



# Development Review Committee Memorandum

**Community & Economic Development Department**


3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522 | Phone: (951) 826-5371 | [RiversideCA.gov](http://RiversideCA.gov)

**Planning Division**

## PROPOSED PROJECT

**Development Review Committee Date: July 26, 2017**

**Approval Date: May 2, 2018**

Case Numbers	P17-0506 (Design Review), P17-0507 (Grading Exception), P17-0748 (Grading Exception), and P17-0749 (Variance)	
Request	To consider the following entitlements for the construction of a 346,290 square foot industrial warehouse building, consisting of 6,820 square feet of office use and 339,470 square feet of warehouse area, on two contiguous parcels and a portion of a third parcel located north of the project site, totaling 22.34 acres: 1) Design Review of project plans; 2) a Grading Exception for retaining walls higher than permitted by Code along the east and west property lines; 3) a Grading Exception for slope heights higher than permitted by Code; and 4) a Variance to allow a reduced front yard landscape setback along Marlborough Avenue.	
Applicant	Jim Guthrie of Guthrie Companies	
Project Location	750 Marlborough Avenue and 1550 Research Park Drive, situated at the eastern terminus of Marlborough Avenue and the southwestern terminus of Research Park Drive	
APN	257-030-016, 257-060-002, 257-030-042	
Project area	22.34 acres	
Ward	1	
Neighborhood	Hunter Industrial Park	
Specific Plan	Hunter Business Park – Industrial Park District	
General Plan Designation	B/OP – Business/Office Park	
Zoning Designation	BMP-SP – Business and Manufacturing Park and Specific Plan (Hunter Business Park) Overlay Zones	
Staff Planner	Candice Assadzadeh, Senior Planner; 951-826-5667; <a href="mailto:cassadzadeh@riversideca.gov">cassadzadeh@riversideca.gov</a>	

## RECOMMENDATIONS

That the Development Review Committee:

1. **DETERMINE** that this proposed project will not have a significant effect on the environment based on the findings set forth in the case record and **ADOPT** a Mitigated Negative Declaration; and **ADOPT** the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) pursuant to CEQA Section 21081.6; and
2. **APPROVE** Planning Cases P17-0506 (Design Review), P17-0507 (Grading Exception), P17-0748 (Grading Exception), and P17-0749 (Variance) based on the findings outlined in the staff report and subject to the conditions of approval.

## SITE BACKGROUND

The 22.34 acre site consists of two contiguous parcels and a portion of a third parcel located north of the project site, and is situated at the eastern terminus of Marlborough Avenue and the southwestern terminus of Research Park Drive. The project site is located at the foot of the northern portion of the Box Springs Mountain. The project site has an average natural slope of 11.62 percent, as there is an approximate 100-foot elevation difference from the Marlborough Avenue right-of-way to east property line, adjacent to the Box Springs Mountain Reserve Park. The site is undeveloped and currently consists of vegetated areas along the south and east portions of the site. A cement-lined culvert traverses directly east-west through the site. Additionally, the site encompasses an existing multi-purpose trail which extends from the southwest corner of the site to the south and east sides of the project site. Surrounding lands uses include light industrial uses to the north, the Box Springs Mountain Reserve Park to the south and east (Riverside County jurisdiction), and light industrial uses to the west.

## PROPOSAL

The applicant is requesting approval of Design Review for the construction of a 346,290 square foot industrial warehouse building, consisting of 6,820 square feet of office use and 339,470 square feet of unrefrigerated warehouse area, on two contiguous parcels and a portion of a third parcel located north of the project site. As part of this proposal, Grading Exceptions are requested for retaining walls higher than permitted by Code along the east and west property lines, and for slope heights higher than permitted by Code. Additionally, a Variance is requested to allow a reduced front yard landscape setback along Marlborough Avenue.

The proposed warehouse building is centrally located on site and oriented towards Marlborough Avenue. Building elevations reflect a modern concrete tilt-up industrial style design, which includes: a varied roof line, articulated walls, spandrel glass, score lines, and reveal lines. The proposed office space is located at the west end of the building, fronting Marlborough Avenue, and is proposed to include additional architectural enhancements such as large storefront glazing systems. Likewise, similar architectural enhancements are proposed at the west end of the building, fronting the Box Springs Mountain Reserve Park. Elevations reflect a neutral color palette comprised of various colors of gray and white. All roof mounted equipment will be fully screened from the public right-of-way, by proposed parapets. A total of 49 dock doors are proposed along the north and west sides of the building, and a total of 349 parking spaces are provided to serve this site. It is anticipated that the building will operate 24 hours a day, Monday through Sunday. No tenant has been identified at this time.

