

Planning Commission Memorandum

Community & Economic Development Department

Planning Division

3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522 | Phone: (951) 826-5371 | **RiversideCA.gov**

PLANNING COMMISSION HEARING DATE: APRIL 19, 2018

AGENDA ITEM NO.:2

PROPOSED PROJECT

Case Numbers	P15-1000 (Conditional Use Perr	mit) and P16-0095 (Variance)
Request	the establishment of a church	ements: 1) Conditional Use Permit to permit in an existing single family residence and /ariance to allow a reduced rear yard
Applicant	Peter Le representing Cao Dai	Church of Riverside
Project Location	10866 Arlington Avenue	Na N
APN	149-070-023	
Project area	2.98 acres	ARLINGTON AVE ARLINGTON AVE
Ward	7	WRIGHT DR
Neighborhood	La Sierra Acres	
General Plan Designation	SRR - Semi-Rural Residential	
Zoning Designation	RR – Rural Residential Zone	NORTH
Staff Planner	Judy Egüez, Associate Planner jeguez@riversideca.gov	; 951-826-3969

RECOMMENDATIONS

Staff Recommends that the City Planning Commission:

 DETERMINE that the proposed project is exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) review pursuant to Section 15301 (Existing Facilities); and 2. **APPROVE** Planning Case P15-1000 (Conditional Use Permit) and P16-0095 (Variance), based on the findings outlined in the staff report and summarized in the attached findings and subject to the recommended conditions.

SITE BACKGROUND

The 2.98 acre property is developed with a 2,290 square foot single family residence, an attached patio cover, a 430 square foot detached garage, a 180 square foot storage unit, and a 36-foot, 6-inch tall flag pole. A canopy covering two existing recreational vehicles is located at the southwest corner of the project site and another canopy is located on the southwest side of the building. Upon surveying of this property for this CUP, it was discovered that these canopies, in addition to decorative paving and fencing are partially located outside their property lines. Additionally, the site is encumbered by a 10-foot wide by 500-foot long Riverside Public Utilities - Electric easement that runs diagonally from the northwest corner of the site to the south, containing three power poles. The remainder of the site is vacant and covered with grass. A 6-foot high wood fence has been installed along segments of the east and west property lines. A 3-foot high wood fence with chain link gates secure the site along the front property line. The site has an average natural slope of 11.28 percent and consists of a gradual slope from north to south.

The site takes access from Arlington Avenue via a shared concrete driveway on the parcel to the west and an unimproved dirt driveway on the property, located approximately 100 feet from the west property line. Surrounding uses include residences to the north, east and west and an abandoned reservoir to the south.

As a matter of information, records show that building permits were secured in 2014 to construct a 1,025 living room addition, a patio cover and a detached garage for the existing residence.

PROPOSAL

The applicant is requesting a Conditional Use Permit to permit the establishment of a church in an existing single family residence and a new surface parking lot. A Variance is also being requested to allow for a reduced rear yard setback, where the Zoning Code requires a minimum of 20-feet. The floor plan identifies 657 square feet of sanctuary area, a kitchen, meeting room, library and restrooms. The proposed church will consist of a congregation of up to 20 people.

Worship services provided include prayer session at noon and a meditation session at 6:00 p.m. on Saturday and Sunday. Approximately 5 to 10 people are anticipated during weekend prayer times. Weekday noon prayer and meditation is provided as needed, for occasions when the moon cycle does not fall on a weekend or for the passing of a family member. The church will close at 8:00 p.m., daily. The applicant has indicated that services do not include loud music or sermons over loud speakers. A small bell located inside the structure is struck once to signal the beginning of noon prayer and between chanting. The church anticipates approximately 20 to 30 members and guests to attend six events throughout the year, which include the Lunar New Year, Moon Festival, Easter, Christmas, Thanksgiving, and the Church Anniversary on July 4th.

The site will be served by 22 parking spaces accessed from a proposed improved drive aisle and driveway from Arlington Avenue. The existing shared driveway accessed from the parcel to the west will continue to provide access to the detached garage and will not be used by the general public. Other improvements to the site include a five foot wide pedestrian access along the west side of the property, relocation of one existing power pole and removal of the wood fence and gates along the front property line. No expansion of the primary structure is proposed with this request.

