#### Historical Architect

4618 West Eighth Street Los Angeles, California 90005 c: 310 .874. 8783 e: taylor@historicalarchitect.com CA license number C-24087

## HISTORIC RESOURCE EVALUATION ASSESSMENT REPORT

## Project: Assessment of proposed AC Marriott hotel at 3466 Mission Inn Boulevard, Riverside CA 92501on an adjacent lot adjoining the Central Fire Station / Fire Station No. 1 structure at 3420 Mission Inn Avenue, with a planned future exterior façade rehabilitation and Adaptive Reuse project

Document issue 13 January 2021

Historical Structure Evaluation / Assessment Report for the Record with Recommendations:

>Review of the proposed Hotel design and a compatibility /differentiated evaluation of the proposed addition to the Historic District contexts as well as the Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1) structure, listed on the California Register and determined eligible for listing on the National Register; >Evaluations of character-defining features with recommendations for significance;

>Commentary and Recommendations on the proposed Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1) façade future rehabilitation and preservation plan;

>Review of Conformance with the City of Riverside's Downtown Specific Plan, Mission Inn Historic District & Seventh Street Historic District;

>Context Review of the proposed Hotel Addition from a compatibility and differentiation viewpoint.

#### Subject:

Site context and archive reviews; Design Development concept reviews of the proposed hotel structure addition to the local Historic Districts and to the adjacent structure listed on the California Register.

#### Introduction Summary:

A new hotel proposed by Greens Group Inc. for a two-hotel property AC Marriott/Residence Inn has the challenge of a modernist design set within two historic districts: Seventh Street Historic District and the Mission Inn Historic District. These districts include a series of significant structures, both period revival style and mid-century modern, that form this immediate context. Two of the Mid-Century Modern styled structures in these districts are the 1965 Public Library and the 1957 Central Fire Station (Fire Station Number 1). Both structures were designed by the same firm, Moise, Harbach and Hewlett. Both structures are designated as Non-Contributors to these Historic Districts as they were constructed outside of the defined period of significance. Fire Station #1 is considered individually significant by its listing on the California Register, and eligibility for listing on the National Register.

This Assessment follows the environmental review approach of overlaying CEQA's Class 32 Urban Infill Exemption, with the Class 31 Historic Resource Exemption for a qualified Secretary of the Interior's Standards Rehabilitation of the Fire Station Number 1. Rehabilitation of exterior façades and finishes and a theoretic reversibility of the adjacent proposed Two-Hotel project would conform to these Secretary's Standards.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 2/71



Left: Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, Planning submittal; Right: DPR 523-B form recorded 20 February 2013 by Historic Resources Group.

Context aerial view of project site plan; Lemon street at left and Lime Street at right. New Fire Station is to the south east of the site The Riverside Downtown Specific Plan (November 2002) is the Planning document which sets guidelines for design and review of this property and proposed development. The Downtown Specific Plan incorporates the language of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards in Section 15.5.1. Recommended actions are to pursue a project solution that limits impacts on the defined historical cultural resources present, in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA.)

Following in this Assessment is a Design Development project stage analysis of significant character-defining architectural and historical cultural resource features present in the Fire Station #1 that have informed the design character of the proposed Hotel construction. A central theme of this Assessment is this proposed addition to a historic structure and also an addition within two overlapping historic districts. Referencing the <u>Secretary of the Interiors'</u> <u>Standards for Rehabilitation</u> and <u>Preservation Brief 14</u>, <u>New Exterior Additions to Historic Buildings</u>, <u>Preservation Concerns</u> are considered to be applicable to both structure and district.

This Assessment Report incorporates a Historical Architectural review of the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn hotel. Project scope includes a qualified Rehabilitation and plans for a future adaptive reuse of the former Central Fire Station structure, Riverside's Fire Station #1 listed on the California Register of Historic Places in 2008. This proposed hotel development on the adjacent surface parking lot to the west will effectively become an addition to the Fire Station #1 by its immediate adjacency. There will be minimal alterations to the exterior Mission Inn Avenue (north) façade, the Lime Street (east façade), and the southern alley façade between Lime street and Lemon Street. The Lemon Street (west) façade will be concealed by the proposed construction. Interior scope of work for an adaptive reuse project will be subject of a future project.

It should be kept in mind that the pre-construction, preliminary nature of the design as of the date of this Assessment precludes an exact definition of final details for construction and finishes. Interior portions of the Fire Station #1 adaptive reuse are not a part of the present

Modern Historical Architecture

 $\begin{array}{c} \mbox{Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:} \\ \mbox{AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA} \\ \mbox{Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page $3/71$} \end{array}$ 

submittal. Detail sheets in the forthcoming Construction Document phases will be instrumental to indicate the incorporation of recommendations contained within this Assessment. This will provide a more complete description and understanding of how the Rehabilitation- definition project goals and requirements may be implemented into the final construction product.



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study;

Context view of north-western façade. Station point is approximately 20' above grade. Lemon street at right, Fire Station No. 1 at far left



GTL | MHA, August 2019 photograph of Cultural Heritage Board member's collection of the original architect's presentation drawing; Perspective view of Character-defining primary exterior façade, from northeast corner showing the intersecting spatial volumes, open apparatus door and projected second floor volume on piloti; hose drying tower partially visible behind.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 4/71

The Fire Station Number 1 structure is an early example of a mid-century modern, "International Style" design with a generally intact façade and composition design. Architects Moise, Harbach and Hewlett were also the architects of the 1965 Riverside Public Library one block west.

A summary history and observations from research and at the site is provided in Section 6 with a listing of significant character-defining attributes of the exterior façades with implementation recommendations. Review of the previous historical assessment of the Fire Station No. 1 and the City of Riverside Downtown Specific Plan (issued November 2002, through Amendment Six in May 2017) are incorporated within this document by reference.

Riverside's Community & Economic Development Department, Planning Division - Historic Preservation Team has asked Greens Group Inc. and the project team to study the proposed design and to provide especially:

A restoration/preservation plan for the façade and an analysis that explains how the new building is compatible with but differentiated from the historic façade.

We consider a consistency with this proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn hotel development in relation to the California Register-listed structure and the two historic district contexts has similar prerequisites of compatibility and differentiation.



First and Second Floor Plans, Riverside Central Fire Station, architect Bolton Caldwell Moise Jr, AIA

## George Taylor Louden AIA, inc.

Historical Architect Historical Architecture/Design Consulting

#### Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 5/71

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS INDEX

Title Page> One-Page Summary

1> REGULATORY DATA EXCERPTS: Summaries of applicable sections of the Federal Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, California State Historical Building Code; guidelines for establishing standards for new construction in historic district context by the California State Office of Historic Preservation, and the City of Riverside Municipal Code and Downtown Specific Plan.

**2>** CITY OF RIVERSIDE DOWNTOWN SPECIFIC PLAN: Relevant excerpts from the Plan, with assessments of compliance or conformance;

**3>** PRIOR DOCUMENTATIONS: Summary of previous Historical Assessments, meeting memoranda and recommended Period of Significance;

**4>** EXISTING CONDITIONS/ARCHITECTURAL SUMMARY: Existing Architectural summary and site conditions summary;

**5>** ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE: Summary of primary conveyance of significance, referencing CEQA criteria and previous Historical Assessments;

**6>** CHARACTER-DEFINING FEATURES: Assessment of character-defining elements of design, materiality, and cultural resources present in the Fire Station No. 1 façade;

7> CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDED APPROACHES: Concluding recommendations and considerations for a compatible design of the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn hotel, including façade rehabilitation of the Mid-Century Modern- International Style Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1) façade.

8> Appendices
A1 GTL | MHA photographs of existing Fire Station #1 conditions and site context;
A2 Reference sources;
A3 Reference sited & Author's qualifications

A3 References cited & Author's qualifications.

#### Client:

Mr. Atman Kadakia Managing Principal Greens Group, Inc. 9289 Research Drive Irvine, CA 92618 <u>Atman.kadakia@greens.com</u> 949, 322, 1760 Mr. Andrew Walcker President Overland Development Company 2161 St. Lawrence Street Riverside, CA 92504 Andrew@Overland Dev Co 909, 227, 4180

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 6/71

## 1 REGULATORY DATA EXCERPTS

Following are summaries of applicable sections of the Federal Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, guidelines for establishing standards for new construction in historic district context by the California State Office of Historic Preservation, and the City of Riverside Municipal Code and Downtown Specific Plan.

