. The new structures will be complimentary to the church building in size, scale, and massing and will utilize materials, colors, and textures that are similar to those used on the church. In addition, the proposed accessory structures will not result in any substantial adverse changes to the potential NCA, its contributing resources, or any other nearby historical resources. All of the existing trees will be preserved in place. If for some reason a tree must be removed, it will be replaced. As a condition of this report, any materials outside the equipment compound that are removed by trenching will be replaced in kind.

- **General Plan/Specific Plan/Zoning Conformance:**

General Plan: The General Plan land use designation for this property is Mixed-Use Village. The proposed project is consistent with the land use designation because it maintains the existing, permitted use of the property.

Zoning: The zoning for the property is R-1-7000-CR (Single Family Residence, Cultural Resources Overlay Zone), which permits assemblies of people non-entertainment (e.g. places of worship) subject to approval of a Conditional Use Permit (CUP). The project is in conformance with the zoning because the church operates under an approved CUP and wireless telecommunication facilities are permitted in this zone subject to review by the appropriate governing body, in this case the Cultural Heritage Board. In addition, the proposed project complies with the Site Location, Operation, Development Standards, and Design Guidelines for Wireless Communication Facilities set forth in Section 19.530.050 of the Zoning Code. More specifically, the facility is located outside of required building setbacks, is more than 75 feet from any residential structure, is designed to look like a church bell tower and matches the existing church in materials and colors, retains all existing trees and much of the lawn area, and is less than 60 feet in height.

- **CHB Purview**

Matters within the purview of the CHB are limited to those actions that would uphold the purpose of the City's Cultural Resources ordinance (Title 20) as described in Section 20.05.010. More specifically, for this project, it is within the CHB's purview to:

- Consider the potential project impacts to the significance of the historical resources (Magnolia Presbyterian Church and the potential Old Magnolia Avenue NCA) within and adjacent to the project area.

- Consider the proposed design, colors, materials, and locations of the proposed improvements as they relate to and potentially impact the significance of the historical resources.
- Apply recommendations that protect the significance of the historical resources within and adjacent to the project area.

The CHB is the final acting body on this project. No action by the Planning Commission or City Council is required.

VII. PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS:

In September 2016, public notices were mailed to property owners adjacent to the site. In response to that notification, two comments in support of the project were received electronically. In addition, one property owner attended the September 21, 2016 CHB meeting and expressed his concern that the notice gave an incorrect comment deadline of March 2016. Because this may have deterred others from responding to the notice, the CHB voted to continue consideration of this project to its October 19, 2016 meeting so that the project could be re-noticed with the correct comment deadline. As of the writing this revised report, no additional comments have been received.

IX. EXHIBITS:

1. Aerial Map
2. Zoning Map
3. Old Magnolia Avenue NCA
4. Current Site Photos
5. Photo Simulations
6. Project Plans
7. 2013 DPR Forms
8. Public Comments



CITY OF RIVERSIDE

COMMUNITY & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

PLANNING DIVISION

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Case Number: P15-0552

MEETING DATE: October 19, 2016

General Conditions

1. The project must be complete per the Cultural Heritage Board's approval, including all conditions listed below. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Board or the Cultural Heritage Board staff.
2. There is a ten day appeal period that will lapse at 5:00 p.m. on October 31, 2016. Appeals of the Board's action will not be accepted after this time. The appeal fee is \$1,531.20. Appeal processing information may be obtained from the Community & Economic Development Department, Planning Division, Public Information Section, 3rd Floor, City Hall.
3. This approval will expire in one year on October 19, 2017.

Specific Conditions of Approval

4. Prior to issuance of building permits, the plans shall be revised to include a note that all materials (paving, landscaping, etc.) outside of the equipment compound that are removed during trenching will be replaced in kind.
5. The granting of this request shall in no way exclude or excuse compliance with all other applicable rules and regulations in effect at the time this permit is exercised.

APPEAL INFORMATION:

The staff's decision or any condition of approval can be appealed by the applicant or any interested person. To appeal this decision, submit a letter stating what you wish to appeal and why, the General Application form and the corresponding appeal fee. The Community & Economic Development Department offers a packet on filing an appeal that you might find helpful. Appeals may be delivered in person or mailed, but they must be received by October 31, 2016 at 5:00 p.m. ten days following approval of this case. The Community & Economic Development Department's address is:

City of Riverside
Community & Economic Development Department
Planning Division
3900 Main Street, 3rd Floor
Riverside, CA 92522

Appeals will be considered by the Land Use Committee of the City Council at their next available meeting.

G:\CHB\2016 CHB\10-19-16\P16-0552\P16-0552 COA report.docx
Casey Tibbet