

Planning Commission Memorandum

Community & Economic Development Department

Planning Division

3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522 | Phone: (951) 826-5371 | RiversideCA.gov

PLANNING COMMISSION HEARING DATE: SEPTEMBER 21, 2017

AGENDA ITEM NO.: 7

PROPOSED PROJECT

Case Numbers	P16-0112 (General Plan Amendment), P16-0113 (Rezone), P16-0114 (Tract Map 37032), P16-0111 (Planned Residential Development and Design Review), and P16-0883 (Variances)		
Request	To consider the following entitlements for a 54-lot Planned Residential Development on 6.85 acres: 1) a General Plan Amendment to change the land use designation from B/OP – Business/Office Park to MDR – Medium Density Residential, 2) a Zoning Code Amendment to change the zone from PF – Public Facilities Zone to R-1-7000 – Single-Family Residential Zone; 3) a Tract Map No. 37032 to subdivide two contiguous parcels into a 54 residential lots; 4) a Planned Residential Development and Design Review for 54 single-family detached residences; and 5) Variances to allow fences and walls higher than permitted by Code and to allow reduced setbacks for the project perimeter.		
Applicant	Steve Berzansky of Steven Walker Communities, Inc.		
Project Location	9170 Indiana Avenue, situated on the south side of Indiana Avenue between Gibson Street and Jackson Street		
APN	233-180-007 and 233-170-001	The state of the s	
Project area	6.85 acres		
Ward	5		
Neighborhood	Arlington South	1 marked	
Specific Plan	None	A CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY OF TH	
General Plan Designation	B/OP - Business/Office Park	To the state of th	
Zoning Designation	PF - Public Facilities	NONTH	
Staff Planner	Stephanie Tang, Senior Planner; 951-826-3965; stang@riversideca.gov		

RECOMMENDATIONS

Staff recommends that the City Planning Commission:

- RECOMMEND that the City Council DETERMINE the proposed project will not have a significant effect on the environment and is recommending that a Mitigated Negative Declaration be adopted pursuant to Section 15074 of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines; and ADOPT the Mitigation, Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) pursuant to CEQA Section 15097 and California Public Resources Code 21081.6; and
- RECOMMEND APPROVAL of Planning Cases P16-0112 (General Plan Amendment), P16-0113 (Rezone), P16-0114 (Tract Map No. 37032), P16-0111 (Planned Residential Development and Design Review), and P16-0883 (Variances) based on the findings outlined in the staff report and summarized in the attached findings and subject to the recommended conditions.

SITE BACKGROUND

The site consists of two contiguous parcels, totaling 6.85 acres. It was historically used for agricultural purposes from the 1940s to early 1960s. Hawthorne Elementary School occupied the site from 1961 to 2008. The Superior Court of California, County of Riverside used the site for the overflow of court hearings (civil jury trials) in the school classrooms from approximately 2010 to 2012. The existing Hawthorne Elementary School is currently vacant.

Surrounding land uses include residential development to the north, across Indiana Avenue, and east; the Burlington Northern Santa Fe (BNSF) railroad tracks, and Upper Riverside Canal to the south; and vacant, undeveloped parcels to the west.

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to subdivide the property into 54 residential lots to develop a gated planned residential development (PRD) consisting of detached single-family residences, two lots for common open space, and an internal circular private street with on street guest parking. The existing vacant Hawthorne Elementary School will be demolished as part of this project. In order to facilitate this project, the applicant is requesting approval of a General Plan Amendment to change the land use designation from B/OP – Business/Office Park to MDR – Medium Density Residential, Zoning Code Amendment to change the zone from PF – Public Facilities Zone to R-1-7000 – Single-Family Residential Zone, and Variances to allow fences and walls higher than permitted by Code and to allow reduced setbacks for the project perimeter.

The residences will be two-stories with a maximum height of 28 feet on lots ranging in size from 2,853 square feet to 5,434 square feet. Three architectural styles (Craftsman, Monterey, or Spanish Colonial) are proposed with varying building modulations and rooflines for each of the three floor plans. The residences will range in size from 1,835 to 2,107 square feet and consist of up to four bedrooms, 2 ½ baths, kitchen, living room, great room/family room, laundry room, and a two-car garage.

The project includes 48,907 square feet of common open space at the central and southern portion of the site, which includes a paseo, walkways, play field area, shade structures, barbeque

grills, picnic tables, park benches, and a tot lot. Additionally, each residential lot includes at least 660 square feet of private backyard.

This development will be gated and secured by a combination of wrought iron fence and block wall. Primary access to the site is provided from Indiana Avenue and an emergency secondary access is provided on the northwest portion of the site along Indiana Avenue. A total of 22 on-street guest parking spaces are provided on one side of the private street.

The project would install four landscaped basins located on each side of the entrance to the site, the northwestern portion of the site, and on the southern boundary of the site.

PROJECT ANALYSIS

TRACT MAP

The proposed map design can be supported as it will allow development of this irregular shaped site with a small lot infill subdivision and a residential density generally consistent with existing subdivisions and PRDs in the surrounding area. Further, the proposed lot sizes are consistent with the PRD provisions of the Zoning Code. Additionally, a PRD consisting of detached single-family residences with attached garages will be compatible with existing PRDs and conventional subdivisions in the vicinity. Lastly, adequate street access is provided via Indiana Avenue and an internal, circular private street for all residential lots, and common and private open space is provided in compliance with the Code. All lettered lots shown on the subdivision map will be required to be maintained by a Home Owner's Association (HOA).