## • <u>1.1</u> Secretary of the Interior's Rehabilitation standards for Project Approach:

The City of Riverside Municipal Code requires in Section 20.25.050, item G that Staff shall make findings of the following standards, specifically:

### The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 7/71

• <u>1.2</u> Summary of guidelines for associated historical features of a qualified historical building resource structures in a historic district by the California Historical Building Code (CHBC):

There is direction given at the State level, especially within California's State Historical Building Code (SHBC.) In Section 8-1003, "Site Relations' there is language that states the relevance of a structure with its historical site context. "Associated features" of a district are referenced, as a "critical" component of a criteria that defines a historic district. As a Certified Local Government, the City of Riverside establishes specific guidelines contained within Riverside's Downtown Specific Plan and pertaining to the Raincross District to determine the criteria for designation and for appropriate additions to a district, without compromising a district's character. These guidelines reference and support the Secretary's Standards.

#### CHAPTER 8-10

## QUALIFIED HISTORICAL DISTRICTS, SITES AND OPEN SPACES

#### SECTION 8-1001 PURPOSE AND SCOPE

**8-1001.1 Purpose.** The purpose of this chapter is to provide regulations for the preservation, rehabilitation, restoration and reconstruction of associated historical features of qualified historical buildings, properties or districts (as defined in Chapter 8-2), and for which Chapters 8-3 through 8-9 of the CHBC may not apply.

**8-1001.2 Scope.** This chapter applies to the associated historical features of qualified historical buildings or properties such as historical districts that are beyond the buildings themselves which include, but are not limited to, natural features and designed site and landscape plans with natural and man-made landscape elements that support their function and aesthetics. This may include, but will not be limited to:

- Site plan layout configurations and relationships (pedestrian, equestrian and vehicular site circulation, topographical grades and drainage, and use areas).
- Landscape elements (plant materials, site structures other than the qualified historical building, bridges and their associated structures, lighting, water features, art ornamentation, and pedestrian, equestrian and vehicular surfaces).
- Functional elements (utility placement, erosion control and environmental mitigation measures).

#### SECTION 8-1002 APPLICATION

**8-1002.1** The CHBC shall apply to all sites and districts and their features associated with qualified historical buildings or qualified historical districts as outlined in 8-1001.2 Scope.

**8-1002.2** Where the application of regular code may impact the associated features of qualified historical properties beyond their footprints, by work performed secondarily, those impacts shall also be covered by the CHBC.

**8-1002.3** This chapter shall be applied for all issues regarding code compliance or other standard or regulation as they affect the purpose of this chapter.

**8-1002.4** The application of any code or building standard shall not unduly restrict the use of a qualified historical building or property that is otherwise permitted pursuant to Chapter 8-3 and the intent of the *State Historical Building Code*, Section 18956.

#### SECTION 8-1003 SITE RELATIONS

The relationship between a building or property and its site, or the associated features of a district (including qualified historical landscape), site, objects and their features are critical components that may be one of the criteria for these buildings and properties to be qualified under the CHBC. The CHBC recognizes the importance of these relationships. This chapter shall be used to provide context sensitive solutions for treatment of qualified historical buildings, properties, district or their associated historical features, or when work to be performed secondarily impacts the associated historical features of a qualified historical building or property.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 8/71

• <u>1.3</u> Summary of guidelines for new additions to resource structures in a historic district, provided by the California Office of Historic Preservation

Excerpts from SHPO (State Historic Preservation Office) agency considerations:

• There has been additional direction provided at the State level by Tim Brandt, the Supervisor and Senior Restoration Architect of the SHPO. A conference presentation he made in August 2011 was memorialized with a power point presentation. The script for this presentation is available at:

http://ohp.parks.ca.gov/pages/1054/files/compiled%20script%20mod%201-3.pdf

#### An excerpt from Brandt's presentation text:

(highlights for emphasis in this assessment)

1.5 Applying Standards You can apply the Treatment Standards to buildings, historic districts, structures, OHP001 Module 1 - Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties landscape features, sites and environments, objects, and any attached, adjacent, <u>or related</u> <u>new construction</u>. Examples include: individual buildings such as the Buford House, a bed and breakfast, in Napa; a district such as the Sacramento Railyards; a structure such as the Golden Gate Bridge in San Francisco, the gardens and landscape around Wattles Mansion in Hollywood; building settings and environments within the boundaries of the Presidio in San Francisco...."

The treatment standards Brandt referenced would be the Rehabilitation Standards. Rehabilitation Standards support compatibility with, yet differentiation from, new construction in their interfaces with existing construction.

As these guidelines are interpretive, in our opinion it is acceptable to correlate an assessment of compatibility of new construction within a historic district, with the Standards for construction of new construction additions to historical structures. Thus, the Tim Brandt quote gives direction for how to consider compliance of new construction within historic districts as qualifying with the Secretary's Standards for Rehabilitation.

The City of Riverside provides more definitive interpretation of the broad outlines that exist within the State level of review.

## • <u>1.4</u> Excerpts of City of Riverside Municipal Code Chapter 20.25

(Refer to following Section 2 for the City of Riverside Downtown Specific Plan)

#### CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS Section 20.25.010 Certificates of Appropriateness, Generally.

A Certificate of Appropriateness is required before any person restores, rehabilitates, alters,

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 9/71

develops, constructs, demolishes, removes or changes the appearance of any designated Cultural Resource, eligible Cultural Resource, any element in a geographic Historic District (contributing and non-contributing), or, a contributing feature or contributor to a Neighborhood Conservation Area. The requirements of this Chapter are in addition to any and all other City permit requirements.

Except as set forth in section 20.25.030, Certificates of Appropriateness shall be reviewed by the Cultural Heritage Board.

Section 20.25.050 Principles and Standards of Site Development and Design Review. The Board and Historic Preservation Officer shall make findings of the following standards when applicable to approving or denying a Certificate of Appropriateness.

A. The application proposal is consistent or compatible with the architectural period and the character-defining elements of the historic building;

B. The application proposal is compatible with existing adjacent or nearby Cultural Resources and their character-defining elements;

C. The colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features, details, height, scale, massing and methods of construction proposed are consistent with the period and/or compatible with adjacent Cultural Resources;

D. The proposed change does not adversely affect the context considering the following factors: grading; site development; orientation of buildings; off-street parking; landscaping; signs; street furniture; public areas; relationship of the project to its surroundings.

E. The proposed change does not destroy or adversely affect an important architectural, historical, cultural or archaeological feature or features;F. The Citywide Residential Historic District Design Guidelines and the separate guidelines for each Historic District; and

G. The Principles of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. (Ord. 7108 §1, 2010; Ord. 6263 §1 (part), 1996)

## Section 20.25.070 Application of the State Historic Building Code.

Pursuant to the California Health and Safety Code, the Building Official may apply the State Historic Building Code in permitting repairs, alterations and additions necessary for the preservation, restoration, rehabilitation, moving, or continued use of a designated Cultural Resource. (Ord. 7108 §1, 2010; Ord. 6263 §1 (part), 1996)

• <u>**1.5**</u> Design reference for historical resources, with comment and recommendations:

In the alterations narrative preamble of The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and

Modern Historical Architecture

 $\begin{array}{l} \mbox{Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:} \\ \mbox{AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA} \\ \mbox{Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page } 10/71 \end{array}$ 

Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (1990) is stated the following:

#### Alterations / Additions to Historic Buildings

Some exterior and interior alterations to the historic building are generally needed to assure its continued use, but it is most important that such alterations do not radically change, obscure, or destroy character-defining spaces, materials, features, or finishes. Alterations may include providing additional parking space on an existing historic building site; cutting new entrances or windows on secondary elevations; inserting an additional floor; installing an entirely new mechanical system; or creating an atrium or light well. Alteration may also include the selective removal of buildings or other features of the environment that are intrusive and therefore detract from the overall historic character.

