



Community & Economic Development Department

Planning Division

3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522 | Phone: (951) 826-5371 | RiversideCA.gov

CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD MEETING DATE: FEBRUARY 21, 2018

AGENDA ITEM NO.: 2

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

I. CASE NUMBER(S): P17-0933

II. PROJECT SUMMARY:

- 1) **Proposal:** Certificate of Appropriateness request by Magnolia Presbyterian Church to replace the stairs and ramp on the side of the church with ADA compliant ramps at the Magnolia Presbyterian Church (City Landmark #4)
- 2) **Location:** 7200 Magnolia Avenue
- 3) **Ward:** 3
- 4) **Applicant:** Magnolia Presbyterian Church
- 5) **Case Planner:** Scott Watson, Assistant Planner

III. RECOMMENDATION:

That the Cultural Heritage Board:

1. **DETERMINE** that Planning Case P17-0933 is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per Sections 15301 of the CEQA because the project falls under the class of minor additions and alterations to historic resources; and
2. **APPROVE** Planning Case P17-0933, based on the findings summarized below, and subject to the attached conditions, thereby issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project.

IV. BACKGROUND/HISTORY:

History:

The Magnolia Presbyterian Church is designated as City Landmark #4 and is located within the Old Magnolia Avenue NCA. It was the fourth church in Riverside, formally organized on November 9, 1879. The next year, the congregation began construction on the Victorian Gothic style structure that is now the oldest church building in the city. The original church building was dedicated on April 24, 1881 and was designed and built by Riverside's pioneer architect and contractor, A.W. Boggs at a total cost of \$4500. In 1965, the church built a modern sanctuary on adjacent property at 7200 Magnolia Avenue and retained the original sanctuary as a fellowship hall.

This Victorian Gothic style church has an irregular ground plan. The building has horizontal wood siding, with concrete additions at the rear. There is a high concrete foundation with beveled wooden band above the foundation skirt. The structure has steep intersecting gable roofs with decorative brackets covered with composition roofing. Other character-defining features include asymmetry, pointed arched stain glass windows, exterior chimneys, and cornices.

V. DETAILED PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The proposed project is to remove the existing non-historic stairs and non-ADA compliant ramp along the southwest elevation of the historic church building and install a series of ADA compliant ramps and stairs. The ramp will be constructed of concrete with standard tubular steel railing, which staff is conditioning to be painted black. A small portion of the historic wood band above the skirt, approximately 6 inches by 20 feet, will be removed to allow the new ramps to abut the building.

VI. PROJECT ANALYSIS:

- **Compliance with section 20.25.050 of the City of Riverside Municipal Code:**

Staff has analyzed the proposed project in accordance with Title 20 of the Municipal Code, and the project was found to be in compliance because the proposed ramp will not be located on the façade of the building and will have limited visibility from the public right-of-way. The ramp will cause the removal of minimal historic fabric and is located so that it could be removed at a later date without an adverse effect on the historic structure. Additionally, it will not adversely affect the site development, nor the character of the historic structure.

- **Zoning Conformance:**

Zoning: The propose project does not change or modify the existing use of the facility.

VII. PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS:

Public notices were mailed to property owners adjacent to the site. As of the writing this report, no comments have been received.

IX. EXHIBITS:

1. Staff Recommended Findings
2. Staff Recommended Conditions of Approval
3. Aerial Map
4. Project Plans
5. Site Photos



EXHIBIT 1 – STAFF RECOMMENDED FINDINGS

CASE NUMBER: P17-0933

MEETING DATE: February 21, 2018

FACTS FOR FINDINGS: (From Section 20.25.050 of the Riverside Municipal Code)

The Board and Historic Preservation Officer shall make findings of the following standards when applicable to approving or denying a Certificate of Appropriateness.

FINDINGS: The application proposal is consistent or compatible with the architectural period and the character-defining elements of the historic building.

FACTS: The design is simple in nature and will not be visually intrusive. The existing original structure has a concrete foundation and concrete entry steps with simple metal railings. The new ramps and steps will use concrete and metal railings, which are compatible with the time period.