PLANNED RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT CONSIDERATIONS

Density Bonus

The proposed PRD consisting of 54 single-family residences on 6.85 acres yields a density of 7.88 dwelling units per acre. In the R-1-7000 – Single-Family Residential Zone, a PRD qualifies for a maximum density bonus up to 10 percent which would result in 8.0 dwellings per gross acre. A bonus less than the maximum density may be granted based on compliance with this criteria:

- 1. The property is well served by public infrastructure;
- 2. The project enjoys good access to public services, including schools, shopping and public and semipublic facilities;
- 3. The site is located on streets capable of accommodating the anticipated traffic. A traffic study may be required to assess consistency with Policy CCM 2.3 of the General Plan to maintain LOS "D" or better on arterial streets or greater, except where LOS "E" has been designated as an acceptable standard;
- 4. The project complies with the purpose and standards of this Chapter, demonstrates substantial compliance with the provisions of the Citywide Design and Sign Guidelines, and is in accordance with City Codes, which may include deviations by variances when required findings are made. Additional criteria used in evaluating the design of the project shall include, but shall not be limited to, the following:

- a. Varied placement of buildings demonstrating sensitivity to the natural topographic features of the site;
- b. Relatively level land is set aside for active recreational pursuits;
- c. Open space is distributed on the site and accessible to all units;
- d. An efficient circulation system consisting of both vehicular lanes and pedestrian walkways;
- e. Sensitivity to surrounding community and attention to the edge conditions, creating areas of transition from surrounding existing development to the proposed development; and
- f. Where front porches are consistent with the style of the development, a minimum of two-thirds (2/3) of the total units shall provide front porches.
- 5. The project proposes development in an environmentally and topographically sensitive manner in order to minimize the impacts of development on adjacent properties, and is designed in a manner that is compatible with the adjacent and existing development in the vicinity;
- 6. The project provides amenities in compliance with this chapter, and that the amenities are consistent with the size and scale of the project, the project density, and neighborhood characteristics.

The proposed PRD meets the criteria required to qualify for a density bonus of 8 percent or 7.88 dwelling units per gross acre based on the following: The site is relatively flat and does not contain environmentally or natural topographic features. The proposed development will be served by existing infrastructure along Indiana Avenue and is located in an area with good access to schools, shopping, and other public services. The project is required to restripe Indiana Avenue and include left turn pockets to accommodate the anticipated traffic along this arterial. The PRD contains an efficient circulation system as the residential lots have been clustered around an internal, circular private street with primary access from Indiana Avenue. A paseo and sidewalk is provided for residents to access on-site recreational amenities as well as to Indiana Avenue. Common open space with recreational amenities consistent with the size and scale of this project is provided along the central and southern portion of the site. All residences will include a private backyard and the majority of the residences will include a porch. Based on the above, staff can support the proposed PRD density bonus.

Authorization and Compliance Summary			
	Consistent	Inconsistent	
General Plan 2025 The proposed project will be consistent with the proposed land use designation of MDR – Medium Density Residential and will be under the maximum density of 8 dwelling units per acre with a PRD in this land use designation. The proposed General Plan Amendment from B/OP – Business/Office Park to MDR – Medium Density Residential will further the intent of the General Plan by facilitating in-fill development, while directly addressing the City's housing needs consistent with Objective H-2 and Policy LU-8.1. Further, the project will continue the single-family residential development pattern in the Arlington South neighborhood consistent with Objective LU-40 and Policy LU-40.4. Lastly, the proposed walls, generally along the perimeter property lines and along Indiana Avenue, will comply with the City's Noise/Land Use Compatibility Criteria, Title 24, and Title 7 of the Municipal Code consistent with General Plan 2025 Objective N-1,			
and Policies N-1.1 through N-1.3. Subdivision Code (Title 18) The proposed project meets the development standards outlined in Chapter 18.210 of the Subdivision Code including private street and guest parking standards. The proposed lot depths and widths are subject to the PRD standards. Staff has reviewed the project plans and determined the proposed lot depth and width of each residential lot are appropriate for this PRD.	V		
The proposed Zoning Code Amendment to rezone the site from PF – Public Facilities Zone to R-1-7000 – Single-Family Residential Zone is consistent with the residential zones to the north, east, and south and will be consistent with the proposed MDR – Medium Density Residential General Plan land use designation. A PRD in the R-1-7000 Zone allows a density bonus of 10 percent for a maximum of 8.0 dwelling units per acre. A reduced bonus may be considered based on the degree the project meets the criteria in Table 19.780.050.B.2 of the Zoning Code. This PRD proposes a density of 7.88 dwelling units per acre, equivalent to a density bonus of 8 percent. Since this project complies with the criteria for bonus density, an 8 percent bonus can be considered. In addition, the project generally meets the standards for PRD and the R-1-7000 Zone, except for Variances requested to allow fences and walls higher than permitted by Code and reduced setbacks for the project perimeter.	V		

Compliance with Citywide Design & Sign Guidelines The project provides a diversity of single-family residential housing in three distinct architectural styles with varying building modulations, building materials, and rooflines. Enhanced architectural features are provided on the rear and/or side facades of the residences where visible from Indiana Avenue, BNSF railway, and the internal circular private street. Additionally, the conceptual landscape plan has been designed to provide an attractive and welcoming environment and provide visual buffers between land uses. The proposed project substantially meets the objectives of the Citywide Design & Sign Guidelines, subject to the recommended conditions of approval detailed below.	V	
conditions of approval detailed below.		

COMPLIANCE WITH APPLICABLE DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

Chapter 19.780.050 – Planned Residential Development for R-1-7000 Zone				
Standard		Proposed	Consistent	Inconsistent
Max Density	8.0 dwelling units / acre	7.88 dwelling units / acre (8% Bonus)	\checkmark	
Minimum Setback – Perimeter Property	Indiana Avenue - 20 feet	10 to 22 feet		
	Adjacent to Perimeter Property Lines - 20 feet	12.9 to 27.9 feet		
Minimum Setback – Project Boundaries	Front Yard Setback - 10 feet	10 to 18 feet	V	
	Side Yard Setback - 5 feet	4.5 to 24.4 feet		
	Rear Yard Setback - 10 feet	15 to 27.9 feet	\checkmark	
Minimum Wall Setback (Indiana Avenue)	20 feet	5 feet		V
Minimum Landscape Setback (Indiana Avenue)	20 feet	5 feet		M
Minimum Parking	2 fully enclosed garage spaces / dwelling unit	2 fully enclosed garage spaces per residence	\checkmark	
Minimum Guest Parking Spaces	1 guest space / 3 unit Total Required: 18 guest spaces	22 guest spaces		
Open Space	Common: 500 square feet / unit Total Required: 27,000 square feet	48,907 square feet		
	Private: 200 square feet minimum per unit	660 to 2,735 square feet per unit	\checkmark	