It is Recommended that the proposed addition to, and adaptive reuse of the Fire Station #1 structure conforms with this Standard of care. An addition of this proposed seven and eight-story, approximately 89-foot high structure at the northwest corner of Mission Inn Boulevard and Lemon Street is compatible with buildings defined as contributors to the local historic environment. Specifically, these building include but are not limited to the following structures:

The Walling Building (Historical name, Former First National Bank of Riverside) at the southeast corner of 3800 Main at University is a tall five story structure with a deeply projecting neoclassicalstyled cornice. Two blocks from the Walling Building to the west, the celebrated Mission Inn occupies a large urban block footprint, with building volumes composed of varying heights. The Inn is generally five and six stories in height, with projecting domes and towers in some areas equating to approximately seven to eight stories in height. New construction of the Stalder Plaza located behind G. Stanley Wilson's 1926 Stalder Building is a 74-foot-high structure of seven stories with a 94-foot high mechanical equipment area; this project was approved by Riverside's Cultural Heritage Board and Planning department in 2017. Finally, the Imperial Hardware Lofts project, a similar project type with a historical façade rehabilitation and a new adaptive reuse construction on the remainder of the site. This 68-foot-high structure of seven stories was approved by Riverside's Cultural Heritage Board in 2015.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 11/71



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study; Exterior façade. Context View from west to east

An aerial perspective view of the proposed design from the northwest. Fire Station No. 1 is at the far end; references to its two story volumetrically articulated structure continue throughout the proposed Hotel structure as a "plinth" base, replicating its brick masonry color materials.

Articulation of the proposed construction is accomplished by the second floor level pool and restaurant terrace that wraps around the northwest corner. A rooftop observation deck at the seventh floor level above provides an aerial viewpoint of the nearby historic district context with tall structure massing and tower features.

• <u>**1.6</u>** Summary of Recommended Project Approach</u>

## 1.6.1 Excerpts from the Public Resources Code:

In the Public Resources Code (PRC section 15064.5) two definitions are made that would apply to the proposed project:

"The significance of an historical resource is materially impaired when a project: Demolishes or materially alters in an adverse manner those physical characteristics of an historical resource that convey its historical significance and that justify its inclusion in, or eligibility for, inclusion in the California Register of Historical Resources;

And,

Generally, a project that follows the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings or the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 12/71

Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (1995), Weeks and Grimmer, shall be considered as mitigated to a level of less than a significant impact on the historical resource.

(The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are reproduced in Section 1.1 preceding)

As further defined in CEQA, the Public Resources Code (PRC section 21084.1) states:

"A project that may cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource is a project that may pose a significant effect on the environment."

It is Recommended that the proposed adaptive reuse and rehabilitation project would not cause a substantial adverse change in the historical significance of the resource or environment and conforms with this Standard of care. The proposed development of the two-hotel property AC Marriott/ Residence Inn does not materially alter in an adverse manner the physical characteristics of this historical resource that conveys its historical significance and that substantially justify its inclusion in the California Register of Historical Resources. There are limited character-defining features present within the interior spaces, stemming from multiple alterations of the non-public interior spaces. The rehabilitation project approach recommended for the north, east and south façades of Fire Station No. 1 is conforming with the standard of care specified in the Public Resource Code and Secretary of the Interior's Standards as referenced.

## 1.6.2 Excerpts from the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, with Recommendations:

In the preamble to the 1992 edition of the <u>Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of</u> <u>Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing</u> <u>Historic Buildings</u> (37 CFR 68) there is stated a guiding principal:

"The Standards are to be applied to specific rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility."

A current online definition of rehabilitation provided by the National Park Service is recommended to apply to the Fire Station No. 1 project:

"When repair and replacement of deteriorated features are necessary; when alterations or additions to the property are planned for a new or continued use; and when its depiction at a particular period of time is not appropriate, Rehabilitation may be considered as a treatment. Prior to undertaking work, a documentation plan for Rehabilitation should be developed."

It is Recommended that a Rehabilitation approach is considered to be the proper definition for the proposed two-hotel property AC Marriott/Residence Inn that forms an addition to the immediately adjacent Fire Station No. 1 structure, proposed to be an Adaptive Reuse retail project. The proposed alterations to the property preserve the primary character-defining features, especially the north Mission Inn Avenue and east Lime Street façades. Minor alterations to the Fire Station No. 1 exterior and the addition planned for the two-hotel property AC Marriott/Residence Inn structure proposed on the adjacent surface parking lot.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 13/71

## 1.6.3 A Recommended Adaptive Reuse Project Approach:

From <u>The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating</u> <u>Historic Buildings</u>:

#### Alterations / Additions to Historic Buildings

Some exterior and interior alterations to the historic building are generally needed to assure its continued use, but it is most important that such alterations do not radically change, obscure, or destroy character-defining spaces, materials, features or finishes.

It is Recommended that the proposed adaptive reuse project conforms with this Standard of care. It is recommended to consider that the proposed project does not consequently radically alter, change, or destroy such character defining spaces, materials, features or finishes.

Alteration may also include the selective removal of buildings or other features of the environment that are intrusive and therefore detract from the overall historic character.

It is Recommended that the proposed project approach complies with maintaining the overall historical character of the environment by retaining the north, east and south exterior façades in their entirety. The north façade represents the primary street facing façade; however, the spatial interconnectivity and interlocking volumetric compositions in the massing scheme engages the east and south facades as well. A proposed alteration of the west façade would be consequent to the construction of the proposed Hotel addition immediately adjacent. This façade includes several sun shade screens that represent character-defining features. These are recommended to be salvaged and incorporated in the proposed new Hotel at the west facing elevation of a second floor level. This loss of this façade design and limited details would not "*detract from the overall historic character*" of the property. The proposed Rehabilitation project incorporates this "selective" removal. It is recommended to consider that this approach would not result in a detraction from the overall historic character-defining, significant features represented by the original west façade, with no modifications to the three other façades. The Fire Station No. 1 interior spaces are subject of a future Adaptive Reuse development.

It is Recommended that the proposed Rehabilitation project approach complies with maintaining the overall historical character of the existing façade structure and site context. The design provides a compatible new use for the Fire Station No. 1 structure as a continued use for ground floor retail spaces, incorporating new "creative office" spaces above the first floor level.

The following sections document the details qualifying these conclusions.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 14/71

## 2 CITY OF RIVERSIDE DOWNTOWN SPECIFIC PLAN: Excerpts from the Plan with comments

## **<u>2.1</u>** Summary of selected quotes (in *Italics*) from the *Specific Plan* goals:

The Downtown Specific Plan is a critical document for understanding the City review of projects within the defined boundaries. It is recommended that the project design conform to the overall goals, and specific recommendations for building design within the Seventh Street Historic District and the Mission Inn Historic District. As the Secretary of the Interior's Standards are referenced within the Plan and form the basis of the Plan's development and detail, conformance with the Plan is consistent with a project definition of CEQA compliance.

November, 2002 GP-004-012 Adopted by Ordinance No. 6638

11-12-02 Ordinance No. 6641 11-19-02 Resolution No. 20323

12-10-02 Revised to Include Amendments

1st Amendment P05-0123 Resolution 21034 Adopted 9-6-05 Off-Sales at Gas Stations in DSP-JC

2nd Amendment P05-0973 Resolution 21145 Adopted 3-28-06 Multi-Family Residences Above Ground Floor in DSP-RC

3rd Amendment P05-1050 Resolution 21146 Adopted 3-28-06 Restaurant Size in DSP-MSD 4th Amendment P13-0211 Resolution 22692 Adopted 5-20-14 Remove 22.5 acres from Health Care District concurrent with Adoption of Riverside Community Hospital Specific Plan

Recent Amendments that are particularly relevant to the proposed Hotel project are highlighted:

5th Amendment P16-0124 Resolution 23090 Adopted 9-27-16 Revised definition of Floor Area Ratio, maximum heights in DSP-RC, DSP-JC, and DSP-PPO, and additional amenities with CUP in DSP-RC and DSP-JC

6th Amendment P16-0854 Resolution 23175 Adopted 5-16-17 Revised uses in DSP-RC and DSP-JC which included Assemblies of People-Entertainment and Non-Entertainment, Brewery Uses, Mixed Use, and Retail Sales

#### City of Riverside Downtown Specific Plan, November 2002

Based on this Plan, Downtown will also be strengthened as a distinctive center for the citizens of Riverside with attractive streets, enjoyable public spaces, historic neighborhoods, lively mixed-use commercial areas, and a variety of housing options and residential environments.

(Page 1-3)

The proposed project is consistent with this goal. Specifically, providing "*attractive streets, enjoyable public spaces, historic neighborhoods, lively mixed-use commercial areas*...." The proposed development of Hotel use and a future opportunity for adaptive reuse/ retail uses at Fire Station No. 1 will provide the intended strengthening of the center city with "lively mixed-use commercial areas."