PROJECT ANALYSIS

Authorization and Compliance Summary				
	Consistent	Inconsistent		
General Plan 2025 The proposed project is consistent with the underlying General Plan 2025 land use designation of Semi-Rural Residential and La Sierra Acres neighborhood. This proposed church furthers the General Plan Objective LU-62 by retaining the semi-rural character of the area.	V	V		
Zoning Code Land Use Consistency (Title 19) The underlying base zone RR - Rural Residential permits the establishment of an Assembly of People - Non-Entertainment (church or religious assembly) use subject to the granting of a Conditional Use Permit and compliance with Site Location, Operation and Development Standards in Chapter 19.255 (Assemblies of People-Non-Entertainment) of the Zoning Code. With the exception of a Variance to reduce the rear yard setback, the project is consistent with development standards established in the Zoning Code. Furthermore, a church is appropriate at this location as it is located along Arlington Avenue, an arterial roadway connecting neighborhoods and business centers across the City, from east to west.	√			
Compliance with Citywide Design & Sign Guidelines The proposed project meets the objectives of the Citywide Design and Sign Guidelines. The parking lot will be setback approximately 140 feet from Arlington Avenue and enhanced with shade trees and lighting.	V			
Compliance with the Riverside County Airport Land Use Compatibility Plan The project site is located within Zone E of the 2005 Riverside Municipal Airport Land Use Compatibility Plan. Staff has determined the proposed project to be consistent with the 2005 Riverside Municipal Airport Land Use Compatibility Plan.				

COMPLIANCE WITH APPLICABLE DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

Chapter 19.255 – Assemblies of People – Non-Entertainment Development Standards				
9	Proposed	Consistent	Inconsistent	
Setback for Assemblies of People – Non-Entertainment	20 feet from property lines	9.8 feet from rear property line		\boxtimes

Chapter 19.580 – Parking and Loading Minimum Parking Requirement						
Use	Standard	Area of Main Assembly	Parking Required	Parking Provided	Consistent	Inconsistent
Assemblies of People-Non- Entertainment	1 space/30 square feet of floor area in the main assembly area	657 square feet	22 spaces	22 spaces	\boxtimes	
Total Parking				22 Spaces		

VARIANCE

The applicant is requesting a Variance to allow for a reduced rear yard setback, where the Zoning Code requires a minimum of 20-feet. Overall, staff can support the proposed variance as the existing single family residence was legally constructed 9.8 feet from the rear property line. Additionally, the existing church building at its current location is approximately 200 feet away from existing residences, which will further ensure that church activities will not impact surrounding neighbors.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This project is categorically exempt from California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15301 (Existing Facilities).

NEIGHBORHOOD COMPATIBILITY

The proposed church will be located within a residential structure that is setback approximately 500 feet from Arlington Avenue. The project provides adequate parking, ingress and egress and the project can be operated in a manner that will not be detrimental to surrounding land uses. As part of this Conditional Use Permit, off-site improvements were identified in the rear of the site including, but not limited to accessory structures, fencing, and decorative pavers. A condition of approval is recommended requiring the removal of the improvements. Based on the analysis in

this staff report and the recommended conditions of approval, neighborhood compatibility impacts are not anticipated in conjunction with this use.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Public hearing notices were mailed to property owners within 300-feet of the site. As of the writing of this report, three emails in opposition to the project and several phone calls with concerns have been received by staff. Concerns included noise related to church activities and church members parking in the neighborhood to the east. While staff is sensitive to the property owner's concerns, operational details of the church provided by the applicant indicate that the religious services do not include loud music or speakers. Additionally, the nearest residential structure is located approximately 200-feet away from the proposed church building, therefore disruption to nearby residence to the east are not anticipated.

As a matter of information, the applicant has indicated that he held a neighborhood meeting on March 31, 2018 and has walked door-to-door throughout the neighborhood to inform the residents about the proposed church operations and activities.

APPEAL INFORMATION

Actions by the City Planning Commission, including any environmental finding, may be appealed to the City Council within ten calendar days after the decision. Appeal filing and processing information may be obtained from the Planning Department Public Information Section, 3rd Floor, City Hall.