R-1-7000 – Single-Family Residential Standards Chapter 19.100 – Residential Zones and Chapter 19.550 – Fences, Walls, and Landscape Materials				
Standard		Proposed	Consistent	Inconsistent
Maximum Building Height	35 feet	24.3 to 28 feet	\checkmark	
Number of Stories	2 stories	2 stories	\checkmark	
Maximum Fence and Wall Height	Front - 3 feet	5 to 8.8 feet		
	Sides and Rear - 6 feet	Sides – 8 to 10.8 feet		\checkmark
		Rear - 8 to 10 feet		

Modification:

Section 19.780.060.B.2 of the Zoning Code allows for the modification of development standards specific to front, side, and rear yard setback in conjunction with a PRD. The following modification has been requested for this project, and justifications for the modification are discussed below.

Side Yard Setback

The PRD requires a 5-foot side yard setback within the project boundaries. However, setbacks within the project boundaries may be modified with the PRD. The proposed 4 ½ foot setback constitutes a 10 percent reduction from the required setback and allows the site to be developed with a private street that meets the minimum street width requirement and an ample paseo that connects to the large open space in the rear of the site. The modified side yard setback also allows the residences along the east and west sides of the site to have rear yards that meet the minimum perimeter setback requirement. Furthermore, the proposed reduced setback will continue to provide adequate separation between the proposed residences and adjacent single-family residences to the east of the site. For these reasons, staff is supportive of the modification of the side yard setback along the interior residential lots.

VARIANCES

Variances have been requested by the applicant to allow reduced building setbacks along Indiana Avenue and the south perimeter property line for three of the 54 residential lots, reduced landscape and wall setback along Indiana Avenue, and fences and walls to be higher than permitted by Code for implementation of the proposed PRD. The applicant has provided variance justification findings in support of the variance requests. Staff has also prepared supplemental justification findings in support of the variances. Overall, staff can support the variances because the site is designed in a manner that clusters the development towards Indiana Avenue providing increased separation from the BNSF railway, provides noise attenuation from traffic and train noises, and provides adequate separation from existing single-family residences to the east.

DESIGN REVIEW

Site Plan

The proposed residential lots are sited in a manner that is sensitive to and compatible with existing surrounding single-family residences and separated from the BNSF railway. Adequate access and circulation will be provided via Indiana Avenue and the internal private street. Pedestrian access generally do not conflict with the guest parking spaces, except for the crosswalk connecting to the sidewalk adjacent to Lot 16. Thus, staff has conditioned the guest parking space in front of Lot 16 be relocated to avoid conflicts with the crosswalk. Staff generally supports the overall site plan as it is a logical development pattern given the site's proximity to the railroad tracks and separation from existing single-family residences. Staff supports the site plan as it has been designed to comply with the development standards and design guidelines for a PRD, except for the requested variances as previously discussed.

Conceptual Landscape

Proposed landscaped areas along the paseo and open play field area provide opportunities for residents and visitors to gather and interact outdoors. The proposed landscaped setback and parkway along the project's frontage include Jacaranda trees, turf, and Chinese Flame trees flanking the entrance to the site. In order to further soften views of the split face block wall along the street frontage, staff recommends a condition of approval requiring a combination of shrubs, accent plants and trees be planted along the street frontage to create a layered effect and provide visual interest. Additionally, a separate condition of approval is recommended to plant fast growing vines along the southern (rear) perimeter wall and to train them to grow through small openings at the base of the wall to address the potential for graffiti. Overall, the proposed landscaping will provide an attractive and welcoming environment and provide visual buffers between land uses. For these reasons, staff supports the conceptual landscape plan.

Fences and Walls

The conceptual fence and wall plan includes wrought iron fence at the primary and secondary entrances and block walls, ranging in height from 5 feet to 10 feet along the perimeter of the site. This project proposes varying wall height based on the recommendation in the Noise Study to attenuate noise for the project. The applicant has agreed to provide decorative pilasters along the Indiana Avenue frontage to break the massing of the wall. However, as plans do not specify the type of block walls, staff recommends requiring a decorative masonry split face wall with decorative cap and pilasters along the Indiana Avenue frontage, and split face block walls with decorative cap along the west and east sides of the property.

In addition, retaining walls, ranging from 0.5 to 2.8 feet, are proposed along portions of the east and west boundaries of the site and the Indiana Avenue frontage to provide proper drainage onto the water quality basins in the rear and project frontage. Staff recommends the retaining walls match the materials of the block walls along the sides and front of the project site. With the recommended conditions of approval, staff supports the conceptual fence and wall plan.

NEIGHBORHOOD COMPATIBILITY

The project, as proposed, is compatible with the surrounding single-family residential development patterns along Indiana Avenue and within the Arlington South neighborhood. The proposed density is similar to the density of nearby PRDs. The enhanced architectural features of residences

along the front and sides will ensure high quality design compatible with the existing neighborhood. The site has been designed to cluster residences around the internal, private street creating a greater buffer to single-family residences to the east and provide adequate separation from the BNSF railway.

In summary, staff supports the proposed project because it is consistent with the intent, goals, and policies of the General Plan 2025. Furthermore, the project, as conditioned and mitigated, will be compatible with surrounding uses.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

A Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) has been prepared for this project in accordance with Section 15074 of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines. The CEQA documentation states the proposed project will not have a significant effect on the environment, subject to implementation of the MMRP.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Public hearing notices were mailed to property owners within 300 feet of the site. Pursuant to CEQA, a 20-day review and comment period was provided from August 25, 2017 to September 13, 2017. Additionally, an ad was published in the Press Enterprise. During this period, staff received written comments from the South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) regarding this project related to the health risk assessment (HRA) and proposed mitigation measures, and provided guidance on siting residences near a freeway or railway.

Since the project is located within the SCAQMD recommended distance to State Route 91 (SR-91) freeway and railway, an HRA was prepared. The HRA concluded that the project will not add any toxic air contaminants nor increase the health risk levels above existing conditions.