Downtown is also the historic, cultural and artistic center for the region with many important cultural facilities located in the heart of the Downtown, primarily along Mission Inn Avenue and Main Street. (Page 2-3)

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 15/71

The Downtown Land Use Districts are designed to provide a mix of retail, entertainment, cultural, residential, employment, and support service uses in appropriate locations in the Downtown to strengthen Downtown as the heart of the City and the Inland Empire, and create a more lively, 24- hour urban environment. (Page 2-13)

Fire Station No. 1. Specifically, providing "a mix of retail, entertainment, cultural, residential, employment, and support service uses in appropriate locations in the Downtown to strengthen Downtown as the heart of the City .... and create a more lively, 24- hour urban environment."

#### VISION FOR DOWNTOWN RIVERSIDE

• A vibrant mix of retail, residential, civic, employment, educational, cultural and arts resources in a walkable downtown environment that is part of a unique natural and historic setting;

(Page 3-5) The proposed project is consistent with this goal. Specifically, providing a "*vibrant* mix of retail, residential, civic, employment, educational, cultural and arts resources in a walkable downtown environment that is part of a unique natural and historic setting." The proposed development of Hotel use and an adjacent adaptably reused creative retail environment in a designated historic landmark will provide the intended "Vision for downtown Riverside."

## 2.1.1 Issues Summary:

#### Section 3.2, ISSUES SUMMARY

• Zoning and Development Standards - Downtown's zoning categories and related development standards <u>were</u> <u>inherited from citywide categories and standards more suited for suburban development</u>. As such, they do not deal with important, contemporary downtown potential such as mixed used, live-work concepts and shared parking or parking districts.

• Historical/Cultural - Existing zoning and development standards do not adequately address historic preservation issues

(Page 3-4)

The proposed project is consistent with this goal. Specifically, an appropriate scale and height of the proposed project conforms to an urban, and not a suburban scale of development. It should be noted that an urban policy goal is implicitly contained within the Downtown Specific Plan: the notion of a "critical mass" desired for active pedestrian environments, a "walkable" environment containing *a mix of retail, entertainment, cultural, residential, employment, and support service uses in appropriate* ways. This philosophy would appear difficult to implement with a two story or less height requirement for new construction, given the implicit character of a less dense, low-scale and quasi-suburban environment.

There are multiple examples of historically significant and recently approved new structures that exceed a two-story height (reference Section 2.1.5, page 16). Compatibility of the proposed seven and eight-story Hotel scheme with the Mission Inn, Stalder Plaza, Walling Building and the Imperial Hardware Lofts building façades and the surrounding historical urban environment would represent an appropriate scale.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 16/71

## 2.1.2 Downtown District Design Philosophy and Housing Goal:

Policy LU 1.1: Maintain the integrity of, and interrelationship between, each Downtown district as follows:

• Raincross District: The pedestrian-oriented center of Downtown, with an emphasis on an intense mixture of residential, specialty commercial, tourist, restaurant, cultural, arts, and civic uses. Design philosophy emphasizes new and infill construction that is compatible with the historic structures that give Downtown its unique identity. (Page 3-6)

The proposed project within the Raincross District is consistent with this goal. Specifically, "an emphasis on an intense mixture of residential, specialty commercial, tourist, restaurant, cultural, arts, and civic uses. Design philosophy emphasizes new and infill construction that is compatible with the historic structures...."

#### 3.4.2 Housing Goals and Policies Goal

H-1 To help Riverside's Downtown succeed as an active daytime, evening, and weekend downtown, encourage housing beyond the traditional residential neighborhoods, to include the North Main Street Specialty Services, Market Street Gateway, Raincross, Almond Street, and Prospect Place Office Districts. Policy H-1-1: Provide a variety of housing options, including medium and high density apartments and condominiums, live/work loft space, and mixed-use buildings with a residential component.

(Page 3-8)

The proposed project is consistent with this goal. Specifically: To help Riverside's Downtown succeed as an active daytime, evening, and weekend downtown, encourage housing beyond the traditional residential neighborhoods, to include the... Raincross... District." It would follow that the proposed project is fully conforming with Policy H-1-1: "Provide a variety of housing options, including medium and high density apartments and condominiums... and mixed-use buildings with a residential component."

## 2.1.3 Historic Preservation Goals:

3.4.5 Historic Preservation Goals and Policies

Goal HP-1 Strengthen and enhance the historic character of Downtown Riverside, which is unique to the Inland Empire, through the preservation and maintenance of Downtown's historically significant sites and structures. Policy HP-1-2: Promote community appreciation for the history of Riverside.

Policy HP-1-3: Provide incentives to encourage the restoration, and, if necessary, relocation of private historic structures to conserve the integrity of the buildings in the best condition possible.

Policy HP-1-4: Through design review, encourage new development to be compatible with adjacent historical structures in scale, massing, building materials, and general architectural treatment. (Page 3-10)

The proposed project is consistent with these Historic Preservation goals within Policy HP-1-4, for compatibility with "*adjacent historical structures in scale, massing, building materials, and general architectural treatment*" consequent to design review. With benefits of agency design review at early stages of the proposed project design of a new development would represent compatibility with - yet differentiated from- the adjacent historic district and structures.

The proposed project through such a preliminary agency design review resulted in a lowered Hotel building height at the northwest corner. While this alteration of building massing accomplishes an articulation of the structure to benefit the corner site context at Mission Inn Avenue and Lemon Street, a consequence was the concept of a seventh-floor level roof top "historic observation

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 17/71

deck" where informational exhibit plaques describe the surrounding notable structures. The proposed feature conforms with the Historic Preservation goal Policy HP-1-2: *Promote community appreciation for the history of Riverside*.

We recommend that the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property structure development be considered as *compatible with adjacent historical structures in scale, massing and general architectural treatment* as referenced in Policy HP-1-4.

## 2.1.4 Design Standards and Review:

5.2 PURPOSE AND APPLICABILITY The development and design standards and guidelines for Downtown Riverside are intended to provide property owners, merchants, and their designers with basic development and design criteria that are intended to reinforce the desired building and district character.

INTRODUCTION TO DOWNTOWN LAND USE DISTRICTS 5-4 The goals of the design standards and guidelines are as follows: (1) Provide basic design recommendations for all buildings in the downtown promoting design creativity and variation while ensuring consistency in building scale, proportion and pedestrian orientation. (2) Establish clear and usable standards, guidelines and criteria. (3) Protect and enhance historic buildings and utilize historical building forms and styles to create future buildings

(Page 5-3, 5-4)

The proposed project is consistent with these goals, and the new development compatible with and differentiated from the immediately adjacent historical structure and its modern-styled historic character. Specifically, a creative design that respects the architectural vocabulary of the simplified early modern style present in Fire Station No. 1

, without mimicking the exact details is proposed. Building scale and proportional devices are employed that reference and support the existing structure's integrity and continuation. These include a reference to the solid/void characteristic patterns of the original structure that is carried onto the fenestration character of the new construction design.

5.3.5 Design Review All new construction, new additions to existing buildings, and any other exterior improvements shall be subject to the design standards and guidelines set forth in Chapter 15 of this Specific Plan and require design review pursuant to the provisions of Chapter 19.62 of the Zoning Code, or the provisions of Title 20, Cultural Resources Ordinance, if applicable.

(Page 5-9)

Refer to summary of Chapter 15 with comments, following.

# <u>2.1.5</u> Mission Inn Historic District Definition, Design Standards and Guidelines:

The Raincross District is divided into two sub-areas. <u>The center of the District is occupied by the Mission Inn</u> <u>Historic District, which contains Riverside's most important historic buildings.</u> In this sub-area the development standards have been carefully crafted to maintain a scale of development that is compatible with the well-established historic fabric of the district. <u>Outside of the Mission Inn Historic District, the development standards of the District</u>

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 18/71

allow greater intensity, while still assuring compatibility of the adjacent historic district and historic residential areas beyond. The development standards for the Raincross District are designed to create a place of daytime, evening and weekend activity by providing a high activity pedestrian environment with a storefront emphasis at the street level. Within the Raincross District, there are numerous local and national historic landmarks that define the district's character, including the Mission Inn, Fox Theater, Stalder Building, Municipal Museum, Unitarian Church, Congregational Church, Municipal Auditorium, Post Office, Loring Building, and Art Museum. Preservation of such structures, along with careful and compatible design of new development is important in maintaining the District's character and unique sense of identity.