FINDING: The application proposal is compatible with existing adjacent or nearby Cultural Resources and their character-defining elements.

FACTS: The historic church is set back from the public right-of-way with an arterial access road and a deep front set back. The ramp will be located on the side of the church in an area that is enclosed by a fence and a mid-century era secondary building will limit the ramp's visibility. Because of these the project will have no impact on the Old Magnolia Avenue NCA or other nearby cultural resources.

FINDING: The colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details, height, scale, massing and methods of construction proposed are consistent with the period and/or compatible with adjacent Cultural Resources.

FACTS: Concrete steps and ramps with tubular steel railing are already in use throughout the property, therefore their use on this project is consistent with what is already present. Additionally, staff is conditioning for the railings to be painted black to match the existing enclosure fence and nearby railing.

FINDING: The proposed change does not adversely affect the context considering the following factors: grading; site development; orientation of buildings; off-street parking; landscaping; signs; street furniture; public areas; relationship of the project to its surroundings.

FACTS: The project location is already used for access with ramps and steps. Therefore, updating these means of egress to current ADA standards will not affect site development.

FINDING: The proposed change does not adversely affect an important architectural, historical, cultural or archaeological feature or features.

- FACTS:** No important architectural features will be removed as part of this project. Only a minimal amount of historic wood siding will be removed. This site has long been developed and the project will not include any extensive excavation, therefore it is unlikely for the project to impact any archaeological features.
- FINDING:** The application proposal is consistent with the Citywide Residential Historic District Design Guidelines and the separate guidelines for each Historic District.
- FACT:** The project will be located on the side of the historic church in an area that is already used for egress. It will have limited visibility, therefore it meets the principles of the Citywide guidelines.
- FINDING:** The application proposal is consistent with the Principles of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.
- FACTs:** The new ramp and stairs will allow continued use of the historic church. The design makes use of materials that are already found throughout the site, the project will be located on the side of the church which is already used for egress, and only a minimal amount of historic material will be removed. Additionally, the new ramps and railings will be of contemporary design, allowing them to be differentiated from the original structure.



EXHIBIT 2 – STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

CASE NUMBER: P17-0933

MEETING DATE: November 15, 2017

General Conditions

1. The project must be complete per the Cultural Heritage Board's approval, including all conditions listed below. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Board or the Cultural Heritage Board staff. Upon completion of the project, a Cultural Heritage Board staff inspection must be requested to ensure that the approved plans have been executed and that all conditions have been implemented.
2. Actions by the Cultural Heritage Board, including any environmental finding may be appealed. There is a ten day appeal period that will lapse at 5:00 p.m. on February 23, 2018. Appeals of the Board's action will not be accepted after this time. The appeal fee is \$2,529.00. Appeal processing information may be obtained from the Community & Economic Development Department, Planning Division, Public Information Section, 3rd Floor, City Hall, 3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522.
3. This approval will expire in one year on February 21, 2019.
4. This approval is for design concept only, and does not indicate the project has been thoroughly checked for compliance with all requirements of law. As such, it is not a substitute for the formal building permit plan check process, and other changes may be required during the plan check process.
5. The granting of this request shall in no way exclude or excuse compliance with all other applicable rules and regulations in effect at the time this permit is exercised.

Specific Conditions of Approval

6. The new tubular steel railing shall be painted black to match the existing fencing.
7. Concrete shall be gray in color without modern finishes.

APPEAL INFORMATION:

The staff's decision or any condition of approval can be appealed by the applicant or any interested person. To appeal this decision, submit a letter stating what you wish to appeal and why, the General Application form and the corresponding appeal fee. The Community & Economic Development Department offers a packet on filing an appeal that you might find helpful. Appeals may be delivered in person or mailed, but they must be received by on February 23, 2018 at 5:00 p.m. twelve days following approval of this case. The Community & Economic Development Department's address is:

City of Riverside
Community & Economic Development Department
Planning Division
3900 Main Street, 3rd Floor
Riverside, CA 92522

Appeals will be considered by the Land Use Committee of the City Council at their next available meeting.

G:\CHB\2018 CHB\02-21-18\02_P17-0933 Magnolia Presbyterian Ramp
Scott Watson