



Community & Economic Development Department

Planning Division

3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522 | Phone: (951) 826-5371 | RiversideCA.gov

CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD MEETING DATE: MARCH 15, 2017

AGENDA ITEM NO.: 5

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

I. CASE NUMBER: P16-0877

II. PROJECT SUMMARY:

- 1) Proposal:** Certificate of Appropriateness request to construct the Mission Booster Station Installation & Pressure Rezoning Project, which includes replacing the Rubidoux and Mary Evans Booster Stations, consolidating three hydraulic pressure zones into a single zone, and constructing approximately 5,250 linear feet of underground iron water main pipeline, within or near Loring Park, Mount Rubidoux, Buena Vista Bridge, and the Seventh Street, Mount Rubidoux, Colony Heights, and Evergreen Quarter Historic Districts.
- 2) Location:** Loring Park at Mount Rubidoux Drive and the eastern base of Mount Rubidoux Memorial Park and Indian Hill.
- 3) Ward:** 1
- 4) Applicant:** Riverside Public Utilities Water Planning & Resources
- 5) Case Planner:** Jennifer Mermilliod, Contract Senior Planner
(951) 233-6897
jennifer@jmrc.biz

III. RECOMMENDATION:

That the Cultural Heritage Board Recommend that the City Council:

1. **DETERMINE** that P16-0877, Certificate of Appropriateness, will not have a significant effect on historic resources under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) based on the findings set forth in the case record;
2. **ADOPT** a Mitigation Negative Declaration and Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) for the Mission Inn Booster Station Installation & Pressure Rezoning Project; and

3. **APPROVE** Planning Case P16-0877 based on the facts for findings outlined in the staff report, and subject to the attached conditions, thereby issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project.

FACTS FOR FINDINGS: The Cultural Heritage Board and Historic Preservation Officer shall make findings of the following standards when applicable to approving or denying a Certificate of Appropriateness (Section 20.25.050 of the Riverside Municipal Code).

FINDINGS: The application proposal is consistent or compatible with the architectural period and the character-defining elements of the historic building;

FACTS: The proposed Mission Inn Booster Station utilizes features, materials, finishes, and methods such as faux stone, neutral colors, and natural landscaping to best blend with the natural open space setting of Loring Park. Massing and orientation reduce its prominence on the landscape. As designed and further conditioned, vegetation that screens both vertically and horizontally with mixed height and varied concentration of coverage in a natural growth pattern and color palette is selected over a manicured, sculpted, and excessively colorful look.

FINDINGS: The application proposal is compatible with existing adjacent or nearby Cultural Resources and their character-defining elements;

FACTS: The project incorporates design elements of the nearest Cultural Resources without creating a false sense of historicity. Specifically, faux stone siding made of modern materials in a neutral gray finish seeks to blend with the natural stone and neutral palette of the nearby Buena Vista Bridge and stone wall along Mount Rubidoux Drive. The use of minimized massing, stone and ironwork detail, brown key stone block retaining wall, and natural landscaping also achieves harmony with the natural and historic features of the Mount Rubidoux Historic District and its varied architectural fabric as well as in the west residential end of the Seventh Street Historic District.

FINDINGS: The colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details, height, scale, massing and methods of construction proposed are consistent with the period and/or compatible with adjacent Cultural Resources;

FACTS: Although faux, stone-stamped concrete rather than real stone is proposed, its use and that of wrought iron accents and fencing, as well as compacted decomposed granite paving make these material selections and design choices compatible with existing historic features and materials throughout the Mount Rubidoux Historic District and the western residential end of the Seventh Street Historic District. The Mount Rubidoux Historic District features both actual and simulated stone walls, wrought iron work, gray concrete hardscape, and natural granite in private and public spaces. Height, scale, and massing are consistent with elements of the period and nearby Cultural

Resources while allowing the grand style of the residential homes on Indian Hill to maintain their presence. Doors are utilitarian in design, but intake and exhaust openings will feature wrought iron grilles. Natural, neutral colors found in the gray faux stone finish, black wrought iron work, brown landscaping blocks, and natural landscaping serve to blend rather than draw attention to the booster station. The tall SCADA antennae will be placed to the rear (west) and painted to blend with the booster station or the natural vegetation.