(Page 6-4)

<u>Underlines added for emphasis</u>. The project site is located within the Mission Inn Historic District, a central sub-area of the Raincross District. The proposed project should be considered to conform with the goals of a storefront emphasis at the street level, a "careful and compatible" design for new construction, and by its mixed-use character, creating a scale of development with pedestrian activity at daytime, evenings, and weekends.

#### 6.6 DESIGN STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES FOR THE RAINCROSS DISTRICT

6.6.1 District Character Defining Statement The Raincross District is the cultural, entertainment, and retail center of Riverside and the region beyond. <u>Its significant, signature buildings include the Fox Theater, Stalder Building</u>. Mission Inn, Municipal Museum, Unitarian Church, Congregational Church, Municipal Auditorium, Post Office, Loring Building, and Art Museum. Historic and cultural resource sensitivity are the key concepts in this district. Buildings that contribute to the historic character of this district should be preserved or restored to an authentic historic design. <u>New construction should be in scale and architecturally harmonious with nearby historic buildings</u>. The above listed signature buildings for the Raincross District are intended to enhance both these signature buildings and their setting which together contribute to the character of a cohesive downtown. In addition, the design standards and guidelines for the Raincross District are intended to create a vibrant, pedestrian friendly downtown by encouraging pedestrian orientation to the storefronts, human scaled spaces, and pedestrian amenities. (Page 6-11)

The proposed project is consistent with these goals, and the new development compatible with the adjacent historic structures and historic district character. Specifically, the proposed seven and eight story, approximately 89-foot high top floor parapet height project is recommended to be considered harmonious with the scale and volumetric character of these significant historic structures.

We maintain the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property structure proposed is *compatible with adjacent historical structures in scale, massing and general architectural treatment,* as referenced in Policy HP-1-4. Most explicitly, the buildings illustrated in the Downtown Specific Plan's Section 6.6.1 for guidance and reference are the Fox Theater (two stories, with a three to five story tower); the Walling Building (three tall stories, with a four story tower); the Riverside Municipal Museum (four stories) and the Mission Inn (variable, but typically and mostly five and six stories) with projecting domes and towers in some areas at approximately seven to eight stories in height).

Absent from the Section 6.6.1 for guidance is the new development of the Stalder Building with its seven-story, 94-foot high Stalder Plaza development currently under construction behind the 1926 two-story historic G. Stanley Wilson-designed façade.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

#### Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 19/71

## **<u>2.1.6</u>** 2001 Historic Resources Survey of Stalder Building:

A good example of a preservation- sensitive approach to fulfilling the needs for office and commercial lease space in the District's Mission Inn Historic District can be found in the Stalder Building and Imperial Hardware Building Historic Resources Survey, by architect Wayne Donaldson, completed in January 2001. Mr. Donaldson was hired by the City to investigate development opportunities on the sites currently occupied by the Stalder Building (situated on the east corner of Mission Inn Avenue and Market Street) and the Imperial Hardware Building (situated on the east side of the Downtown Mall, between Mission Inn and University Avenues). A developer interested in creating a "Lifestyle Center" in this area suggested these buildings be removed and replaced with new structures. The Donaldson report investigates the historic significance of the buildings, their structural integrity, and the potential for a variety of development options. The report demonstrates the pros and cons of everything from full preservation to adaptive reuse options that would preserve various significant historic aspects of the buildings. It also documents the presence of historic structural members hidden inside the Stalder Building and an intact Art Deco façade covered by a 1960's era metal false front on the Imperial Hardware Building. The report shows how both the Stalder and the Imperial Hardware Buildings could be put to greater economic use with additions that would allow the original historic fabric of the buildings to be preserved and restored. These ideas allow both sites to be developed to the maximum floor area ration (FAR) permitted by the Specific Plan, while preserving the essence of the historic buildings. As development opportunities are explored that affect older buildings in the Raincross District, consideration of various preservation alternatives should be undertaken in the fashion of the Donaldson report. (Page 6-12)

The proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property project is consistent with these goals of development and preservation. The referenced text above states the goals of constructing an addition that allows the original and significant remaining historic fabric to be preserved and restored: specifically, the G. Stanley Wilson-designed Stalder Building façades along Mission Inn Boulevard and Market Street. The "essence" of that historic building is preserved while the allowable FAR is developed.

It should further be noted that the Specific Plan FAR as noted in Donaldson's 2001 Survey was subsequently addressed and supplanted by Policies contained in the November 2002 Downtown Specific Plan document. A future Amendment was released in May 2017. In the Raincross District, a FAR of 3.5 and height limit of 100 feet is allowable, while the Mission Inn Historic District sub-area within the Raincross District allows an FAR of 3.0 and a 60' height. The proposed two-hotel property development is recommended to be considered to be *compatible with adjacent historical structures in scale, massing and general architectural treatment* as referenced in Policy HP-1-4.

## **<u>2.1.7</u>** Architectural Style Recommendations:

6.6.3 Architecture Style (1) <u>Existing buildings should be restored/maintained in a historic style that reflects the</u> <u>actual, historic appearance of the building at its period of historic significance.</u> (2) The historic fabric in Downtown Riverside is interspersed with "contextual" buildings - buildings that are not historic but contribute to the district character as one traverses the district. Similarly, <u>new buildings should not necessarily be stylistically</u> "historic", but <u>should be compatible with their historic neighbors in terms of massing, modulation, beight, and setbacks.</u> New

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 20/71

buildings should be <u>contemporary interpretations</u> using the signature buildings as a source of design inspiration. Scale (1) Buildings and improvements should be at a pedestrian scale. To maintain a sense of pedestrian scale, larger buildings should be broken into storefront bays about 25 feet wide. (2) <u>The size and mass of a new</u> <u>building should blend with the surrounding district.</u> Detailing (1) Detailing of existing buildings should be a restoration or replication of historic detailing during the building's period of historic significance. Roof Design (1) Roof design should reflect/complement significant buildings in the area. Colors and Materials (1) Muted earthtones and traditional materials should prevail, with brighter colors limited to trim areas. The Mission Inn is a good example of this type of treatment. (Page 6-18)

The proposed project is consistent with these goals, <u>underlined</u> for emphasis. Noted especially the detailing: "Detailing of existing buildings should be a restoration or replication of historic detailing during the building's period of historic significance."

It is stated in the State of California DPR 523 form that the period of significance is the year of completion, 1957. This date of the original design of the Fire Station No. 1 exterior façades have retained a high percentage of original materials, with limited modifications. Integrity of the building recedes marginally from that date on, with minimal alterations to site context or structure. The term **"contemporary interpretation"** is recommended to apply to the reference and adoption of various broadly-referenced stylistically modern details from the Fire Station No. 1 exterior façade within the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property development. As previously noted, the exact details and materials will be further developed and detailed in the subsequent Construction Document phase that would incorporate this recommended referential approach. Such an approach will help to assure a sympathetic compatibility with the various Historic Districts, achieving an acceptable compatibility with the Fire Station No. 1 structure style while not directly copying the design.

It is the opinion of this Assessment that the Fire Station No. 1 façade design concept and its early modern stylistic vocabulary of fenestration, composition and minimal-decorative detail elements are significant and character defining elements of the structure. These façade conditions will be documented, with recommendations for a conservation approach to be followed in their restoration. This documentation and analysis have been referenced in designing and detailing compatible new construction for the hotel structure and its associated detailing.

As stated elsewhere within this Assessment, the period of significance date has been defined as 1957. As the existing public entrance door at the ground floor level Mission Inn Avenue façade represents a later modification, a contemporary interpretation will be proposed that references the original design of the adjacent window. Such interpretive approaches inform the proposed Hotel design of the new historically referential storefront. It is recommended to reference the horizontal datum lines, volumetric massing and architectonic compositional rhythm of the Fire Station No. 1 structure's façade original fenestration design.

We consider that this referential approach has been successfully implemented in the schematic façade design development of the proposed Hotel addition. Significant construction details of the original fenestration are examples of the aluminum frame casement and fixed windows, the corner window detailing, and the proportion and height of the apparatus room overhead coiling doors. A detail vocabulary of the proposed Hotel draws from the modern resource of the Fire Station No. 1 immediately adjacent.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 21/71

As conservation investigation proceeds in the Construction Document design development, decisions of what corrections of the original construction are necessary, feasibility of repairs, and which appropriate approach and recommended appearance may be made.