EXHIBITS LIST

- 1. Findings
- 2. Recommended Conditions of Approval
- 3. Location Map
- 4. General Plan Map
- 5. Zoning Map
- 6. Project Plans (Site Plan, Floor Plan, Conceptual Grading Plan)
- 7. Existing Site Photographs
- 8. Comment Letters

Prepared by: Judy Egüez, Associate Planner Reviewed by: Patricia Brenes, Principal Planner

Approved by: Rafael Guzman, Community & Economic Development Director



COMMUNITY & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

PLANNING DIVISION

EXHIBIT 1 – FINDINGS

PLANNING CASES: P15-1000 (Conditional Use Permit)

P16-0095 (Variance)

FINDINGS

Conditional Use Permit Findings pursuant to Chapter 19.760

- a. The proposed church is substantially compatible with other existing and proposed uses in the area, including factors relating to the nature of its location, operation, building design, site design, traffic characteristics and environmental impacts.
- b. The proposed church will not be materially detrimental to the health, safety and general welfare of the public or otherwise injurious to the environment or to the property or improvements within the area because this use would be consistent with surrounding uses and the uses does not have operational characteristics that would prove detrimental or injurious to the environment or to the property or improvements within the area.
- c. The proposed church will be consistent with the purposes of the Zoning Code and the application of any required development standards is in the furtherance of a compelling governmental interest and is the least restrictive means of furthering that compelling governmental interest.

Variances pursuant to Chapter 19.720.040

<u>Requested Variance:</u> To allow a reduced rear yard setback, where the Zoning Code requires a minimum setback of 20-feet.

- The strict application of the provisions of the Zoning Code would result in practical difficulties or unnecessary hardships inconsistent with the general purpose and intent of the Zoning Code;
 - The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. The Zoning Code requires that a church shall be setback at least 20 feet from every property line. The existing single family residence that will be used for the church was legally constructed 9.8 feet from the rear property line. In order to comply the Zoning Code, the applicant would need to demolish the existing residence and construct a new structure to use for the church. Constructing a new church building to meet the required setbacks would locate the church building closer to the existing adjacent residences. At its location now, the nearest residences are located at least 200 feet away. Thus, strict application of the Code would result in a practical difficulty or unnecessary hardship in the development of this property.
- 2. There are special circumstances or conditions applicable to the property involved or to the intended use or development of the property that do not apply generally to other property in the vicinity and under the identical zoning classification;

The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. The project site is encumbered by a ten foot wide by 500 feet long Riverside Public Utilities - Electric easement runs diagonally from the northwest corner of the site, and terminates at the northern edge of the existing structure. The existing structure was thoughtfully positioned on site, so that it did not conflict with the electrical easement. The project site is the only property in the vicinity encumbered by an electrical easement. An easement of this size constitutes an exceptional circumstances or conditions applicable to this property that do not generally apply to other property in the same zone or neighborhood.

3. The granting of such variance will not be materially detrimental to the public welfare or injurious to the property or improvements in the zone or neighborhood in which the property is located; and

The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. The granting of the variance will not affect the public welfare or the neighborhood, as the building exists as a single family residence, currently located 9.8-feet from the rear property line, and is located approximately 200 feet from the nearest residences. Such separation ensures that all proposed church activities will occur away from the neighborhood. As a result, granting the variance will not be materially detrimental to surrounding neighborhood.

4. The granting of the variance will not be contrary to the objectives of any part of the General Plan.

The proposal <u>complies</u> with this finding. Based on the scope of the requested variance, the granting of this required will not be contrary to the objectives of the General Plan 2025.



COMMUNITY & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

PLANNING DIVISION

EXHIBIT 2 – STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

Meeting Date: April 19, 2018

PLANNING CASES: P15-1000 (Conditional Use Permit)

P16-0095 (Variance)

CONDITIONS

Planning

- 1. The subject property shall be developed and operated substantially as described in the text of this report and as shown on the site plan and floor plan on file with this case except for any specific modifications that may be required by these conditions of approval.
- 2. Project site shall not be used for the storage of vehicles, and shall be cleared of all debris.
- 3. *Advisory:* Signs shall be permitted in accordance with Chapter 19.620 of the Zoning Code. Any new signs shall be subject to separate review and assessment. A separate sign application, including fees and additional sets of plans, will be necessary prior to sign permit issuance.