FINDINGS: The proposed change does not adversely affect the context considering the following factors: grading; site development; orientation of buildings; off-street parking; landscaping; signs; street furniture; public areas; relationship of the project to its surroundings;

FACTS: The booster station has been oriented and the project designed so as to limit visibility from both Mount Rubidoux Drive and Mission Inn Avenue and avoid the historic stone wall along Mount Rubidoux Drive. The long, sloped and curving decomposed granite driveway and landscaping both help partially shield the building and contribute to maintaining the natural open space feel of Loring Park. The northeast-southwest orientation of the booster station on the pad places it on angle with the west-traveling public along Mission Inn Avenue, limiting the view to portions of the southwest and southeast elevations. The flat building pad is compensated by site massing to maximize maintenance of the natural sloping topography. The Mission Inn Booster Station will provide improved vehicle parking and space for accommodating a portable generator next to the station during emergencies compared to the existing Rubidoux and Mary Evans booster stations, the removal of which will enhance rather than detract from their respective surroundings.

FINDINGS: The proposed change does not destroy or adversely affect an important architectural, historical, cultural or archaeological feature or features;

FACTS: The 480-square-foot booster station would rest on a 3,000-square-foot site, a relatively small addition to the 2.48-acre Loring Park within the Mount Rubidoux Historic District and does not destroy or adversely affect important features. The stone wall along Mount Rubidoux Drive and most trees will be avoided and protected during construction. Three mature Carob trees proposed for removal have been found to be in poor health, and will be replaced with recommended Coast Live Oak trees that are compatible in terms of physical characteristics and growth pattern. Areas of new and replacement pipeline installation in public streets will be backfilled, compacted, and repaved. The removal of the Rubidoux Booster Station equipment near the boundary of the Mount Rubidoux Landmark, would return this area to the look and feel of the natural environment, and the removal of the Mary Evans Booster Station is a negligent change to the Mount Rubidoux Historic District as the station is contained in an underground vault.

FINDINGS: The project is consistent with the Citywide Residential Historic District Design Guidelines and the separate guidelines for each Historic District;

FACTS: Consistency with the Citywide Residential Historic District Design Guidelines and the Mount Rubidoux Historic District Guidelines is found in the overall compatibility of the design principles at work in the project. The project provides compatible size, scale, proportion, color, and materials such as the use of wrought iron rather than tubular steel, and the use of decomposed granite for the driveway. Although actual stone is preferred for walls, simulated stone as found throughout the district and is within the spirit of the district guidelines, which does allow for stamped concrete hardscape and encourages the use of natural gray color. Replacement Coast Live Oak trees are found in recommended lists as is the proposed toyon shrubs. Other plantings such as deer grass, myoporum, and agave neomexicana are in keeping with the existing vegetation within Loring Park and in the district. Although flat, graded sites are discouraged, district guidelines primarily speak to residential construction on private lots, and this deviation to eliminate easy roof access appears necessary to ensure public safety within Loring Park.

FINDINGS: The project is consistent with the principles of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties;

FACTS: The project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties as changes to Loring Park are focused in a small portion of the 2.48-acre site and are sensitively designed to avoid the alteration of features and spaces that characterize the property. The design and new materials are compatible with, yet distinct from, nearby cultural resources, and important historic features like Mount Rubidoux Drive will be avoided by the project. The proposed project, as conditioned, is consistent with all applicable standards.