APPEAL INFORMATION

Actions by the City Planning Commission, including any environmental finding, may be appealed to the City Council within ten calendar days after the decision. Appeal filing and processing information may be obtained from the Community & Economic Development Department, Public Information Section, 3rd Floor, City Hall.

EXHIBITS LIST

- 1. Findings
- 2. Staff Recommended Conditions of Approval
- 3. Aerial Photo/Location
- 4. Existing/Proposed General Plan Map
- 5. Existing/Proposed Zoning Map
- 6. Project Plans (Tract Map/Grading Plan, Cross Sections, Site Plan, Floor Plans, Building Elevations, Open Space, Conceptual Landscape Plan, Fence an Wall Plan, Common Maintenance Dedications, Color and Material Sample Sheet)
- 7. Applicant Prepared Variance Justifications
- 8. CEQA Document (Mitigated Negative Declaration)
- 9. Comment Letter
- 10. Existing Site Photos

Prepared by: Stephanie Tang, Senior Planner

Reviewed by: Ted White, Deputy Director of Community & Economic Development Department Approved by: Rafael Guzman, Director of Community & Economic Development Department



COMMUNITY & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

PLANNING DIVISION

EXHIBIT 1 – Findings

PLANNING CASES: P16-0112 (General Plan Amendment)

P16-0113 (Rezone)

P16-0114 (Tract Map 37032)

P16-0111 (Planned Residential Development and Design Review)

P16-0883 (Variances)

Rezone:

- A. That the proposed Zoning Code Amendment is generally consistent with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan;
- B. That the proposed Zoning Code Amendment will not adversely affect surrounding properties; and
- C. That the proposed Zoning Code Amendment promotes health, safety, and general welfare and serves the goals and purposes of the Zoning Code.

Requested Variances:

Variance A: To allow reduced building setbacks along Indiana Avenue and adjacent to the south (rear) perimeter property line.

Variance B: To allow 5-foot landscaped and wall setbacks along Indiana Avenue where 20 feet is required.

Variance C: To allow fences and walls higher than permitted by Code.

1. The strict application of the provisions of the Zoning Regulations would result in practical difficulties or unnecessary hardships in the development of this property.

Variance A: The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. Strict application of the PRD standards for R-1-7000 Zones would require 20-foot building setback along Indiana Avenue and along the perimeter property lines. The intent of the required setback is to provide adequate separation and privacy from existing development; thus, avoid land use incompatibilities. In this instance, the project meets all setback requirements except for three of the 54 residential lots - Lots1, 9, and 21.

Lots 1 and 21 are located at the northeast and northwest corner of the site, respectively. Both lots meet the minimum 5-foot side yard setback within the project boundaries of the PRD. However, Lots 1 and 21 are located adjacent to Indiana Avenue, which require a 20-foot setback. Given that the setbacks of Lots 1 and 21 typically would meet the side yard setback within the project boundaries, requiring a 20-foot setback would result in unnecessary hardships. Lot 9 is an irregular shaped lot located at the southeast (rear) portion of the site. Lot 9 is setback 12.9 feet from the perimeter property line shared with the Riverside Upper Canal. The proposed setback is adequate as land use development is not likely along the canal.

As such, staff can support the requested variance based on the provisions of the Zoning Regulations that would result in practical difficulties or unnecessary hardships in the development of this property.

Variance B: The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. Strict application of the PRD standards for R-1-7000 Zones would require a 20-foot landscape and wall setbacks along the project's frontage. The combination of proposed 5-foot landscape setback and 5-foot parkway, and location of walls and fences are generally compatible with the existing character of the neighborhood. Additionally, constructing the wall 5 feet from Indiana Avenue will provide sufficient noise barrier for the residences within close proximity to the arterial and SR-91 freeway. Landscaping along the street frontage has been conditioned to consist of shrubs, accent plants and trees to create a layered effect and therefore soften the massing of the wall. As such, the reduced landscape, fence and wall setback along Indiana Avenue will not be perceived as intrusive and out of character and provisions of the Zoning Regulations would result in practical difficulties or unnecessary hardships in the development of this property.

Variance C: The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. Strict application of the PRD standards for R-1-7000 Zones would allow up to 3-foot high solid walls in the front yard setback and 6-foot high solid walls along the sides and rear yards. The project proposes up to 11-foot high fences and walls including up to 2.8 feet of retaining wall. Although the proposed walls would exceed the maximum allowable height, they are a result of the recommendations in the Noise Study prepared for this project due to its proximity to the BNSF railway, SR-91 freeway, and Indiana Avenue and to provide proper drainage to water quality basins in the rear and project frontage. A combined 10-foot landscape setback and parkway along Indiana Avenue are proposed to help soften the massing of the proposed wall from public right-of-way.

Additionally, a 5-foot wrought iron fence and gate are proposed at the primary and secondary entrances along Indiana Avenue for security purposes. Similar to the block wall, landscaping is proposed in front of the fence at the primary entrance to soften views from the street. The wrought iron gate at the secondary entrance is proposed at the property line to be accessible by emergency vehicles only.

For these reasons, restricting the wall heights would pose practical difficulties for the project to achieve noise attenuation, proper drainage, and security for a safe living environment for future residences.

2. There are exceptional circumstances or conditions applicable to this property or to the intended use or development of this property which do not apply generally to other property in the same zone or neighborhood.

Variance A: The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. This property is unique in that it is an irregular shaped lot in close proximity to the BNSF railway, SR-91 freeway, and an 88-foot arterial (Indiana Avenue). Given the proximity to the BNSF railway, the proposed residences are substantially setback from the railroad tracks to minimize noise impacts to the residences.

