




Community & Economic Development Department
3900 Main Street, Riverside, CA 92522 | Phone: (951) 826-5371 | RiversideCA.gov

Planning Division

CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD MEETING DATE: JANUARY 20, 2021
AGENDA ITEM NO.: 4

PROPOSED PROJECT

<i>Case Numbers</i>	DP-2020-00112 (Certificate of Appropriateness)	
<i>Request</i>	To consider a Certificate of Appropriateness for the remodel of two existing two-car garages, consisting of: 1) construction of two second story additions, totaling approximately 341 and 174 square feet, respectively; 2) construction of covered patios, totaling approximately 110 and 76 square feet; and 3) conversion of existing roof forms from a flat roof with parapet to gable roofs.	
<i>Applicant</i>	Gilbert Alcala of Alcala Architecture, on behalf of Kevin & Karen Cotterill	
<i>Project Location</i>	4455 Fifth Street, on the north side of Fifth Street between Redwood Drive and Pine Street	
<i>APN</i>	214-090-013	
<i>Ward</i>	1	
<i>Neighborhood</i>	Downtown	
<i>Historic District</i>	Colony Heights Historic District	
<i>Historic Designation</i>	District Contributor	
<i>Staff Planner</i>	Scott Watson, Historic Preservation Officer 951-826-5507 swatson@riversideca.gov	

RECOMMENDATIONS

Staff recommends that the Cultural Heritage Board:

1. **DETERMINE** that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) review pursuant to Sections 15301 (Existing Facilities) and 15331 (Historic Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation), as it constitutes rehabilitation of a historic resource that is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties; and
2. **APPROVE** Planning Case DP-2020-00112 (Certificate of Appropriateness), based on the findings outlined and summarized in the staff report and subject to the recommended conditions (Exhibit 1).

BACKGROUND

The subject property is located at 4455 Fifth Street (Exhibit 2). The 7,874 square foot subject property was developed with a two-story Spanish Colonial Revival style residence in 1932. Two detached two-car garages were constructed at the rear of the property in 1941 and 1968, respectively. In 2005, a Certificate of Appropriateness was administratively approved for the enclosure of the rear patio and remodeling of the second story of the residence.

Character-defining features of the residence include: a rectangular ground plan; an asymmetrical façade; red clay tile topped, low-pitched crossed gable roof with narrow eaves and exposed rafter tails; smooth stucco cladding; a scalloped second story overhang above the entry; a brick stoop at the entry with a recessed French style main entry door; recessed wood double-casement windows with divided lights; and a gable wall stucco chimney on the east elevation.

The residence is listed as a contributor to the Colony Heights Historic District.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the remodel of two non-original two-car garages (Exhibit 3). The project includes:

1. Conversion of the east garage to an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU), consisting of:
 - a. Garage door removal and in-fill with a stucco clad wall.
 - b. A 22-foot 2 inch by 18-foot 1 inch second story addition, with a red tile gable roof and exposed rafter tails.
 - i. The addition will be offset from the first floor by 4 feet on the east and north elevation to meet the required setback for an ADU.
 - c. A new 76 square foot patio enclosure with tile shed roof and simple wood posts.
 - d. A tile gable roof covering the portions of the first floor within the 4-foot setback area.
 - e. New vinyl framed windows with simulated divided lights, matching the color of the existing windows on the residence.
2. Modification to the west garage consist of:
 - a. Repairs to the existing garage door.
 - b. A 15-foot 8-inch by 21-foot 9-inch half-story attic space addition, with a red tile hipped roof and exposed rafter tails.
 - i. The addition will be offset from the first floor by 5 feet on east elevation to meet the setbacks for accessory buildings.
 - ii. The maximum height of proposed garage is 17 feet.
 - c. A new 110 square foot patio enclosure with tile shed roof and simple wood posts.
 - d. A tile gable roof constructed to covering the portions of the first floor within the 5-foot setback area.
 - e. New vinyl framed windows with simulated divided lights, matching the color of the existing windows on the residence.

In August 2020, the City Council adopted ADU requirements based on Section 65852.2 of the State Government Code. Title 19 allows ADUs in all residential and mixed-use zones in the City. Title 19 also requires that ADUs in an historic district comply with the State requirements and Title 20 of the Riverside Municipal Code as it relates to properties on the California Registry. While this property is not on the California Registry, the ADU addition complies with State Government Code and Title 20.

PROJECT ANALYSIS

FACTS FOR FINDINGS

Pursuant to Chapter 20.25.050 of Title 20 (Cultural Resources) of the Riverside Municipal Code, the Cultural Heritage Board and Historic Preservation Officer must make applicable findings of specific standards when approving or denying a Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff was able to make the applicable findings for *the project as follows*:

<i>Chapter 20.25.050 – Principles and Standards of Site Development and Design Review</i>			
<i>The application proposal is consistent or compatible with the architectural period and the character-defining elements of the historic building.</i>	N/A	Consistent	Inconsistent
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Facts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed project will match the character defining elements of the existing residence, including a low pitched hipped and gabled roofs with exposed rafter tails, red tile roofing, and stucco cladding. 			
<i>The application proposal is compatible with existing adjacent or nearby Cultural Resources and their character-defining elements.</i>	N/A	Consistent	Inconsistent
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Facts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Colony Heights Historic District consists of a variety of architectural styles, including Craftsman, Tudor Revival, Spanish Colonial Revival, and American Colonial Revival. Because of the varied architectural styles in the District, compatibility with Cultural Resources is obtained through compatibility with the existing residence. The proposed project will match the character defining feature of the existing residence; therefore, the proposed project will be compatible with nearby and adjacent Cultural Resources. 			
<i>The colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details, height, scale, massing and methods of construction proposed are consistent with the period and/or compatible with adjacent Cultural Resources.</i>	N/A	Consistent	Inconsistent
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Facts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed project will be compatible with the height, scale, and massing of the existing residence and adjacent Cultural Resources as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed second story additions will be lower in height than the existing two-story residence Two-story accessory buildings are common in the historic period and can be found in the historic district, including adjacent and nearby properties. The projects proposed materials, such as stucco cladding and red tile roofing will match the materials of the existing residence. The proposed windows and doors similar in design and color to the windows on the residence. 			