IV. BACKGROUND/HISTORY:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct the Mission Booster Station Installation & Pressure Rezoning Project to address issues of low water pressure, insufficient fire flow and protection, booster station operation deficiencies, system reliability, and aged and undersized existing water mains within the existing Rubidoux 1066 and Mary Evans 1150 hydraulic pressure zones.

The applicant analyzed numerous alternate locations that address these issues, but these were found to be problematic due to reasons such as limited land availability in the area from its built-out condition and proximity to existing residential uses, infeasibility of siting the station too far from the pressure zones being consolidated, and creating another hazardous condition by locating the booster station in a subterranean vault underneath a narrow paved roadway as is currently experienced with the Mary Evans Booster Station.

The project proposes facilities and activities within or in proximity to seven cultural resources: Loring Park (Eligible Local Resource of Merit), Mount Rubidoux (City Landmark #26; State Point of Historical Interest), Buena Vista Bridge (City Landmark #74), the Seventh Street Historic District (City Landmark #40; 1980), Mount Rubidoux Historic District (designated 1987), Colony Heights Historic District (designated 1998), and Evergreen Quarter Historic District (designated 2004).

Loring Park: This 2.48-acre, undeveloped open space park on the southern slope of Indian Hill, also known as Little Mount Rubidoux, features natural topography with trees, grass, and granitic boulders. The park is named for Charles Loring, a colorful businessman, influential civic leader, and enthusiastic open space advocate in Riverside who constructed the block-long, Richardsonian Romanesque-style office and Loring Opera House theater building downtown and, together with Mission Inn owner Frank Miller, vigorously sought improvements to Mount Rubidoux to enhance the City's appeal to prospective landowners. Loring saw several improvements to Mount Rubidoux, including the financing of the St. Francis Fountain and waterfall at the hill end of the Friendship Bridge, supervising the planting of hundreds of trees along the lower slopes, and donating land for the construction of the current, replacement Buena Vista Bridge between Mount Rubidoux and Little Mount Rubidoux. In 1932, ten years after his death, the City officially dedicated this area on Little Mount Rubidoux as Loring Park. With no original irrigation system, maintaining the park's vegetation has become a local concern in the last decades when 22 dying trees were removed. Private irrigation efforts by adjacent residents and sprinklers installed in end-2012 both proved inadequate to support the park's vegetation, and a 2013 Arbor Day tree planting and fundraising event has added a number of new trees to the sloping site. However, the trees within Loring Park are not currently irrigated due to poor water pressure. The proposed Mission Inn Booster Station is within the southern tip of Loring Park, which was found to be eligible as a local Resource of Merit by the recent Cultural Resources Survey conducted by CRM Tech for the proposed project.

Mount Rubidoux: This City Landmark and State Point of Historical Interest is an isolated rocky knoll south of Mission Inn Avenue and west of Mount Rubidoux Drive on the northwestern edge of Riverside's original Mile Square townsite. Named after early settler and ranchero Louis Robidoux, the site was developed for public recreation by Frank Miller and Charles Loring to attract potential land buyers to the area. Early improvements included a road to the summit, landscaping, and a large cross dedicated by Miller to Friar Junipero Serra. In 1909, the summit became the site of the nation's first Easter Sunrise Service, and now the oldest still in continuous operation. The 1925 Peace Tower and Friendship Bridge were designed by Arthur Benton and constructed to honor Miller, and in 1955, Miller's estate donated Mount Rubidoux to the City of Riverside. The existing Rubidoux Booster Station and westernmost segments of proposed pipeline are near the City-documented boundaries of Mount Rubidoux.

Buena Vista Bridge: This City Landmark is a stone-veneered poured-concrete arch bridge with stone towers that crosses over Mission Inn Avenue with a small arched pedestrian path at the southwestern end. Designed by well-known local civic engineers, J.F. Davidson and A.C. Fulmor, the bridge was constructed by local builder John Matich of

Matich Brothers in 1931 as a major element in the beautification of this approach to the City. The Buena Vista Bridge is directly adjacent to the southern perimeter of Loring Park and in proximity to the proposed Mission Inn Booster Station.