During Business Operations:

- 4. Existing Recreational Vehicles shall not be used as living guarters.
- 5. A copy of the Conditional Use Permit and the final Conditions of Approval shall be available at the site and presented to City staff, including the Police Department and Code Enforcement, upon request. Failure to have the latest approved conditions available upon request will be grounds for revocation.
- 6. All operations shall comply with Title 7 (Noise Control) of the Riverside Municipal Code.

Prior to Grading Permit Issuance:

- 7. A 40-scale precise grading plan shall be submitted to the Planning Division and include the following:
 - a. Hours of construction and grading activity are limited to between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. weekdays and 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Saturdays. No construction noise is permitted on Sundays or Federal Holidays;
 - b. Compliance with City adopted interim erosion control measures;
 - c. Compliance with all recommendations of the required Project specific Water Quality Management Plan;
 - d. Compliance with any applicable recommendations of qualified soils engineer to minimize potential soil stability problems; and
 - e. Include a note requiring the developer to contact Underground Service Alert at least 48 hours prior to any type of work within pipeline easement.

During Grading and Construction Activities:

- 8. During all project site construction, the Construction Contractor shall limit all construction-related activities that would result in a noise disturbance to between the hours of 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m., Monday through Friday and between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. on Saturdays. No construction is permitted on Sundays or federal holidays.
- 9. To reduce construction related particulate matter air quality impacts of projects the following measures shall be required:
 - a. The generation of dust and fugitive dust shall be controlled as required by SCAQMD Rule 403;
 - Grading activities shall cease during period of high winds (greater than 25mph);
 - c. Trucks hauling soil, dirt or other emissive materials shall have their loads covered with a tarp or other protective cover as determined by the City Engineer;
 - d. Sweep streets at the end of the day if visible soil material is carried onto adjacent paved public roads;
 - e. Wash off trucks and other equipment leaving the site;
 - f. Replace ground cover in disturbed areas immediately after construction;
 - g. Keep disturbed/loose soil moist at all times;
 - h. Enforce a 15 mile per hour speed limit on unpaved portions of the construction site.
- 10. The applicant shall be responsible for erosion and dust control during both the grading and construction phases of the project.
- 11. To reduce diesel emissions associated with construction, construction contractors shall provide temporary electricity to eliminate the need for diesel powered generators, or provide evidence that electrical hook ups at construction sites are not cost effective or feasible.

Prior to Building Permit Issuance:

- 12. All existing improvements including but not limited to accessory structures, decorative paving, and fencing outside the property boundaries shall be removed.
- 13. Submit three sets of plans depicting the preferred location for above ground utility transformer of capacity to accommodate the planned or speculative uses within the building(s) or subject site. These plans shall be reviewed and approved by the Planning Division and Public Utilities Department Electric Division prior to the issuance of a building permit. The proposed location of the transformer shall be level, within 100 feet of the customer's service point, accessible to service trucks and in a location where the transformer can be adequately screened from public view, either by buildings or landscape screening. If landscape screening is the preferred screening method, no landscaping except ground cover shall be allowed within 10 feet of the transformer. The applicant is advised to consult with the City of Riverside Public Utilities, Electrical Engineering Division, at (951)826-5489 prior to preparing these plans.
- 14. Plans submitted for Plan check review shall specify the location, design and color of all domestic water meters, backflow preventers, and all on- and off-site utility cabinets subject to Planning Division and Public Utilities' review and approval. The visibility of such facilities shall be minimized and include use of the smallest preventer possible, be painted green, and consist of some form of screening including but not limited to berming, landscaping, and/or installation of a screen wall.
- 15. **Photometric/Lighting Plan:** An exterior lighting plan shall be submitted with building permit plans review and approval. A photometric study and manufacturer's cut sheets of all exterior lighting shall be submitted with the exterior lighting plan. All on-site lighting shall provide a minimum intensity of one

foot-candle and a maximum intensity of ten foot-candles at ground level throughout the areas serving the public and used for parking, with a ratio of average light to minimum light of four to one (4:1). The light sources shall be shielded to minimize offsite glare, shall not direct light skyward and shall be directed away from adjacent properties and public right-of-ways. If lights are proposed to be mounted on buildings, down-lights shall be utilized. Light poles located within 50 feet of residentially zoned property shall not exceed 14 feet in height.