Primary vehicular access to the project site would be provided by a driveway entrance located at the eastern terminus of Marlborough Avenue, on the western border of the site. A secondary driveway entrance would be located at the northern border of the site at the southern terminus of Research Park Drive. The main freight truck entrance/exit to the proposed warehouse will be from Marlborough Avenue; the main passenger vehicle entrance will be from Research Park Drive. Vehicle parking will primarily be located in the surface parking lot, accessible from Research Park Drive, with limited vehicle parking within the secured loading dock areas. All truck parking will be located within the secured loading dock area.

A 10-foot high concrete tilt-up screen wall, painted to match the building, is proposed to be constructed north of the parking spaces located adjacent to Marlborough Avenue. The proposed wall will screen the loading activities at the thirty-four dock doors, from Marlborough Avenue. Terraced planted retaining walls are proposed along the west property line, adjacent to the Gage Canal, east of the proposed drive aisles adjacent to the Gage Canal, and south of the proposed parking stalls, between the building and the multi-purpose recreational trail. The retaining walls are proposed to be approximately 6-inches to a maximum of 24-feet, 10-inches in height and will be constructed of decorative concrete block and planted with Bougainvillea, Lantana, and Prostrate Rosemary. A 42-inch high cable rail fence is proposed to be constructed on top of a portion of the proposed retaining walls. Chain link fencing is proposed along the north and west sides of the multi-purpose recreational trail. The chain link fencing is proposed to be 4-feet in height, and placed adjacent to the trail, at the top of slope. The location of the proposed chain link fencing will provide a safety barrier for trail users. Eight foot high metal swinging gates are proposed at both of the drive aisles from Marlborough Avenue. The metal gates are proposed to secure the project site. In addition, 8-foot high metal sliding gates are proposed at the entry to the loading dock areas, for security purposes.

Furthermore, the Project proposes the enhancement and partial reconstruction of an existing 10-foot-wide multi-purpose trail, consisting of decomposed granite material. The trail extends from the southwest corner of the site to the south and east sides of the site. The trail is proposed to be graded to drain into a proposed ditch/channel that will run along the southern and eastern side of the trail for storm water protection. The multi-purpose trail is used as a fire access road, and therefore has been designed to provide a 12-foot wide clearance for fire service vehicles with a maximum slope no greater than 15 percent.

## PROJECT ANALYSIS

<i>Authorization and Compliance Summary</i>		
	Consistent	Inconsistent
<b><i>General Plan 2025</i></b>  The subject site has a General Plan Land Use designation of B/OP – Business/Office Park, which provides for industrial uses that do not create nuisances. While the General Plan provides a broad policy statement regarding goals for future development, the General Plan Land Use Designation does not contain project or use specific implementation procedures, such as: permitted uses, performance standards and development standards, which in this instance are	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