Seventh Street Historic District: Running the entire length of Riverside's original Mile Square townsite, this district includes both sides of Mission Inn Avenue and encompasses the Buena Vista Bridge on the west and the Union Pacific and Santa Fe depots on the east. The corridor includes many of the best recognized commercial, municipal, and religious buildings in downtown Riverside as well as a number of stately residences in the northwestern area near the proposed project in a dramatic assemblage of architectural styles, including Pueblo, Mission Revival, Moorish, Churrigueresque, Renaissance Revival, Mediterranean, Classical Revival, Romanesque, and more. A segment of the proposed pipeline along and across Mission Inn Avenue between Mount Rubidoux Drive and Redwood Drive is within the Seventh Street Historic District, and the proposed Mission Inn Booster Station is within the viewshed of the residences on the northwestern end of the district.

Mount Rubidoux Historic District: This district encompasses the properties of Indian Hill (or Little Mount Rubidoux) between Redwood Drive and Indian Hill Road on the north side of Mission Inn Avenue as well as properties south of the avenue along Mount Rubidoux Drive and the south side of University Avenue at the base of Mount Rubidoux. Gridlike streets give way to climbing curvilinear paths, where lineal stone features mix with natural topography to support average to grand high-style residences in architectural styles popular from 1903 to 1935, mainly Mediterranean Revival, Period Revivals that exhibit English, Norman, and French nuance, and Craftsman styles. The Mary Evans Booster Station, the proposed site of the Mission Inn Booster Station, and small portions of the proposed pipelines right-of-way are within the Mount Rubidoux Historic District.

Colony Heights Historic District: This district is bounded by the north side of Mission Inn Avenue, the west side of Pine Street, the south side of Third Street and the east side of Redwood Drive. Grid-pattern residential streets support primarily one- and two-story, single-family, high integrity residences of the early-20th century decades and include excellent examples of Craftsman, Turn-of-the-Century, and Period Revival architectural styles. Portions of the proposed pipeline are adjacent to the Colony Heights Historic District.

Evergreen Quarter Historic District: This district is bounded by University Avenue (north), Evergreen Cemetery (south), the east side of Redwood Drive (west), and Locust Street (east). Grid-pattern residential streets support feature one- and two-story, single-family residences and duplexes, as well as apartment buildings, churches, and the Evergreen Cemetery. The district represents a wide variety of residential architectural styles from the 1880s to the 1930s, including Queen Anne, American Foursquare, Craftsman, Spanish Colonial Revival, Mission Revival, and Classical Revival. Portions of the proposed pipeline are adjacent to Evergreen Quarter Historic District.

V. DETAILED PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The proposed project includes several components – the construction of the Mission Inn Booster Station, the removal of the Rubidoux and Mary Evans Booster Stations, the consolidation of three existing hydraulic pressure zones (Rubidoux 1066, Mary Evans 1150, and the surrounding Gravity 997 zone) into one pressure zone, which will be known as Rubidoux 1115, and the construction of new water main pipeline.

Mission Inn Booster Station: The proposed station will house four floor-mounted, vertical turbine pumps properly equipped to more than meet the maximum daily demand plus fire flow demand simultaneously throughout the proposed Rubidoux 1115 pressure zone and provide adequate operation during an emergency. An approximately 5.5 feet tall adjacent electrical transformer will also be constructed per Riverside Public Utilities specifications as will a 35' SCADA antennae to support booster station operations.

