



Community & Economic Development Department

Planning Division

3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522 | Phone: (951) 826-5371 | RiversideCA.gov

CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD MEETING DATE: MARCH 20, 2019
AGENDA ITEM NO: 3

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

I. CASE NUMBER(S): P18-0900

II. PROJECT SUMMARY:

- 1) **Proposal:** Certificate of Appropriateness request to construct an approximately 2,180 sq. ft. single-family residence with an attached 473 sq. ft. two-car garage and a 1,142 sq. ft. Accessory Dwelling Unit with an attached two-car 452 sq. ft. garage on a vacant lot within the Seventh Street East Historic District.
- 2) **Location:** 2470 & 2486 Mission Inn Avenue, on the southern side of Mission Inn Avenue between Park and Comer Avenues.
- 3) **Ward:** 2
- 4) **Applicant:** Jose Carcelen
- 5) **Case Planner:** Scott Watson, Associate Planner

III. RECOMMENDATION:

That the Cultural Heritage Board:

1. **DETERMINE** that Planning Case P18-0900 is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Sections 15331 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation) and 15303 (New Construction of a Single-family residence) of the CEQA Guidelines as the project falls under the class of an In-fill development that is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standard's for the Treatment of Historic Properties (Exhibit 1); and
2. **APPROVE** Planning Case P18-0900, based on the findings summarized below, and subject to the attached conditions (Exhibit 2), thereby issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project.

IV. BACKGROUND/HISTORY:

The Seventh Street East Historic District (District) includes the parcels fronting on to both sides of Mission Inn Avenue (formerly Seventh Street) between the Santa Fe Depot on the west and Kansas Avenue on the east. The District reflects a cross-section of residential architectural styles from the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, including Victorian era styles, Classical Revival, Craftsman, California Bungalow, Mission Revival, and Mediterranean Revival.

Subdivided in the mid-1880s, this District has homes that date to the 1880s.

Three City Landmarks are located in the District. These include the Ward House at 2969 Seventh Street (built in 1887 by pioneer volunteer fire chief, city councilman, and civic leader George F. Ward), the Collins-Seaton House at 2374 Seventh Street (an excellent example of Classical Revival style residential architecture), and the Exselsen House at 2110 Seventh Street (built in 1926, and one of Riverside's best examples of stone construction).

City Structure of Merit #381, burned in a fire in 2008 and subsequently demolished, previously sat on both this and the adjacent parcel (2490 Mission Inn Avenue). The Structure of Merit designation for this property no longer applies. Staff added this parcel to a list of other parcels that no longer have structures and will need to be de-designated. This will be the topic of a future Cultural Heritage Board item.

V. DETAILED PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The proposed project (Exhibit 4) at 2470 & 2486 Mission Inn Avenue includes construction of a two-story, 2,180 square foot single-family residence (primary residence) with an attached garage and a single story 1,142 square foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) with an attached garage on an 8,822 square foot vacant lot.

The two-story primary residence is generally rectangular in ground plan with a north/south orientation and will measure 26 feet – 9 inches by 65 feet – 8 inches. It will be box-like in massing with a 16 feet - 8 inches wide projection extending from the main massing of the residence to the north by 10 feet - 8 inches. The residence will front onto Mission Inn Avenue and will be setback from the street by 31 feet - 4 inches. This setback is consistent with the surrounding properties. The primary residence will feature fiber cement clapboard siding, an asphalt shingle topped gable-on-hipped roof with fascia boards, a projecting porch with a hipped pent roof and clapboard sided half-walls, and a combination dark colored vinyl windows with various types. The attached two-car garage of the primary residence will be located on the east elevation, and will not be visible from the public right-of-way.