16. Landscape and Irrigation Plans shall be submitted for Design Review approval. Design modifications may be required as deemed necessary. Separate applications and filing fees are required. Landscaping and irrigation plans must be submitted prior to building permit issuance. Landscaping and irrigation shall be installed per the approved plan and a completed "Certificate of Substantial Completions" (Appendix C of the Water Efficient Landscaping and Irrigation Ordinance Summary and Design Manual) signed by the Designer/auditor responsible for the project shall be submitted to the Planning Division. Call the Case Planner to schedule a final inspection at least one week prior to needing the release of utilities.

Prior to Release of Utilities:

17. Install the landscape and irrigation per the approved plans and submit the completed "Certificate of Substantial Completion" (Appendix C of the water Efficient Landscaping and Irrigation Ordinance Summary and Design Manual) signed by the Designer/auditor responsible for the project. Contact the Case Planner to schedule the final inspection at least one week prior to needing the release of utilities.

During Construction:

- 18. The project shall comply with all existing State Water Quality Control Board and City storm water regulations, including compliance with NPDES requirements related to construction and operation measures to prevent erosion, siltation, transport or urban pollutants, and flooding.
- 19. If human remains are encountered, California Health and Safety Code Section 7050.5 states that no further disturbance shall occur until the Riverside County Coroner has made the necessary findings as to origin. Further, pursuant to California Public Resources Code Section 5097.98(b) remains shall be left in place and free from disturbance until a final decision as to the treatment and disposition has been made. If the Riverside County Coroner determines the remains to be Native American, the Native American Heritage Commission must be contacted within 24 hours. The Native American Heritage Commission must then immediately identify the "most likely descendant(s)" of receiving notification of the discovery. The most likely descendants shall then make recommendations within 48 hours, and engage in consultations concerning the treatment of the remains as provided in Public Resources Code 5097.98 and the Treatment Agreement described.

Standard Conditions

- 20. There shall be a 24-month time limit in which to commence construction of the project beginning the day following approval by the Planning Commission.
- 21. Within 30 days of approval of this case by the City, the developer shall execute an agreement approved by the City Attorney's Office to defend, indemnify, including reimbursement, and hold harmless the City of Riverside, its agents, officers and employees from any claim, action, or proceeding against the City of Riverside, its agents, officers, or employees to attack, set aside, void, or annul, an approval by the City's advisory agency, appeal board, or legislative body concerning this approval, which action is brought within the time period provided for in Section 66499.37 of the Government Code. The City will promptly notify the developer of any such claim, action or proceeding and the City will cooperate in the defense of the proceeding.

- 22. The applicant is advised that the business or use for which this Conditional Use Permit is granted cannot be legally conducted until all conditions of approval have been completed to the satisfaction of the Community & Economic Development Department, Planning Division and as approved by the Planning Commission. Upon completion of the Project, a Staff inspection must be requested, and UTILITIES will not be released until it is confirmed that the approved plans and all conditions have been implemented.
- 23. This project shall fully and continually comply with all applicable conditions of approval, State, Federal and local laws in effect at the time the permit is approved and exercised and which may become effective and applicable thereafter, and in accordance with the terms contained within the staff report and all testimony regarding this case. Failure to do so will be grounds for Code Enforcement action, revocation or further legal action.
- 24. This use permit may be modified or revoked by the City Planning Commission or the City Council should they determine that the proposed use or conditions under which it is being operated or maintained is detrimental to the public health, welfare or materially injurious to public safety, property or improvements in the vicinity or if the property is operated or maintained so as to constitute a public nuisance.
- 25. Plans shall be submitted for plan check review to assure that all required conditions have been met prior to exercising of this permit.