The approximately 480-square-foot booster station will be placed on an approximately 3,000-square-foot graded pad at the southeast tip of Loring Park, approximately 72% within park property and 18% within Mt. Rubidoux Drive public street right-of-way. The 16-foot-wide by 30-foot-long and 9-foot-tall pre-cast concrete building will be placed on a flat pad rather than set into the site with the rear below grade to ensure building height does not constitute a public safety hazard. The exterior features a faux, stamped stone finish, and two hatches will access the flat, unstamped roof for equipment replacement. Utilitarian double door entries are off-set on the north and south elevations, and intake and exhaust wrought iron grilles are placed on the north and west elevations. A retaining wall (ranging in height from two to five feet) with wrought iron fencing will be constructed along the west and north elevations, and landscaping maintained by RPU will consist of low ground cover, medium grasses, and screening hedges and vines installed around the booster station and transformer. The Project includes the replacement of three existing Carob trees near the site determined by the City's Park Superintendent to be in poor health with recommended compatible Coast Live Oak trees. The booster station will be accessed from Mt. Rubidoux Drive via a driveway consisting of compacted decomposed granite paving.

Rubidoux and Mary Evans Booster Stations: The existing, above-grade Rubidoux Booster Station (1966) is enclosed along the Mount Rubidoux pedestrian trail. Station facilities will be removed, and approximately 500 linear feet (LF) of cast iron pipeline within Mt. Rubidoux Drive from the booster station to approximately 9th Street will be cut, capped, and abandoned in place per industry standards. After removal, the space will be restored to match the natural setting of its surrounding environment.

The existing, below-grade Mary Evans Booster Station (2005) is located within a subterranean vault in the existing roadway right-of-way the Beacon Way. This vault and equipment will be removed, the space backfilled, and the affected roadway repaved per the City's Public Works Standard No. 453.

New Pipeline: To consolidate the three pressure zones and support the operation of the new Mission Inn Booster Station, existing pipeline will need to be replaced and new pipe laid.

Approximately 1,900 LF of existing, inadequate 4- and 6-inch diameter cast iron water mains (1940-1966) within the existing Rubidoux 1066 pressure zone will be replaced with 8-inch diameter ductile iron pipe within 9th Street and Miramonte Place. The proposed project will construct new subterranean pipelines to connect the proposed Mission Inn Booster Station with the eastern Mt. Rubidoux base and Indian Hill systems utilizing discharge pipeline, suction pipeline, and ductile iron pipeline and involving the streets of Mt. Rubidoux Drive, Mission Inn Avenue, Redwood Drive, 5th Street, 9th Street, Indian Hill Road, and Glenwood Drive. The new 8- and 12-inch diameter discharge pipeline (2,200 LF), the new 12-inch diameter suction pipeline (750 LF), and new 12-inch diameter ductile iron pipeline (400 LF) total approximately 3,350 LF of new pipeline, and with the 8-inch diameter ductile iron pipe (1,900 LF), the project totals 5,250 LF of pipe. Areas of new and replacement pipeline installation will be backfilled, compacted, and repaved.

VI. PROJECT ANALYSIS:

Compliance with Section 20.25.050 of the City of Riverside Municipal Code:

The Mission Booster Station Installation & Pressure Rezoning Project is located, scaled, and designed so as to not adversely affect the orientation, setting, and feeling of the various existing sites and adjacent cultural resources. The Mission Inn Booster station will be constructed with similar massing, elements, details, and compatible but modern materials including faux stone and wrought iron. Removal of the Rubidoux and Mary Evans booster stations will be done in such a way as to restore the respective settings to the existing surrounding environments, abandoned pipe will be cut, capped and left in place and new pipeline installation will be done using minimally intrusive methods as well as protecting and restoring important adjacent features, materials, and setting.

General Plan/Specific Plan/Zoning Conformance

General Plan: The proposed project is consistent with the existing General Plan land use designation for the project sites because it maintains the existing use of the properties.

Zoning: The property is zoned PF - Public Facilities and R-1-7000 Single Family Residential Zones. Although the proposed project is exempt from the Zoning Code, it is consistent with the existing code as it maintains existing use, the 480-square-foot Mission Inn Booster Station is within the allowable limit under Title 19 and meets all height, landscaping, and screening requirements, and is within setback requirements with the exception of the southern property line as the building will extend into the public right-of-way of Mount Rubidoux Drive.