Lots 1 and 21 are located at the northeast and northwest corner of the site, respectively. Both lots meet the minimum 5-foot side yard setback requirements in the PRD standards for R-1-7000 Zones. However, Lots 1 and 21 are located adjacent to Indiana Avenue, which require a 20-foot setback. Additionally, these lots are located adjacent to perimeter property lines which also require a 20-foot setback. Given that the setbacks of Lots 1 and 21 typically would meet the PRD standards if they were not located adjacent to a street and/or perimeter property

line, the layout of the residences will be consistent with the overall character of the PRD. The residences proposed along the east perimeter property line will be setback at least 20 feet from adjacent sensitive land uses thereby providing sufficient setback while allowing a greater private open space for the resident's enjoyment.

Lot 9 is an irregular shaped lot located at the southeast portion of the site. Lot 9 is setback 12.9 feet from the perimeter property line shared with the Riverside Upper Canal. The proposed setback from the Riverside Upper Canal is adequate as land use development is not likely along the canal necessitating a greater setback.

Therefore, there are exceptional circumstances applicable to this property, specifically to Lots 1, 9, and 21 given the PRD standards for setbacks along the street and perimeter property lines which do not apply generally to other properties in the same zone or neighborhood. Staff believes the applicant has designed the project to take into account compatibility with adjacent single-family zoned properties to the east and has provided the minimum 20-foot setback along the east perimeter property line. Additionally, staff believes the applicant has designed the project to take into account the noise and land use compatibility to future residences given the separation from the BNSF railway and noise mitigation measures noted in the MMRP.

Variance B: The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. The proposed landscape setback, parkway, walls and fences are generally compatible with the existing character of the neighborhood. Additionally, the wall provides sufficient noise barrier for the residence within close proximity to Indiana Avenue and SR-91 freeway. Therefore, there are exceptional circumstances applicable to this property or to the intended use or development of this property which do not apply generally to other property in the same zone or neighborhood.

Variance C: The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. The site is situated immediately adjacent to the BNSF railway and 255 feet from SR-91 freeway. Given the proximity to the BNSF railway and the potential noise impacts to future residences, individual residential lots are setback at least 50 feet from the railway. A Noise Study was conducted as part of the MND which concluded potential operational noise impacts and recommended noise barriers to mitigate noise impacts. The project proposes the recommended wall heights based on the mitigation measures outlined in the Noise Study to attenuate noise levels in compliance with the City's Noise/Land Use Compatibility Criteria, Title 24, and Title 7 of the Municipal Code and to be consistent with General Plan 2025 Objective N-1, Policies N-1.1 through N-1.3. Additionally, retaining walls up to 2.8 feet are proposed along portions of the east and west boundaries of the site and the Indiana Avenue frontage to provide proper drainage onto the water quality basins. Therefore, there are exceptional circumstances applicable to this property or to the intended use or development of this property which do not apply generally to other property in the same zone or neighborhood.

3. The granting of this request will not prove materially detrimental to the public welfare or injurious to the property or improvements in the neighborhood in which the property is located.

Variance A: The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. The proposed residences along the east and west perimeter property line (including Lots 1 and 21) will be setback at least 20 feet from adjacent land uses thereby providing sufficient setback while allowing a greater private open space for the resident's enjoyment.

Lot 9 is setback 12.9 feet from the perimeter property line with the Riverside Upper Canal abutting the same perimeter property line. Staff has determined the setback from the Riverside

Upper Canal is sufficient as land use development is not likely along the canal necessitating a greater setback. Therefore, no detrimental effect is to be expected with the approval of this request.

Variance B: The proposal complies with this finding. The project exhibits design qualities and features that will make it desirable and beneficial to the future residences and neighborhood. The reduced landscaped area and encroachment of the wall within the 20-foot setback along Indiana Avenue is provided given the 50-foot plus setback of the PRD from the BNSF railway. The proposed landscaped area along the project's frontage will be conditioned to incorporate shrubs, accent plants and trees to provide an aesthetic streetscape along Indiana Avenue as well as soften the massing of the proposed wall from public right-of-way. The block wall, as conditioned, will be architecturally compatible with the style of the residences and will replace the existing chain link fence. The reduced landscaped area along Indiana Avenue allows greater common open space area for the residences in the PRD. The residences and visitors will be able to enjoy 48,907 square feet of common open space area where 27,000 square feet is required thus providing greater opportunities for social gatherings and passive and active recreational amenities. Additionally, each residential lot includes at least 660 square feet of private backyard where 200 square feet is required. Based on the above, staff can support the requested variance as no detrimental effect is expected with the approval of this request.

Variance C: The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. The proposed fence and wall heights will result in a compatible land use in an area subject to traffic and train noise impacts, and proper drainage, thereby creating a livable and enhanced quality of life as residents and visitors are able to enjoy recreational activities in both common and private open space areas. By incorporating the noise-reducing design features (walls), the project will comply with the City's Noise/Land Use Compatibility Criteria, Title 24, and Title 7 of the Municipal Code. Additionally, the proposed wall will serve as a safety barrier for residences who play or gather around the open common areas adjacent to the BNSF railroad tracks. Therefore, no detrimental effect is to be expected with the approval of this request.

4. The granting of this request will not be contrary to the objectives of the General Plan.

Variances A through C: The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. The proposed setback reduction along Indiana Avenue, the south (rear) project perimeter, reduced landscape and wall setback will uphold the objectives and policies of the General Plan 2025. Specifically, the proposal will provide a diversity of single-family residential housing and product types within existing single-family neighborhoods and along established transportation corridors consistent with General Plan 2025 Objective H-2, Policy LU-8.1, and Policy LU-40.4. The exceedance in fence and wall heights will comply with the City's Noise/Land Use Compatibility Criteria, Title 24, and Title 7 of the Municipal Code consistent with General Plan 2025 Objective N-1, Policies N-1.1 through N-1.3.