Chapter 20.25.050 – Principles and Standards of Site Development and Design Review			
<i>The proposed change does not adversely affect the context considering the following factors: grading; site development; orientation of buildings; off-street parking; landscaping; signs; street furniture; public areas; relationship of the project to its surroundings.</i>	N/A	Consistent	Inconsistent
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Facts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed project consists of second-story additions to existing two-car garages and is not altering the site development or its relationship to the surrounding neighborhood. The proposed project is located at the rear of the property and will have limited visibility from Fifth Street. Title 19 and Government Code Section 65852.2 do not require the replacement of off-street parking for garages converted to an ADU. 			
<i>The proposed change does not adversely affect an important architectural, historical, cultural or archaeological feature or features.</i>	N/A	Consistent	Inconsistent
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Facts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing garages were constructed in 1941 and 1968 and have no important architectural features; therefore, there will be no impact to important historic or architectural features. No grading will occur; therefore, there will be no potential for impact to archaeological features. 			
<i>The application proposal is consistent with the Citywide Residential Historic District Design Guidelines and the separate guidelines for each Historic District.</i>	N/A	Consistent	Inconsistent
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Facts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Citywide Residential Historic District Design Guidelines discourages second-story additions. The residence is two-stories in height and the proposed project will remain subordinate as suggested by the guidelines. Two-story accessory buildings can be found throughout the historic district; therefore, the proposed project will be consistent with other accessory building in the historic district. 			

<i>Chapter 20.25.050 – Principles and Standards of Site Development and Design Review</i>			
<i>The application proposal is consistent with the Principles of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.</i>	N/A	Consistent	Inconsistent
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Facts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation specify: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired. The proposed project is consistent with the Standard as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing garages are not original to the property and contain no historic material. The second-story additions will not alter the special relationships of the garage to the residence. The proposed accessory buildings will be smaller in scale, height, and massing than the existing residence. The proposed materials and architectural features will be similar to the existing residence. The accessory buildings are detached from the residence; therefore, if it were to be removed in the future, there will be no impact to the residence. 			

AUTHORIZATION AND COMPLIANCE SUMMARY

Regulatory Codes	Consistent	Inconsistent
<p><i>Historic Preservation Code Consistency (Title 20)</i></p> <p>The proposed project is consistent with Section 20.25.050 of the City of Riverside Municipal Code because the proposed accessory building is compatible with the massing, size, scale, materials, and use of architectural features of the residence.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two story accessory buildings can be found throughout the historic district. The accessory buildings will remain subordinate to the main residence. Proposed materials such as stucco cladding and tile roofing will match the existing residence. The low-pitched gable and hipped roofs of the proposed additions will match the residence. 	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The second-story additions to existing accessory buildings are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and therefore is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), pursuant to Sections 15301 (Existing Facilities) and 15331 (Historic Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation) of the CEQA Guidelines.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Public notices were mailed to property owners adjacent to the site. As of the writing this report, staff received one phone call in opposition and one email in support of the project.

APPEAL INFORMATION

Actions by the Cultural Heritage Board, including any environmental finding, may be appealed to the Land Use, Sustainability and Resilience Committee (formerly the Land Use Committee) within ten calendar days after the decision. Appeal filing and processing information may be obtained from the Planning Division by calling 951-826-5371.

EXHIBITS LIST

1. Staff Recommended Conditions of Approval
2. Aerial Photo/Location
3. Project Plans (Site Plan, Floor Plan, Roof Plan, Proposed Elevations, Renderings)
4. Site Photos

Prepared by:	Scott Watson, Historic Preservation Officer
Reviewed by:	David Murray, Principal Planner
Approved by:	Mary Kopaskie-Brown, City Planner



CITY OF RIVERSIDE

COMMUNITY & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT PLANNING DIVISION

EXHIBIT 1 – STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

PLANNING CASE: DP-2020-00112

MEETING DATE: January 20, 2020

CASE SPECIFIC CONDITIONS

Prior to Release of Occupancy:

1. Upon completion of the project, a Cultural Heritage Board (CHB) staff inspection must be requested to ensure that the approved plans have been executed and that all conditions have been implemented. Contact Scott Watson at (951) 826-5507 or swatson@riversideca.gov.

GENERAL CONDITIONS

2. There is a one-year time limit in which to secure the necessary building permits required by this Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. The project must be completed in accordance with the CHB's Certificate of Appropriateness approval, including all conditions listed. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the CHB or CHB staff.
4. This approval for the Certificate of Appropriateness is for design concept only and does not indicate the project has been thoroughly checked for compliance with all requirements of law. As such, it is not a substitute for the formal building permit plan check process, and other changes may be required during the plan check process.
5. The granting of this Certificate of Appropriateness shall in no way exclude or excuse compliance with all other applicable rules and regulations in effect at the time this permit is exercised.