The single story detached ADU will be located at the rear of the property and separated from the primary residence by 11 feet. The ADU will be rectangular in ground plan, measuring 47 feet - 2 inches by 37 feet - 3 inches, with an east/west orientation. It will be capped with an asphalt shingle topped crossed gable-on-hipped roof and features the same materials of the primary residence. The ADU will also feature a small centrally located porch. The attached tandem two-car garage will be visible from the public right-of-way and will give the appearance of a single car detached garage, which is common within the Seventh Street East Historic District.

The applicant did not submit a landscaping plan. Staff has included in the conditions of approval that the applicant submit a landscape plan for approval.

VI. PROJECT ANALYSIS:

- **Compliance with section 20.25.050 of the City of Riverside Municipal Code:**

The proposed project is compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of other residences within the Seventh Street East Historic District (District) (Exhibit 5). The design of the residence is compatible with architectural features that were used during the period of significance of the District and will not distract from the District's overall feel.

- **General Plan/Specific Plan/Zoning Conformance:**

The zoning for the property is R-1-700-CR (Single Family Residential, Cultural Resources Overlay Zone). Per Chapter 19.442 of the Riverside Municipal Code, Accessory Dwelling Units (ADU) are permitted with the R-1 zones providing the lot meets the minimum lot area required by the underlying zone and the maximum lot coverage is not exceeded. The proposed project meets all required setbacks for the residence and the ADU, and is less than the 40% maximum lot coverage. The ADU is less than the maximum allowable 1,200 square foot dwelling size.

- **Environmental Compliance:**

The project is categorically exempt from CEQA review pursuant to Section 15303 of the CEQA Guidelines, as the project consists of the new construction of a single-family residence and Accessory Dwelling Unit in a residential zone. Under Section 15303 (a) of the CEQA Guidelines, up to three single-family residences may be constructed under this exemption. Additionally, Section 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines stipulates that Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation projects consistent with Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment for Historic Properties are categorically exempt from CEQA review. As there is no existing building on the site and the historical resource is the Seventh Street East Historic District (District). Therefore, the Secretary of the Interior Standards are standard are applied to in-fill within a historic district (Rehabilitation Treatment). The proposed project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards when looking at District compatibility (Exhibit 1).

VII. PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS:

Public notices were mailed to property owners adjacent to the site on March 6, 2019, at least 10 days prior to the scheduled meeting. As of the writing this report, no comments have been received.

IX. EXHIBITS:

1. Staff Recommended Findings
2. Staff Recommended Conditions of Approval
3. Aerial Map
4. Project Plans
5. Site Photos



EXHIBIT 1 – STAFF RECOMMENDED FINDINGS

CASE NUMBER: P18-0900

MEETING DATE: March 20, 2019

FACTS FOR FINDINGS: (From Section 20.25.050 of the Riverside Municipal Code)

The Board and Historic Preservation Officer, or Qualified Designee, shall make findings of the following standards when applicable to approving or denying a Certificate of Appropriateness.

FINDING: The application proposal is consistent or compatible with the architectural period and the character-defining elements of the historic building.

FACTS: This finding is not applicable as the lot is currently vacant.

FINDING: The application proposal is compatible with existing adjacent or nearby Cultural Resources and their character-defining elements.

FACTS: The Seventh Street East Historic District (District) is composed of several architectural styles from the late 1800s into the early 1900s, including Victorian era style and Craftsman. The proposed project draws its influences for the Victorian era styles in simplified form and without the ornamentation generally found on the Victorian residences. The design will allow the new residence to be compatible with the neighborhood while being differentiated. The Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) will express the same character-defining features of the primary residence.

FINDING: The colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details, height, scale, massing and methods of construction proposed are consistent with the period and/or compatible with adjacent Cultural Resources.

FACTS: The proposed project will be wood-framed construction and with clapboard siding. Both buildings have an asphalt shingle topped gable-on-hipped roof. Windows will be dark colored vinyl fixed, casement, or awning windows with simulated divided lites. This will reflect the look of the time-period and architectural styles. The massing will be a two-story box-like massing compatible with the District.