PLANNING DIVISION

EXHIBIT 2 – STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS & GENERAL INFORMATION NOTES

PLANNING CASES: P16-0112 (General Plan Amendment)

P16-0113 (Rezone)

P16-0114 (Tract Map No. 37032)

P16-0111 (Planned Residential Development and Design Review)

P16-0883 (Variances)

CONDITIONS

Planning

- 1. The property shall be developed substantially as depicted on the site plan except as modified by the approving authority and the following conditions.
- 2. All mitigation measures, as outlined in the Mitigation, Monitoring and Reporting Program in the Mitigated Negative Declaration, shall be completed in accordance with the designated schedule.
- 3. The Commission makes the necessary findings in the applicant's favor to grant the following variances. The applicant's submitted justifications, supplemented by staff's written justifications are referenced:
 - a. To allow reduced building setbacks along Indiana Avenue and adjacent to the south (rear) perimeter property line.
 - b. To allow 5-foot landscaped and wall setbacks along Indiana Avenue where 20 feet is required.
 - c. To allow fences and walls higher than permitted by Code.
- 4. *Advisory:* Signs shall be permitted in accordance with Chapter 19.620 of the Zoning Code. Any new signs shall be subject to separate review and assessment. A separate sign application, including fees and additional sets of plans, will be necessary prior to sign permit issuance.

Prior to Map Recordation:

- 5. The General Plan 2025 land use designation of MDR Medium Density Residential shall be finalized and/or adopted.
- 6. The R-1-7000 Single-Family Residential Zone shall be finalized and/or adopted.

During Construction Activities:

- 7. During all project site construction, the Construction Contractor shall limit all construction-related activities that would result in a noise disturbance to between the hours of 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m., Monday through Friday and between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. on Saturdays. No construction is permitted on Sundays or federal holidays.
- 8. The Construction Contractor shall place all stationary construction equipment so that emitted noise is directed away from sensitive receptors nearest the project site.
- 9. To reduce construction related particulate matter air quality impacts of projects, the following measures shall be required:
 - a. The generation of dust and fugitive dust shall be controlled as required by SCAQMD Rule 403;
 - b. Construction activities shall cease during period of high winds (greater than 25 mph);
 - c. Trucks hauling soil, dirt or other emissive materials shall have their loads covered with a tarp or other protective cover as determined by the City Engineer;
 - d. Sweep streets at the end of the day if visible soil material is carried onto adjacent paved public roads;
 - e. Wash off trucks and other equipment leaving the site;
 - f. Replace ground cover in disturbed areas immediately after construction; and
 - g. Keep disturbed/loose soil moist at all times.
- 10. The applicant shall be responsible for erosion and dust control during construction phases of the project.

Prior to Grading and/or Building Permit Issuance:

- 11. Tract Map 37032 shall be recorded.
- 12. A 40-scale precise grading plan shall be submitted to the Planning Division and include the following:
 - a. Hours of construction and grading activity are limited to between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. weekdays and 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Saturdays. No construction noise is permitted on Sundays or Federal Holidays;
 - b. Compliance with City adopted interim erosion control measures;
 - c. Compliance with any applicable recommendations of qualified soils engineer to minimize potential soil stability problems;
 - d. The project shall abide by the SCAQMD's Rule 403 concerning Best Management Practices for construction sites in order to reduce emissions during the construction phase. Measures may include:

- Development of a construction traffic management program that includes, but is not limited to, rerouting construction related traffic off congested streets, consolidating truck deliveries, and providing temporary dedicated turn lanes for movement of construction traffic to and from site;
- ii. Suspend all grading activities when wind speeds exceed 25 miles per hour.
- iii. Trucks hauling soil, dirt or other emissive materials shall have their loads covered with a tarp or other protective cover as determined by the City Engineer;
- iv. Sweep streets at the end of the day if visible soil material is carried onto adjacent paved public roads;
- v. Wash off trucks and other equipment leaving the site;
- vi. Replace ground cover in disturbed areas immediately after construction; and
- vii. Keep disturbed/loose soil moist at all times.
- 13. The applicant shall prepare and record a Covenants, Conditions, and Restrictions (CC&Rs) and documents creating a Homeowners Association (HOA) subject to approval of the Planning Division and City Attorney's Office. The CC&Rs/HOA shall contain the following:
 - a. Each buyer shall sign an acknowledgement that he/she has read the Constitution and By-Laws of the HOA and the CC&Rs applying to the development, including any clause pertaining to private streets and private drives.
 - b. The CC&Rs shall be irrevocably written and recorded so that the maintenance and enforcement of the on-street parking prohibition is the responsibility of the HOA for the life of the project. The CC&R shall clearly state that the HOA officers are responsible for the enforcement of the on-street parking prohibition and are personally liable for any penalties, including citations, for the failure to follow through with their responsibilities.
 - c. Mechanical maintenance and "known-down" repair of fire hydrants and street lights which meet the specifications of the Public Utilities Department along private streets shall be accomplished by either the City Public Utilities Department or applicable serving utility company, at the expense of the HOA.
 - d. The By-Laws or other appropriate document of the Homeowners' Association shall include the obligations of the Association with respect to maintenance of the private streets.
 - e. The CC&R's shall provide the City with authority to repair and/or maintain the private streets and/or appurtenances in the event the HOA fails to maintain said streets and/or appurtenances in a manner that provides adequate access at all times so that emergency and utility vehicles can service the properties contiguous or adjacent thereto. Provision shall be made in the CC&R's to enable the City to recover costs of work performed by the City in these streets. The CC&R's shall provide that the HOA grants the City the authority to enter and repair and maintain the private street in the event the HOA defaults in its maintenance responsibilities and the preservation of the public health, safety, and welfare necessitates City maintenance of the private street. Repair costs incurred by the City shall be shared, pro rata, by all parcels and collected as assessments along with County property taxes.