translated into parcel-specific regulations, found in the Hunter Business Park Specific Plan.		
The development is consistent with General Plan preservation of industrial land and the redevelopment of older, underutilized properties. In addition, the Project is consistent with the following objective: Objective LU-55 – Make Hunter Industrial Park into a major employment center by creating a high quality business park environment that will attract private sector investment and encourage partnerships with regional educational institutions.		
<b>Specific Plan (Hunter Business Park)</b>		
The proposed project is consistent with the purpose of the Industrial Park District of the Hunter Business Park Specific Plan which is to provide for light industrial uses, research and development facilities, administration facilities, limited types of warehousing, and wholesale operations. Warehouse uses, including wholesale distribution and manufacturing, are permitted by right in this subdistrict.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Zoning Code Land Use Consistency (Title 19)</b>		
The BMP – Business and Manufacturing Park Zone is consistent with the B/OP – Business/Office Park General Plan land use designation. The proposed warehouse is permitted in the BMP Zone subject to the approval of a Design Review. With the exception of a Variance to reduce the required front yard landscape setback, the Project is consistent with development standards established in the Zoning Code.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Grading Code Consistency (Title 17)</b>		
The project site is subject to the Hillside Grading regulations, as the average natural slope exceeds 10 percent. The Project is generally consistent with the grading standards and general requirements established in the Grading Code, except for requested Grading Exceptions to allow retaining walls higher than permitted by Code along the east and west property lines, and for slope heights higher than permitted by Code,	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>City's Adopted Good Neighbor Guidelines</b>		
The City of Riverside has adopted Good Neighbor Guidelines, primarily intended to be used for proposed warehouse distribution centers greater than 400,000 square feet in size. Although the proposed warehouse is smaller than 400,000 square feet, the Project was reviewed against the Guidelines, and it complies, as conditioned.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Compliance with Citywide Design &amp; Sign Guidelines</b>		
The site plan, building elevations, conceptual landscaping, and walls as proposed, are consistent with the applicable provisions of the Hunter Business Park Specific Plan, Development Standards and Design Guidelines (Chapter 3) and the Citywide Design and Sign	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Guidelines for new development, subject to the recommended conditions of approval.		
<b><i>Riverside County Airport Land Use Compatibility Plan</i></b>  On July 13, 2017 Riverside County Airport Land Use Commission (ALUC) determined the proposed project to be consistent with the 2014 March Air Reserve Base/Inland Port Airport Land Use Compatibility Plan.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

## COMPLIANCE WITH APPLICABLE DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

<b><i>Chapter 19.130 – Business and Manufacturing Park (BMP) Development Standards</i></b>					
<b>Standard</b>			<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Consistent</b>	<b>Inconsistent</b>
<b><i>Minimum Landscape Setback</i></b>	Front Yard	20 feet	15 feet (Marlborough Avenue)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

<b><i>Chapter 3 – Hunter Business Park Specific Plan – Industrial Park District Development Standards</i></b>					
<b>Standard</b>			<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Consistent</b>	<b>Inconsistent</b>
<b><i>Minimum Parcel Size</i></b>	5 acres		22.34 acres	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b><i>Minimum Lot Width</i></b>	300 feet		1,380 feet	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b><i>Maximum Building Site Coverage</i></b>	50 percent		35 percent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b><i>Maximum Building Height</i></b>	45 feet		42 feet, 8 inches	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b><i>Minimum Building Setbacks</i></b>	Front Yard	50 feet	185 feet (Marlborough Avenue)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Side Yard	20 feet	150 feet (Research Park Drive)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Rear Yard	20 feet	116 feet (West)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b><i>Minimum Parking Setback</i></b>	20 feet		20 feet (Marlborough Avenue)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

<b>Chapter 3 – Hunter Business Park Specific Plan – Industrial Park District</b>					
<b>Development Standards</b>					
<b>Standard</b>			<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Consistent</b>	<b>Inconsistent</b>
<b>Walls/Fences</b>	Screen Wall	Minimum 6-feet  Maximum 12-feet	10-foot high concrete tilt-up screen wall, north of the loading docks	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Loading Area	Minimum 6-feet  Maximum 12-feet	8-foot high metal sliding gates located at the entry to the loading dock areas	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Side and Rear Property Lines	Maximum 8-foot Chain Link Fence	6-foot high chain link fence along a portion of the west (side) property line	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

<b>Chapter 19.580 – Parking and Loading</b>						
<b>Primary Site Plan - Warehouse</b>						
<b>Minimum Parking</b>	<b>Use</b>	<b>Parking Ratio</b>	<b>Required Parking</b>	<b>Proposed Parking</b>	<b>Consistent</b>	<b>Inconsistent</b>
	Office 6,820 SF	1 space/250 SF	28 spaces	379 spaces	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Warehouse 339,470 SF	1 space/1,000 SF	340 spaces			
	<b>Total</b>		<b>368 spaces</b>	<b>379 spaces</b>		

<b>Chapter 19.580 – Parking and Loading</b>						
<b>Alternate Site Plan - Warehouse and Manufacturing</b>						
<b>Minimum Parking</b>	<b>Use</b>	<b>Parking Ratio</b>	<b>Required Parking</b>	<b>Proposed Parking</b>	<b>Consistent</b>	<b>Inconsistent</b>
	Office 6,820 SF	1 space/250 SF	28 spaces		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