VII. PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS:

Public notices were mailed to property owners adjacent to the various project component sites, including Loring Park, the Rubidoux and Mary Evans Booster Stations, and the extent of pipeline replacement or installation activities, at least twenty (20) days prior to the scheduled hearing. No responses have been received to date.

VIII. EXHIBITS:

1. Location Map
2. Zoning Map
3. Historic District Maps
4. Cultural Resources Maps
5. Cultural Resources Report
6. Mitigated Negative Declaration

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Case Number: P16-0877

MEETING DATE: March 15, 2017

General Conditions

1. The project must be complete per the Cultural Heritage Board's approval, including all conditions listed below. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Board or the Cultural Heritage Board staff. Upon completion of the project, a Cultural Heritage Board staff inspection must be requested to ensure that the approved plans have been executed and that all conditions have been implemented before **FINAL INSPECTION** hold can be released.
2. There is a ten (10) day appeal period that will lapse at 5:00 p.m. on March 25, 2017. Appeals of the Board's action will not be accepted after this time. Appeal processing and fee information may be obtained from the Community & Economic Development Department, Planning Division, Public Information Section, 3rd Floor, City Hall.
3. This approval will expire in one year on March 15, 2018.

Specific Conditions of Approval

4. Applicant shall obtain approval, as necessary, to acquire park land under the Park Protection Act and any other required permits or approvals.
5. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall revise plans to include setback measurements on site plan and the height and name of SCADA pole on antennae and mast detail.
6. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall revise plans to include the proposed transformer and existing Mount Rubidoux and Mary Evans Booster Stations, including locations, dimensions, and features.
7. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall revise plans to include the location and extent of all proposed pipeline work.
8. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall revise plan detail drawings to indicate and state the type, material, function, and dimensions of all intake and exhaust fans/grille openings and doors on the Mission Inn Booster Station.
9. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall revise plans to indicate means and methods to protect in place the historic stone wall along Mount Rubidoux Drive and retained mature trees in Loring Park during construction activities to the satisfaction of and approval by Cultural Heritage Board staff.

10. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall revise plans to correctly indicate species and number of trees to be removed.
11. Plantings shall be consistent with the Mount Rubidoux Historic District Guidelines. The applicant shall work with Cultural Heritage Board staff on final selection and approval of shrubs, vines, and grasses to avoid an inappropriate or excessively colorful look.
12. Proposed lighting fixtures shall be appropriate to the natural and historic setting. The applicant shall submit design or a product information sheet or manufacturer's brochure showing the proposed outdoor lighting fixtures to Cultural Heritage Board staff for approval prior to fabrication or purchase and installation.
13. The SCADA pole shall be painted either gray to blend with the Mission Inn Booster Station or brown and/or green to blend with the natural vegetation of Loring Park.
14. The granting of this request shall in no way exclude or excuse compliance with all other applicable rules and regulations in effect at the time this permit is exercised.

APPEAL INFORMATION:

The Board's decision or any conditions of approval can be appealed by the applicant or any interested person. To appeal this decision, submit a letter stating what you wish to appeal and why, the General Application form, and the corresponding appeal fee. The Community & Economic Development Department offers a packet on filing an appeal that you might find helpful. Appeals may be delivered in person or mailed, but they must be received by March 25, 2017 at 5:00 p.m. ten (10) days following approval of this case. The Community & Economic Development Department's address is:

City of Riverside
Community & Economic Development Department
Planning Division
3900 Main Street, 3rd Floor
Riverside, CA 92522

Appeals will be considered by the Land Use Committee of the City Council at their next available meeting.

G:\CHB\2017 CHB\03-15-17\P16-0877 Mission Inn Booster COA\P16-0877_jen.docx
Jennifer Mermilliod