FINDING: The proposed change does not adversely affect the context considering the following factors: grading; site development; orientation of buildings; off-street parking; landscaping; signs; street furniture; public areas; relationship of the project to its surroundings.

FACTS: The construction of the proposed project will not adversely affect the development of the District because it will match the orientation of the existing residences, facing onto Mission Inn Avenue. The residence and ADU will have a two car garage and therefore not affect off street parking.

- FINDING:** The proposed change does not adversely affect an important architectural, historical, cultural or archaeological feature or features.
- FACTS:** As the lot is currently vacant, there is no architectural, historical, or cultural features on this site located within a developed neighborhood. The residence previously located on the lot burned down. The proposed project is unlikely to contain any archaeological resources.
- FINDING:** The project is consistent with the Citywide Residential Historic District Design Guidelines, approved guidelines for each Historic District, and/or any other applicable Design Guidelines.
- FACTS:** The proposed project will have a similar massing to the District and surrounding neighborhood, which consists of a mix of one and two-story single residences. The façade and entry face onto Mission Inn Avenue. A progression from public to private is achieved through the use of a front lawn and porch entry. The guidelines specify that new construction must have roof forms that are consistent with the District. Hipped or gable roof with asphalt shingles are predominant in the District and are included in the proposed project.
- FINDING:** The application proposal is consistent with the Principles of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.
- FACTS:** The Principles of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards in regards to new construction focus on compatibility and differentiation. The proposed project will be a contemporary interpretation of the Victorian era styles of architecture within the District. It will make use of character defining feature of the style, including: gable-on-hipped roof; fascia boards; clapboard siding; and a projecting front porch. The residence will be differentiated from historic residences through the use of modern materials and construction techniques.



EXHIBIT 2 – STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

CASE NUMBER: P18-0900

MEETING DATE: March 20, 2019

General Conditions

1. The project must be completed, per the Cultural Heritage Board's approval, including all conditions listed below. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Board or the Cultural Heritage Board Staff. Upon completion of the project, a Cultural Heritage Board Staff inspection must be requested to ensure that the approved plans have been executed and that all conditions have been implemented.
2. If a building permit is not issued, this approval for the Certificate of Appropriateness will expire in one-year on March 20, 2020.
3. This approval for the Certificate of Appropriateness is for design concept only and does not indicate the project has been thoroughly checked for compliance with all requirements of law. As such, it is not a substitute for the formal building permit plan check process, and other changes may be required during the plan check process.
4. The granting of this Certificate of Appropriateness shall in no way exclude or excuse compliance with all other applicable rules and regulations in effect at the time this permit is exercised.

Case Specific Conditions of Approval

5. **Prior to Occupancy** - The applicant shall submit a landscaping plan and irrigation plan for review to CHB staff for review and approval.
6. Walkways and Driveways shall be gray concrete without any modern finishes or added colors.
7. Pursuant to Section 19.442.030 of the Riverside Municipal Code: A covenant shall be recorded with the Riverside County Recorder on the property, subject to approval of the Planning Division and City Attorney's Office, to restrict the property with the requirements of this section prior to issuance of a building permit for the accessory dwelling unit. This use restriction shall be binding upon any successor in ownership of the property.

APPEAL INFORMATION:

The applicant or any interested person may appeal the Board's decision or any condition of approval. To appeal this decision, a letter must be submitted stating what you wish to appeal and why, the General Application form and the corresponding appeal fee.

The Community & Economic Development Department offers a packet on filing an appeal that you might find helpful. Appeals may be delivered in person or mailed, but they must be received by April 2, 2019 at 5:00 p.m. twelve days following action on this case. The Community & Economic Development Department's address is:

City of Riverside
Community & Economic Development Department
Planning Division
3900 Main Street, 3rd Floor
Riverside, CA 92522

Appeals will be considered by the Land Use Committee of the City Council at their next available meeting.