	Warehouse 254,602 SF	1 space/ 1,000 SF	255 spaces	535 spaces		
	Manufacturing 84,867 SF	1 space/350 SF	243 spaces			
	<b>Total</b>		<b>526 spaces</b>	<b>535 spaces</b>		

## VARIANCE

A Variance has been requested by the applicant to allow a 15-foot front yard landscape setback along the north property line (Marlborough Avenue), where a 20-foot landscape setback is required by the Zoning Code. The applicant has provided variance justification findings in support of the variance request. Staff has also prepared supplemental justification findings in support of the variance. Overall, staff supports the variance as the reduced landscape setback is necessary to accommodate the proposed terraced planted retaining wall, located at the terminus of Marlborough Avenue. The proposed terraced retaining wall will be planted with Bougainvillea, Lantana, and Prostrate Rosemary, providing additional landscaping adjacent to Marlborough Avenue. Except for the 20-foot front yard landscape setback requirement, the proposed project complies with the development standards of the BMP – Business and Manufacturing Park Zone.

## GRADING EXCEPTIONS

The project site encompasses a significant grade difference from east to west, with an approximate 100-foot elevation difference. Title 17 (Grading) of the Riverside Municipal Code limits slopes having a ratio of 3.9:1 or steeper to a maximum vertical height of 20-feet and slopes having a 4:1 or flatter ratio may be up to 25-feet in vertical height. The Conceptual Grading Plan proposes slopes with a ratio of 3.9:1 or steeper, ranging from 20-feet 6-inches to 31-feet 10-inches in vertical height along the southern and eastern boundaries of the Project site, generally located behind the proposed industrial building, as well as slopes ranging from 22-feet to 26-feet in vertical height along the western boundaries of the Project site, located immediately adjacent to the Gage Canal.

Additionally, Title 17 (Grading) of the Riverside Municipal Code limits retaining walls to a maximum height of 3-feet when visible from the public right-of-way, and 6-feet in areas not visible from the public right-of-way unless an administrative exception is granted. The Project proposes the construction of terraced planted retaining walls along the west property line, adjacent to the Gage Canal, east of the proposed drive aisles adjacent to the Gage Canal, and south of the proposed parking stalls, between the building and the multi-purpose recreational trail. The retaining walls are proposed to be between approximately 6-inches to a maximum of 24-feet, 10-inches in height and will be constructed of decorative concrete block and planted with Bougainvillea, Lantana, and Prostrate Rosemary.

As such, the Applicant has provided justification findings for a Grading Exception to allow retaining walls and slope heights higher than permitted by Code to accommodate the proposed grading concept. The retaining walls will be terraced and substantially planted, thus softening the appearance of the proposed walls; furthermore, due to the unique topography of the site, the



site's location adjacent to the Box Springs Mountain Reserve Park, the site's location adjacent to the Gage Canal, and the requirement to provide for a multi-use trail easement and associated improvements, Staff supports the requested grading exception and is able to make the necessary findings, which are attached to this report.

## **DESIGN REVIEW**

Staff supports the site design and building elevations, as the site has been designed to orient the building so it does not impact the Box Springs Mountain Reserve Park. Additionally, adequate internal and external circulation will be provided for truck access and turning movement. Furthermore, the building architecture is consistent with recently constructed warehouse buildings located throughout the City, as well as Design Guidelines of the Hunter Business Park Specific Plan, and the Citywide Design and Sign Guidelines. Lastly, the proposed conceptual landscape plans exceed the minimum landscape requirements of the Zoning Code and will provide an adequate buffer between this project and the adjacent properties. In total, approximately 294,360 square feet of the Project site will be landscaped with drought-tolerant and climate appropriate trees, shrubs and ground cover. To ensure compliance with the Multiple Species Habitat Conservation Plan (MSHCP), a condition of approval is recommended requiring permanently irrigated, non-invasive, native plant species adjacent to the MSHCP Conservation Area (Box Springs Mountain Reserve Park).