## 2.1.8 Architectural Design Standards:

6.9.4 Architecture Style (1) Multiple family housing is unique in the sense that while an individual, private use, it is also a part of the urban fabric. Residents affect, and are affected by, street activity and provide "eyes on the street". The residential character of the individual units should be protected while conforming to the urban feel of the Raincross District.

Scale (1) Individual units should be articulated to diminish the massing of large structures and be compatible with the scale of surrounding development.

(2) The mass and roof forms of buildings should be varied. In addition to porches, stoops and other entry elements such as bay windows, balconies and trellises are encouraged.

(3) The street floor building level should be raised between two and four feet to protect the privacy of ground floor units.

(4) Facades of multifamily buildings should be divided into shorter modules a maximum of 30 feet in width, to reflect the volumes of individual units within the building. This objective can be achieved with varied setbacks, vertical modulation, texture changes on the facade, porches and balconies. (Page 6-25)

As the Residence Inn program is for extended stay occupancies, the housing reference is applicable. The proposed project is consistent with these goals of architectural style, articulation and compatibility. Articulation divides the structure into a composition of building volumes with varied massing. The AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property façade creates a two story high articulated base with an open space pool deck at the second floor level. The proposed new Hotel development replaces a surface parking lot located to the west of Fire Station No. 1 along Mission Inn Avenue. Each of these two structures are readily identified as distinct from the other, yet the design references between the two create a compatible and unified appearance. A reference to the asymmetric compositions of the Fire Station No.1 building massing has been made in the proposed Hotel design by an articulation of distinct volumes. This divides the new Hotel structure massing into modules of irregularly articulated forms, acting to diminish the mass with varied building forms, textures and surface treatments.

Articulation within the proposed hotel façades are made by variated planar and massing elements composed throughout the building volume. These architectonic elements are further developed and detailed by compositions of color, rooftop forms, materials and façade details. As the final design and Construction Document set is available for review, material details and colors will be reviewed with recommendations.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 22/71

## 2.1.9 General Site Design Standards and Guidelines, Chapter 15:

#### 15 GENERAL DESIGN STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES 15-4 15.3 SITE DESIGN STANDARDS

<u>New development in the Downtown Specific Plan area should be compatible with surrounding development and</u> <u>historic structures</u> as well as pedestrian-friendly. The street environment should also respond to the needs of the pedestrians. A sensitive application of street furnishings such as benches, enriched paving, and lighting will strengthen the historic character while simultaneously providing a functional environment. Particular attention should be paid to creating shade in the Raincross District as well as all the other districts.

15.3.1 Additions, rehabilitation and new structures

(1) New structures should be sited to in a manner compatible with surrounding development and with the facade facing the public street in a manner that enhances pedestrian connections.

(2) Additions should be compatible with the existing building in scale, materials, and design.

(3) Wherever possible, mature trees should be preserved or relocated on site.

(4) New structures and parking areas should enhance existing pedestrian connections to existing outdoor pedestrian spaces such as courtyards, plazas and porticos and create new connections where none exist.

15.3.2 Building Access

(1) Main entries to buildings should be clearly demarcated, visible and accessible from the street and/or pedestrian <u>corridors</u>. Secondary entries may be from parking areas. Entries should not occupy more than a third of the ground floor facade.

(2) Retail entrances should not be recessed more than five feet and should be located no more than 50 feet apart.(3) Corner entrances are encouraged in corner buildings.

15.3.3 Parking and Site Access All parking and service/loading areas should be developed per the requirements of Chapter 16 of this Specific Plan and Chapter 19.74 of the Zoning Code, with requirements of the Specific Plan superseding those of the Zoning Code where the two conflict. (Page 15-4)

The proposed project is consistent with all these goals of siting and creation of a pedestrianfriendly environment. Two separate hotel lobby entrances and retail restaurant entrances along Mission Inn Avenue are enhanced, compliant with spacing of entrance locations and recommendations for limits in recess depth. These also conform to the historical character of the Fire Station No. 1 structure and the adjacent site context. A corner entrance for the restaurant at this corner property is provided. An increase in the sidewalk width along Mission Inn Avenue responds to a necessity of accommodating numbers of pedestrians related to the retail restaurant and linkages to the adjacent context and the Fire Station No. 1 site hardscape articulations.

## **<u>2.1.10</u>** General Architectural Design Standards and Guidelines, Chapter 15:

15.4 ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN STANDARDS <u>New development in Downtown Riverside should be</u> <u>a contemporary expression of historical architectural characteristics. Existing shapes, forms, massing and details can</u> <u>be reinterpreted or assimilated in new project designs, without necessarily copying existing buildings. This promotes a</u> <u>variety of building styles, which contributes to the interest and vitality of Downtown, while accommodating different</u>

# $\begin{array}{c} \mbox{Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:} \\ \mbox{AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA} \\ \mbox{Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page } 23/71 \end{array}$

ideas of what is visually appealing. 15.4.1 Massing, Form, and Scale (New structures, including Additions) (1) The size and mass of new structures, including additions, should be in relation to surrounding structures. (2) Architectural features that are reflective of or compatible with the character defining architectural features of surrounding structures or with the predominant architectural styles within the District. (3) To create visual interest, where appropriate, varied roof or parapet heights and/or recessed or extended building walls should be used. (4) Building corners may be emphasized by use of elements such as towers, domes, or entries. (5) Building articulation can be accomplished with the placement of windows an entries, volume changes, significant color and material changes, variable transparency, and the creation of shadow textures with trellises and overhangs. 15.4.2 Building Facade and Elevation Design (1) Building walls that are visible from a public street, major pedestrian corridor, or public open space, should include architectural features such as windows, arcades, canopies, pop-outs, and trim to create visual interest and avoid a blank wall appearance. (2) The appearance of building mass may be reduced through the use of arcades, courtyards, pergolas, and stepping stories back above the ground level. (3) The fenestration should be proportioned to and integrated with the facade modulation. Establish clear vertical and/or horizontal hierarchy and patterns in the placement of openings and assemblies. (4) Details or elements should be integral to the design and reflect the structural or material integrity of the building. (5) Details or elements should be integral to the design and should not appear added on. (6) Color and material changes should be used to add interest and reduce a building's apparent scale.

(Page 15-7)

The proposed project is consistent with these goals. <u>Underlining</u> is used for emphasis. Elements that are conforming to these guidelines include: referencing without directly copying the existing Fire Station No. 1 vocabulary in the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property; an architectural expression using contemporary materials and details that are reflective of and compatible with the interpretive proto-Modern style Fire Station No. 1 structure present; relationship with the nearby historic Mission Inn building in their variable heights, sizes and massing; stepping back of the northwest corner façade at the seventh floor level for a patio deck with a pergola feature, in deference to allow the significant First Congregational Church tower room to "breathe" as part of the historic Mission Inn Avenue viewshed; the proposed second floor level roof deck pergola/trellis construction and related change in volume; proposed material changes and transparencies; articulations in volume and materiality, especially by the variations in a planar façade using differing window treatments; hierarchy by use of both vertical and horizontal façade articulations, integral to the existing Fire Station No. 1 building's character; use of differing color and variated materials for added emphases; integrally designed façade details.

The proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property construction represents a compatible addition adjacent to the Fire Station No. 1 building, and also conforms to Riverside's Downtown Specific Plan Architectural Design Standards in terms particularly of stylistic reference, material use and design compatibility. As related to use of similar materials, namely plaster planar walls, horizontal massing elements, extended brick masonry walls, small diameter "piloti" columns supporting cantilevered building elements, *brise-soliel* shaded windows, and continuous "ribbon" window openings that extend across corners. The scale and rhythm of the proposed façade design fenestration is a continuation of the horizontal organization character of the Fire Station No. 1 design, visually extending its first and second floor volumes through the Hotel structure added beside it.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 24/71

## 2.1.11 Design of Architectural Elements, Retail:

15.4.4 Other Architectural Elements for Retail Buildings

Corners (1) <u>Building corners should be enhanced with higher massing and entries</u>. Cornice or Parapet (1) <u>The cornice should enhance the architectural style of the building</u>. A brick-front building may have a corbelled cornice. A plaster front building may have a stone sill at the parapet line. (Page 15-11)

The proposed project is consistent with these goals. Underlining used for emphasis.

The proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel project design uses emphasized design elements at the northwest building corner, and references the minimal, horizontal, flush cornice of the Fire Station No. 1 structure.

## 2.1.12 Design of Architectural Elements, Non-Retail:

15.4.5 Architectural Elements for Non-Retail Buildings (1) Entrance doors should be simple and located prominently in the building facade. (2) Windows should be clear or partly tinted. Highly reflective glass or dark tinted glass in pedestrian level windows is not permitted. (3) New buildings may have flat or sloping roofs, depending on what is most compatible with the architectural style of the building and others in the area. <u>Parapets should appear integrated with the building</u> and must always include a cap and corner detail to create a shadow line to enhance the building. <u>Mansard roofs are discouraged. (4) In Riverside, towers and domes are dramatic historic features that set Riverside apart from surrounding communities. Appropriate contemporary expressions of these elements are encouraged in new buildings. Particular care should be taken in using these elements in terms of scale, proportion, and architectural compatibility with the rest of the building.</u>

(Page 15-12)

The proposed project is consistent with these goals. <u>Underlining</u> used for emphasis. Entrance doors are prominently located at the Mission Inn Avenue façade. A flat roof with a minimal coping is proposed, compatible with the adjacent Fire Station No. 1 building form adjacent. Reflected glass is not used, and the primary Mission Inn Avenue storefront features clear glazing revealing the activity of the two hotel lobbies beyond and the restaurant space.

## 2.1.13 Design Standards and Guidelines for Historic Districts:

15.5 DESIGN STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES FOR HISTORIC STRUCTURES AND HISTORIC DISTRICTS The City of Riverside retains the treasures of its heritage in its many important historic structures and districts. The historic architecture of the City is one of its most important resources and is maintained by the establishment and enforcement of guidelines for the treatment of historic buildings and structures in historic districts. The presence of these guidelines serves a dual purpose: to protect the heritage of the City of Riverside, and to protect the interests of property owners and residents. The Cultural Resource Ordinance of the City of Riverside states that "no person, owner, or other entity should restore, rehabilitate, alter, develop, construct, demolish, remove, or change the appearance of any landmark, landmark structure, landmark site, or any structure or site within a preservation district without first having applied for and been granted a permit to do so by the Cultural Heritage Board or by the City Council on appeal." In addition, many structures over 50 years old are subject to review by the

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 25/71

City Staff to ensure that alterations or demolitions do not impair the cultural heritage of the City. While these design guidelines are a part of the Downtown Riverside Specific Plan, they are designed to be a useful tool to any property owner seeking advice about the appropriate treatment of his or her historic property. These guidelines are intended to be used in conjunction with Rehab Riverside Right, a publication of the City of Riverside designed to assist property owners in the rehabilitation of historic structures. Rehab Riverside Right contains a wealth of information on the treatment of historic building materials not covered in these guidelines.

15.5.1 Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are ten basic principles created <u>to help preserve the distinctive character of an historic building and its</u> site, while allowing for reasonable change to meet new needs. These Standards are the basic principles from which these Design Guidelines were developed.

(Page 15)

The proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel project design is consistent with these goals and are specifically compliant with the *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* summary underlined above. This Assessment Report details these consistencies in Section 7.4, <u>Summary of Recommendations</u>, on page 53. The Design Guidelines for Commercial Rehabilitations are referenced in the following Section. The proposed project preserves the primary character defining elements of the individually significant Fire Station No. 1 façade and its distinctive modernist character, while allowing a change to meet reasonable new needs. This emphasis on a stylistic compatibility with the proposed Hotel design represents an "appropriate treatment" as referenced in the Design Guidelines.

## 2.1.14 Design Guidelines for Commercial Rehabilitations:

## *15.7 DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR REHABILITATION OF HISTORIC COMMERCIAL BUILDINGS*

15.7.1 Site Design Character Defining Statement The design of the site of an historic structure is an essential part of its character. This design includes the streetscape in which the site is set, the planting strip along the street, the way a structure sits on its lot in relation to other structures and the street, and landscaping elements. While many of the historic structures in the Downtown Specific Plan area may have lost some of these characteristics over time, certain common characteristics remain which help to define the character of these historic areas and the structures within them. Historically, commercial areas in the Downtown Specific Plan area were characterized by a consistent setback usually aligned against the sidewalk. Parking was located either to the rear of buildings or was provided on street. Preservation of this regular street pattern is essential to maintaining the historic, pedestrian-friendly character of Riverside's historic commercial areas.

#### GENERAL DESIGN STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES 15-22 ANATOMY OF A

WINDOW 15.7.2 Openings Character Defining Statement The pattern of windows, doors, and other openings on the facades of an historic structure strongly define the character of the structure's design. Changing these elements in an inappropriate manner has a strong negative impact on the historic character of the structure. <u>These openings define character through their shape, size, construction, arrangement on the facade, materials, and profile.</u> Maintaining historic windows and doors often makes good economic sense, as they typically had a much longer life span than modern replacement windows. If you are thinking about replacing your historic windows or doors, please consult Rehab Riverside Right for suggestions on simple, inexpensive repairs which might extend their useful life. For instance, replacing single panes with double glazing or by adding storm windows or doors, you can increase energy efficiency while still preserving both the historic character of a structure and saving money!

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 26/71

Guidelines (1) The arrangement of historic openings of a facade should be maintained. (2) The size and proportions of historic openings on a facade should be maintained. • Filling in or altering the size of historic openings, especially on primary facades, is inappropriate. • Adding openings to historic facades is also inappropriate. (3) Preserve the materials and design of historic windows and doors and their surrounds. • Repair windows or doors wherever possible instead of replacing them. • When replacement of these windows is necessary, replacement windows should match the historic windows in size, shape, arrangement of panes, materials, method of construction, and profile. (4) If energy conservation is the goal, interior (preferred) or exterior storm windows or doors, not replacement

windows or doors, should be utilized. (Pages 15-23)

The proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property project is consistent with these goals. <u>Underlining</u> used for emphasis. The existing design of the original Fire Station No. 1 façade composition is maintained and referenced in the proposed hotel façade design. Repairs and rehabilitation of the Fire Station No. 1 façades and windows is recommended to be performed in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, as highlighted above. No historical fenestration features are proposed to be added, altered or filled in. Removal of the west façade's *brise soliel* window shades will be stabilized and adaptively – reused as original design elements at the second floor west façade pool deck of the proposed adjacent Hotel design.

## 2.1.15 Character-Defining Features:

15.7.4 Architectural Details and Building Materials Character Defining Features The characteristics of the primary building materials, including the scale of units in which the materials are used and the texture and finish of the material, contribute to the historic character of a building. For example, the color and finish of historic stucco is an important feature of Mission Revival structures. <u>Architectural details add visual interest, distinguish certain building styles and types and often showcase superior craftsmanship and architectural design</u>. Features such as lintels, brackets, and columns were constructed with materials and finishes that are associated with particular styles, and are character-defining features as well. (Page 15-26)

The unusual Fire Station No. 1 structure's proto-early-modern façade is justly celebrated as an overall character-defining feature, as underlined. The repair and rehabilitation of the original Fire Station No. 1 façade elements including an adaptive design reuse of *brise soliel* window shades are documented later in this Assessment. Primary exterior materials of flat plaster and an offset head bond brick coursing is used as a compatibility of the proposed structure with the original Fire Station No. 1 construction. A color and finish survey will recommend matching the original material by a detail analysis.

DOWNTOWN SPECIFIC PLAN 15-27 Guidelines (1) <u>Preserve original building materials and</u> <u>architectural features.</u> (2) Deteriorated materials or features should be repaired in place, if possible. (3) When it is necessary to replace materials or features due to deterioration, replacement should be in kind, matching materials and design. (4) Materials, such as masonry, which were not originally painted should remain unpainted. (5) Original building materials and details should not be covered with stucco, vinyl siding, or other materials.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 27/71

(Page 15-26 thru 27)

This unusual example of a proto-early-modern styled Fire Station structure façade composition is being preserved and repaired in place. No painting of the original brick wall surfaces will be made. In-kind, matching replacement may be necessary of some steel window frames that may have experienced some material loss by degradation.

Painted plaster wall surfaces will be rehabilitated, with a color selection determined by a color chronology analysis.