- f. On-street parking shall only be permitted on one side of the private street. No parking signs or red curbing shall be maintained along one side.
- g. Vehicles parked on a residential driveway shall not encroach into the sidewalk or private street.
- h. Graffiti shall be removed within 24 hours of complaint.
- i. The HOA shall maintain the basins, parkway and landscape along the project's frontage, common open space, private street, curbs, gutters, and sidewalk.
- 14. Relocate the guest parking space in front of Lot 16 to avoid conflict with the crosswalk.
- 15. Plans submitted for Plan Check review should specify the location, design and color of all domestic water meters, backflow preventers, and all on- and off-site utility cabinets subject to Planning Division and Public Utilities' review and approval. The visibility of such facilities shall be minimized and include use of the smallest preventer possible, be painted green, and consist of some form of screening including but not limited to berming, landscaping, and/or installation of a screen wall.
- 16. Landscape and Irrigation Plan: Landscape and irrigation plans shall be submitted for Planning staff approval. Design modifications may be required as deemed necessary. Separate applications and filing fees are required. The landscape plans shall demonstrate the following:
 - a. Additional landscape including shrubs, accent plants and trees shall be planted along the street frontage to create a layered effect, reduce the wall massing and to provide visual interest.
 - b. Fast growing vines shall be planted along the southern (rear) perimeter wall and to train them to grow through small openings at the base of the wall to address the potential for graffiti.
 - c. Identify driveway approaches near Lot 8, consistent with the site plan.
- 17. **Photometric/Lighting Plan:** An exterior lighting plan shall be submitted for review and approval. Photometric plans shall include the following:
 - a. A photometric study and manufacturer's cut sheets of all exterior lighting on the new buildings and within the common open space areas shall be submitted with the exterior lighting plan. All on-site lighting shall provide a minimum intensity of one foot-candle and a maximum intensity of ten foot-candles at ground level throughout the areas serving the public and used for parking, with a ratio of average light to minimum light of four to one (4:1). The light sources shall be shielded to minimize offsite glare, shall not direct light skyward and shall be directed away from adjacent properties and public right-of-ways. If lights are proposed to be mounted on buildings, down-lights shall be utilized. Light poles shall not exceed 14 feet in height, including the height of any concrete or other base material.
- 18. **Fence and Wall Plan:** Revise the submitted fence and wall plan such that the plan provided incorporates the following changes:
 - a. Provide details of the perimeter and retaining walls, showing dimensions, colors, and materials.

- b. Walls along Indiana Avenue shall be decorative masonry split face with pilasters and decorative cap.
- c. Walls along the east and west project perimeter shall be split face and decorative cap.
- d. Retaining walls shall match the materials of the block walls along the sides and front of the project site.
- e. Retaining walls shall not exceed 3 feet in height within the front yard setback and 6 feet within the side and rear yards, where not visible from the public right of way.

Prior to Release of Utilities and/or Occupancy:

19. Install the landscape and irrigation per the approved plans and submit the completed "Certificate of Substantial Completion" (Appendix C of the Water Efficient Landscaping and Irrigation Ordinance Summary and Design Manual) signed by the Designer/auditory responsible for the project. Contact Stephanie Tang, Senior Planner at (951) 826-3965 or stang@riversideca.gov to schedule the final inspection at least one week prior to needing the release of utilities.

Standard Conditions:

- 20. There is a 36 month time limit in which to satisfy the conditions and record this map. Six subsequent one-year time extensions may be granted by the Community & Economic Development Director upon request by the applicant. Application for a one-year time extension must be made prior to the expiration date of the map. No time extension may be granted for applications received after the expiration date of the map.
- 21. Planned Residential Development permits, Design Review, and Variances, related to an implementing subdivision, may be granted time extensions by the Community & Economic Development Director or their designee up to a total of six years beyond the original approval expiration date prior to issuance of any building permits. Once a building permit has been issued the planned residential development will be considered vested and time extensions are no longer needed. At the exhaustion of Community & Economic Development Director approved extensions, the original Approving or Appeal Authority following a public hearing noticed pursuant to Section 19.670.030 (Notice of Hearing for Discretionary Actions Requiring a Public Hearing), may grant one final permit extension of up to two years. A public hearing notification fee is required of the applicant in such case in addition to a time extension fee.
- 22. Within 30 days of approval of this case by the City, the developer shall execute an agreement approved by the City Attorney's Office to defend, indemnify, including reimbursement, and hold harmless the City of Riverside, its agents, officers and employees from any claim, action, or proceeding against the City of Riverside, its agents, officers, or employees to attack, set aside, void, or annul, an approval by the City's advisory agency, appeal board, or legislative body concerning this approval, which action is brought within the time period provided for in Section 66499.37 of the Government Code. The City will promptly notify the developer of any such claim; action or proceeding and the City will cooperate in the defense of the proceeding.
- 23. This project shall fully and continually comply with all applicable conditions of approval, State, Federal and local laws in effect at the time the permit is approved and exercised and which may become effective and applicable thereafter, and in accordance with the terms

- contained within the staff report and all testimony regarding this case. Failure to do so will be grounds for Code Enforcement action, revocation or further legal action.
- 24. Enumeration of the conditions herein shall not exclude or excuse compliance with all applicable rules and regulations in effect at the time this permit is exercised.

Fire

During Construction Activities:

25. Fire Department access shall be maintained during all phases of construction.

Prior to Grading and/or Building Permit Issuance:

- 26. Identification and posting of required fire lanes shall be provided as directed by the assigned Fire Inspector.
- 27. Access roadways shall be a minimum of twenty (20) feet in unobstructed width with a minimum vertical clearance of thirteen feet, six inches (13'6"). Grade differential shall not exceed twenty (20) percent.
- 28. Access roadways in excess of one hundred and fifty (150) feet in length shall be provided with a provision for turn around. Such provisions shall be of a design approved by the Fire Department.
- 29. A residential fire sprinkler system meeting National Fire Protection Association 13D is required. Attached garages are required to be protected by an automatic fire sprinkler system. Plans shall be submitted to and approved by the Fire Department prior to installation.
- 30. All required hydrants shall be in service and fire flow available prior to building permit release by the Fire Department. Violation of this requirement may result in citations that require a court appearance to be issued.

Public Utilities - Electric

Prior to Grading and/or Building Permit Issuance:

- 31. All utilities shall be satisfactorily relocated, protected and/or replaced to the specifications of the affected departments and agencies, and easements for such facilities retained as necessary.
- 32. The provision of utility easements, water, street lights and electrical underground and/or overhead facilities and fees in accordance with the rules and regulations of the appropriate surveyor.
- 33. Provisions for electrical Utility equipment to provide power to the site is the responsibility of the developer. Please make sure that all clearances are maintained and location of the equipment is approved by Utility.