## **NEIGHBORHOOD COMPATIBILITY**

The Project, as proposed, is consistent with existing industrial and warehouse uses within proximity to the subject site. The proposed warehouse building and associated site improvements have been sited for compatibility with nearby sensitive receptors, the Box Springs Mountain Reserve Park. Further, main freight truck entrance/exit to the proposed warehouse will be provided from Marlborough Avenue, an 88-foot major arterial; where as the main passenger vehicle entrance will be provided from Research Park Drive, a collector street per the General Plan 2025. As previously indicated proposed warehouses smaller than 400,000 square feet are not required to comply with the City's Good Neighbor Guidelines; however, to further ensure the project will be compatible with surrounding land uses, the project was analyzed for consistency with the Guidelines and it complies.

In summary, staff supports the proposed project because it is consistent with the intent of the B/OP General Plan land use designation, the Industrial Park District of the Hunter Business Park Specific Plan, and the underlying BMP Zone, which anticipate and permit the site to be developed with industrial uses. Furthermore, the project, as conditioned and mitigated, will be compatible with surrounding uses by providing adequate buffer between them, providing infrastructure to improve the circulation in the area, and allowing for extension of the trail system consistent with the goals and policies of the General Plan 2025.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

A Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) and Mitigation and Monitoring Reporting Program (MMRP) have been prepared for this project in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Mitigation measures related to Biological Resources, Cultural Resources, Noise, and Transportation/Traffic are recommended to reduce impacts to less than significant thresholds. It should be noted that although construction noise is exempt from compliance with Title 7- Noise Control, Mitigation Measures NOI-3 and NOI-4 require a Construction Management



Plan and Construction Noise Reduction in order to reduce construction noise at the adjacent Box Springs Mountain Reserve Park.

Pursuant to CEQA, a 20-day review and comment period was provided from January 26, 2018 to February 14, 2018. The comment period was extended to February 27, 2018 to allow additional time for review of the environmental document and technical studies. The Notice of Intent to Adopt was mailed to various Federal, State, regional, and local government agencies, as well as interested parties. Staff received a total of four comment letters, from the following interested parties:

1. Lozeau Drury, LLP, on behalf of Laborers International Union of North America, Local Union No. 1184
2. Pechanga Band of Luiseño Indians
3. South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD)
4. Law Office of K.M. Neiswender, on behalf of the Friends of Riverside Hills

Staff reviewed all submitted comments where agencies and interested parties expressed concerns regarding impacts related to aesthetics, biological resources, greenhouse gases, transportation/traffic, air quality, hydrology/water quality, and noise. Responses to the comments are attached to this report. The MND concludes that all impacts have been identified as less than significant or have been reduced to below the level of significance with mitigation. Potential impacts related to aesthetics, biological resources, greenhouse gases, air quality, and hydrology/water quality were adequately addressed in the MND; no further mitigation is necessary. The Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA) was revised to include the Columbia Business Center project, located within 0.35 miles of this site; Mitigation Measure T-2 (Fair Share Contributions - I-215 NB Ramps/E La Cadena Drive) has been added requiring fair share contributions to be paid prior to occupancy. With the implementation of Mitigation Measures T-1 and T-2 (Fair Share Contributions) both AM and PM peak hour impacts will be addressed, and therefore result in less than a significant impact after mitigation. Additionally, Mitigation Measure NOI-1 (Volume Adjustable Backup Alarms) has been added to reduce potential noise impacts to nearby sensitive receptors.

## APPEAL INFORMATION

Actions by the Development Review Committee including any environmental finding, may be appealed to the City Planning Commission within ten calendar days after the decision. Appeal filing and processing information may be obtained from the Planning Division front counter, 3rd Floor, City Hall.

## EXHIBITS LIST

1. Findings
2. Staff Recommended Conditions of Approval
3. Location Map
4. General Plan Map
5. Hunter Business Park Specific Plan/Zoning Map
6. Project Plans (Architectural Site Plan, Alternate Site Plan - Manufacturing, Floor Plan, Roof Plan, Building Elevations (Black/White and Colored), Material Sample Board, Building Sections, Fence and Wall Plan, Screen Wall Elevations, Civil Plot Plan, Preliminary Grading Plan, Retaining Wall Plan, Trail Exhibit, Grading Exceptions Exhibit, Photometric Plan, and Conceptual Landscape Plan)
7. Applicant Prepared Grading Exception and Variance Justifications
8. Existing Site Photos
9. CEQA Documents (Mitigated Negative Declaration, Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program, and Technical Studies)
10. Public Comment Letters
11. Response to Comments