Building & Safety

26. The proposed project is a change in use from R-3 to A-3 occupancy and as such, the building shall be brought into compliance with all current codes related to the A-3 occupancy in accordance with CBC 3408. Plans shall show in detail how the building will be altered to comply with code to include but not be limited to the type of construction, exiting, fire resistive design when applicable, mechanical, plumbing and electrical systems, number of plumbing fixtures and accessibility.

Public Works

- 27. Deed for widening Arlington Avenue along project frontage to 55' from monument centerline to Public Works specifications.
- 28. Prior to Building Permit issuance cash payment of ½ the cost of the future landscaped median in Arlington Avenue.
- 29. Cash in lieu for Installation of curb and gutter at 43 feet from monument centerline, sidewalk and matching paving on Arlington Avenue to Public Works specifications.
- 30. Size, number and location of driveways to Public Works specifications.
- 31. Prior to issuance of a building or grading permit, the applicant shall submit to the City for review and approval, a project-specific WQMP that:
 - Addresses Site Design BMP's such as minimizing impervious areas, maximizing permeability, minimizing directly connected impervious areas, creating reduced or "zero discharge" areas and conserving natural areas;
 - b. Incorporates the applicable Source Control BMP's as described in the Santa Ana River Region WQMP and provides a detailed description of their implementation;
 - c. Incorporates Treatment Control BMP's as described in the Santa Ana River Region WQMP and provides information regarding design considerations;
 - d. Describes the long-term operation and maintenance requirements for BMP's requiring long-term maintenance; and

- e. Describes the mechanism for funding the long-term operation and maintenance of the BMP's requiring long-term maintenance.
- 32. Prior to issuance of any building or grading permits, the property owner shall record a "Covenant and Agreement" with the County-Clerk Recorder or other instrument acceptable to the City Attorney to inform future property owners of the requirement to implement the approved project-specific WQMP. Other alternative instruments for requiring implementation of the approved project-specific WQMP include: requiring the implementation of the project-specific WQMP in the Home Owners Association or Property Owners Association Conditions, Covenants and Restrictions (C,C&R's); formation of Landscape, Lighting and Maintenance Districts, Assessment Districts or Community Service Areas responsible for implementing the project-specific WQMP; or equivalent may also be considered. Alternative instruments must be approved by the City prior to the issuance of any building or grading permits.
- 33. If the project will cause land disturbance of one acre or more, it must comply with the statewide General Permit for Storm Water Discharges Associated with Construction Activity. The project applicant shall cause the approved final project-specific WQMP to be incorporated by reference or attached to the project's Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan as the Post-Construction Management Plan.
- 34. Prior to building or grading permit closeout or the issuance of a certificate of occupancy or certificate of use, the applicant shall:
 - a. Demonstrate that all structural BMP's described in the project-specific WQMP have been constructed and installed in conformance with approved plans and specifications;
 - b. Demonstrate that applicant is prepared to implement all non-structural BMP's described in the approved project-specific WQMP; and
 - c. Demonstrate that an adequate number of copies of the approved project-specific WQMP are available for the future owners/ occupants.

Fire Department

- 35. Requirements for construction shall follow the currently adopted California Building Code and California Fire Code with City of Riverside amendments.
- 36. Construction plans shall be submitted and permitted prior to construction.
- 37. Fire Department access shall be maintained during all phases of construction.
- 38. Access roadways shall be a minimum of twenty (20) feet in unobstructed width with a minimum vertical clearance of thirteen feet, six inches (13'6"). Grade differential shall not exceed twenty (20) percent. Fire access shall comply with our required turning radius.

Public Utilities - Electric

- 39. All utilities shall be satisfactorily relocated, protected and/or replaced to the specifications of the affected departments and agencies, and easements for such facilities retained as necessary.
- 40. The provision of utility easements, water, street lights and electrical underground and/or overhead facilities and fees in accordance with the rules and regulations of the appropriate surveyor
- 41. Provisions for electrical Utility equipment to provide power to the site is the responsibility of the developer. Please make sure that all clearances are maintained and location of the equipment is approved by the Utility.
- 42. Developer is responsible for all trenching, installation of conduit and sub-structures required to provide power to the site.

3. Plot existing electrical distribution facilities on the original site plan.					