Public Utilities - Water

Prior to approval of Street Improvement Plans:

34. The applicant shall cause the abandonment of the existing 4-inch water service to the property.

Prior to Map Recordation:

- 35. The applicant shall construct or cause to construct an 8-inch water main in Indiana Avenue from Jackson Street to the project's westerly boundary. Contact Water Division for specific requirements.
- 36. The applicant shall construct or cause to construct an 8-inch water main in Indiana Avenue from the project's westerly boundary to Gibson Street if the fire flow requirements of the project cannot be met. Contact Water Division for specific requirements.
- 37. Advisory: A 6-foot water easement over Lots 19, 20, and 21 extending from the westerly edge of Lot F is required.

Public Works

Prior to Grading and/or Building Permit Issuance:

- 38. A "FINAL MAP" shall be processed with the Public Works Department and recorded with the County Recorder. The "FINAL MAP" shall be prepared by a Land Surveyor or Civil Engineer authorized to practice Land Surveying in the State of California and shall comply with the State Subdivision Map Act and Title 18 of the Riverside Municipal Code. All applicable checking and recording fees are the responsibility of the applicant.
- 39. Storm Drain construction will be contingent on engineer's drainage study.
- 40. Installation of sewers and sewer laterals to serve this project to Public Works specifications. Onsite sewer mains shall be public facilities. A minimum 20-foot wide sewer easement is required for the length of the onsite sewer mains.
- 41. Lot F (Emergency Vehicle Access) to be 24 feet wide minimum to accommodate sewer and water utility.
- 42. Closure of unused driveway opening(s) along Indiana Avenue to Public Works specifications.
- 43. Deed for widening Indiana Avenue to 44 feet from monument centerline to Public Works specifications.
- 44. Installation of curb and gutter at 32 feet from monument centerline, sidewalk, and matching paving on Indiana Avenue to Public Works specifications.
- 45. Off-site improvement plans to be approved by Public Works prior to map recordation.
- 46. Full improvement of interior streets based on private residential street standards.

- 47. All security gates or facilities proposed now or in the future will be located on-site and adequate stacking space and vehicle turn-around area will have to be provided to Public Works specifications.
- 48. Project shall restripe the Indiana Avenue to include left turn pockets to serve the project and Donald Avenue as shown in Appendix E of the report (Striping Plan); plans will be reviewed by the Traffic Engineering Division during the plan-check process. Project shall provide 100% participation.
- 49. Submit to the City for review and approval, a project-specific Water Quality Management Plan (WQMP) that:
 - a. Addresses Site Design Best Management Practices (BMPs) such as minimizing impervious areas, maximizing permeability, minimizing directly connected impervious areas, creating reduced or "zero discharge" areas and conserving natural areas;
 - b. Incorporates the applicable Source Control BMPs as described in the Santa Ana River Region WQMP and provides a detailed description of their implementation;
 - c. Incorporates Treatment Control BMPs as described in the Santa Ana River Region WQMP and provides information regarding design considerations;
 - d. Describes the long-term operation and maintenance requirements of BMPs requiring long-term maintenance; and
 - e. Describes the mechanism for funding the long-term operation and maintenance of the BMPs requiring long-term maintenance.
- 50. The property owner shall record a "Covenant and Agreement" with the County-Clerk Recorder or other instrument acceptable to the City Attorney to inform future property owners of the requirement to implement the approved project-specific WQMP. Other alternative instruments for requiring implementation of the approved project-specific WQMP include: requiring the implementation of the project-specific WQMP in the Home Owners Association Conditions, Covenants and Restrictions (CC&Rs); formation of Landscape, Lighting and Maintenance Districts, Assessment Districts or Community Service Areas responsible for implementing the project-specific WQMP; or equivalent may also be considered. Alternative instruments must be approved by the City prior to the issuance of any building or grading permits.
- 51. If the project will cause land disturbance of one acre or more, it must comply with the statewide General Permit for Storm Water Discharges Associated with Construction Activity. The project applicant shall cause the approved final project-specific WQMP to be incorporated by reference or attached to the project's Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan as the Post-Construction Management Plan.
- 52. Waiver of access to Indiana Avenue from Lots 1 and 21-30.
- 53. Advisory: Home Owners Association (HOA) to be responsible for landscape maintenance along Indiana Avenue parkway frontage and entry.

Prior to Map Recordation:

- 54. A surety prepared by Public Works to be posted to guarantee the required off-site improvements.
- 55. The project is within the Southwest Riverside Drainage Area. Drainage fees to be paid prior to map recordation.
- 56. Planting of 24" Box Size Street Trees required along Indiana Avenue with root barrier along hardscapes. Typical spacing is approximately 30 feet. Street Tree Inspector will spot for planting when final grading and construction is completed.
- 57. Installation of automatic irrigation system to provide deep-root watering to trees is required.

Prior to building or grading permit closeout or the issuance of a certificate of occupancy or certificate of use, the applicant shall:

- 58. Demonstrate that all structural BMP's described in the project-specific WQMP have been constructed and installed in conformance with approved plans and specifications;
- 59. Demonstrate that applicant is prepared to implement all non-structural BMP's described in the approved project-specific WQMP; and
- 60. Demonstrate that an adequate number of copies of the approved project-specific WQMP are available for the future owners/ occupants.

Prior to final inspection:

61. The applicant shall pay the Transportation Uniform Mitigation Fee (TUMF) in accordance with the fee schedule in effect at the time of payment. If the project improvements include qualifying right-of-way dedications and/or street improvements to a TUMF regional arterial roadway as identified on the Regional System of Highways and Arterials, the developer may have the option to enter into a Credit/Reimbursement Agreement with the City and Western Riverside Council of Governments (WRCOG) to recover costs for such work based on unit costs as determined by WRCOG. The terms of the agreement shall be in accordance with the RMC Chapter 16.68 and the TUMF Administrative Plan requirements. Credit/reimbursement agreements must be fully executed prior to receiving any credit/reimbursement. An appraisal is required for credit/reimbursement of right of way dedications and credit/reimbursement of qualifying improvements requires the public bidding and payment of prevailing wages in accordance with State Law. For further assistance, please contact the Public Works Department.