## **<u>2.1.16</u>** Design Guidelines for Infill Construction in Historic Districts:

## 15.8 DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR INFILL CONSTRUCTION IN COMMERCIAL HISTORIC DISTRICTS

15.8.1 Site Design and Building Location Historically, commercial areas in the Downtown Specific Plan area were characterized by a consistent setback usually aligned against the sidewalk. In most cases, a rhythm of building widths was established historically along a streetfront and this rhythm should be reflected in new construction. Guidelines (1) The facades of new structures in commercial areas should maintain the setback of existing historic structures along the street front. (2) New structures should reflect the traditional widths of historic structures in the area. (3) New structures which are wider than the traditional width should be designed to read as smaller modules reflecting the traditional building widths. (4) Parking areas should be located to the rear of new structures. 15.8.2 Building Mass, Scale and Form Historic commercial areas in the Downtown Specific Plan area were generally composed of two- to three-story flat roof structures composed as rectangular solids. Guidelines (1) New structures should be a simple rectangular solid. (3) A flat roof is the preferred roof form. (Page 15-28)

The proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property project is consistent with these goals. <u>Underlining</u> is used for emphasis. The façade setbacks and massing articulations of the proposed modern styled Hotel structure interpretatively reflects the interconnecting three-dimensional façade volumes of the elegant Fire Station No. 1 façade design. The average scale of the historic buildings within the area is proposed to be considered compliant with how the proposed design is articulated into differing modules of massing and material definition. These articulations reference the Fire Station No. 1 structure and its variable and variated massing elements.

Of interest is the presence of two modern-era structures in the Historic Districts that enliven the conversation with the representative revival-style structures: the 1957 Fire Station No. 1 and the 1965 Riverside Public Library. Each of these structures possess a relatively high level degree of integrity and are each designed by the local architecture firm Moise, Harbach and Hewlett.

The proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property development is considered to be *compatible with adjacent historical structures in scale, massing and general architectural treatment* as referenced in Policy HP-1-4. Further, the buildings illustrated in the Downtown Specific Plan's Section 6.6.1 for guidance and reference are the Fox Theater (two stories, with a three story tower); the Walling Building (four stories, with a five story tower); the Riverside Municipal Museum (four stories) and

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 28/71

the Mission Inn (described above). Using these existing historic buildings as an average "scale" and height for reference, the proposed two-hotel project is recommended to be considered as compatible with the historic examples cited. There are multiple scales present in both the original Stalder Building and the Stalder Plaza structure currently under construction. This would be true of the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property design with the adjacent Fire Station No. 1 full rehabilitation and adaptive reuse project, and the surrounding historic district contributing buildings.

## 2.1.17 General Design Standards and Guidelines:

15.8.3 Materials and Details Materials commonly used on facades of historic commercial structures in Riverside included brick, stucco, and masonry. Architectural details were usually embellishments added to the solid plane of the facade or parapet details rising from it. Echoing these traditions in the design of new construction will help to preserve the distinctive character of Riverside's downtown commercial areas. Guidelines (1) Building materials should be similar, or at least appear similar, to those used historically. (2) Generally, architectural details should be arranged to emphasize the horizontal features of facades. (3) Architectural details should echo, but should not exactly mimic, details found on historic facades. (4) The colors of permanent finish materials should be similar to these used historically. (5) The use of architectural detail to break up the visual mass of outsized buildings is encouraged. 15.8.4 Openings, Storefronts, and Entries The character of historic commercial blockfronts is largely defined by the storefronts, entryways, windows and doors designed to create street level interest for pedestrians and passersby. While a an historic commercial blockfront might be composed of a Mission Revival structure, a Moderne structure, and several Italianate structures, all of these structures would have presented a similar face to the sidewalk, with large expanses of glass storefront windows, welcoming well-marked entryways, and largely regular, horizontally massed windows. Most historic commercial structures employ this basic architectural vocabulary to create a welcoming retail experience for passersby, and express their architectural style through details and materials. It is essential to the character of historic commercial districts, therefore, that new structures utilize this common vocabulary to ensure that the character of the area is not lost.

(Page 15-29)

The proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property project is consistent with these goals. <u>Underlining</u> used for emphasis.

The building materials and the architectural detail vocabulary as proposed will reference, but not directly repeat the characteristics of the Fire Station No. 1 original. A color study is proposed to determine the 1957 color characteristics.

15 GENERAL DESIGN STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES 15-30 Strong corner emphasis Guidelines (1) On the ground floor of new commercial structures, a majority of the primary architectural facade should echo traditional retail storefronts. (2) The ground floor of the primary architectural facade should be composed primarily of transparent elements. (3) Recessed entryways are strongly encouraged for primary entrances on the ground floor level. (4) Primary entryways should be clearly marked through the use of important defining architectural elements, such as transoms, awnings, lintels, or surrounds. (5) New ground-level facades should echo through their use of architectural detail and articulation the widths of existing historic storefront bays in the area. (6) Upper story windows should be regularly spaced and horizontally massed on the primary architectural facade. (7) On structures occupying corner lots, corner entryways with strong architectural emphasis are encouraged. (Page 15-30)

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 29/71

The proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property project is consistent with these goals. <u>Underlining</u> used for emphasis.

This architecturally referential Hotel addition to the Fire Station No. 1 structure here proposed is set back from the Mission Inn Avenue façade. Proposed storefront openings will be recessed and composed of primarily transparent elements. The proposed Hotel addition creates an open space area for a pool and terrace area for guest use at the second floor level. Architectural features such as the original *brise-soliel* shade structures are proposed to be savaged for an adaptive reuse and installed at the western façade locations. Ground floor storefront windows are proposed to be transparent and non-reflective. Awnings are used to emphasize the entrances to the two hotels and also the restaurant/sidewalk façade; these are framed by a brick material that replicates the existing Fire Station No. 1 materials. The corner at Mission Inn Avenue and Lemon Street is shown as the entrance to the sidewalk café. Upper story windows are grouped horizontally and are regularly spaced.



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study; Context View North Exterior façade; Cover sheet Planning submittal "Dual Brand Marriott"

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 30/71

## 3 prior documentations Summary of previous Historical Assessments, meeting memoranda and Recommended Period of Significance

3.1 Prior Documentations and Historical Assessments

Previous historical surveys and studies have been referenced in the preparation of this Assessment. A DPR 523 form prepared by Historic Resources Group (HRG) dated 17 May 2012 states this structure was constructed beginning in April 1956 and completed in March 1957. According to that form, HRG also participated in Riverside's Citywide Modernism Intensive Survey, September 2013. There are limited alterations to the primary exterior façades of this corner lot property which possess a high level of intact integrity. The only modifications noted by HRG was replacement of underground fuel storage tanks with above-ground tanks in 1993, a re-roofing in 1996 and an addition of a roof access ladder in 2008. A question of alterations versus the original design (or, design intent per the rendering) is the two overhead coiling wide-bay garage doors at either end of the apparatus room. Details of doors at the northern elevation do not match those doors at the southern elevation.

This structure occupies the eastern portion of the proposed project site along Mission Inn Avenue at the Lime Street intersection. The planting areas along Lime Street are possibly reflected in the original rendering; the low brick-walled landscape planter underneath the projecting two-story volume at the Mission Inn façade is presently vacant.

The present Fire Station No. 1 appearance dates from 1957 with marginal alterations to the exterior façades. A presentation watercolor perspective drawing shows a relatively intact structure, assuming that the artist's rendering was representative of the as-built conditions. No review of original construction documents was available at the date of this Assessment for a detailed analysis of any altered conditions.



GTL | MHA, March 2019 photograph of Riverside Fire Station #1 Site Context: 3420 is former Central Fire Station No. 1. View of Fire Station No. 1 comparative analysis with proposed project construction rendering: Character-defining north facing primary exterior façade, view from northeast corner of Lime Street and Mission Inn Avenue

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 31/71



GTL | MHA, March 2019 photodocumentation: West exterior facade at the north end; Planter and Brise Soliel window shading detail.

Excerpted data from DPR 523 form:

B9a. Architect: Moise, Harbach and Hewlett b. Builder: Cal Construction Company
\*B10. Significance: Theme: Modern Architecture & Architects of Modernism
Area: Riverside
Period of Significance: 1957 Property Type: Public
Applicable Criteria: C/3/c, d

The Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1) located at 3420 Mission Inn Avenue is an excellent and rare example of an International Style fire station in Riverside. It was designed by noted local architectural firm Moise, Harbach and Hewlett and constructed in 1957. The growth in population in the immediate post-World War II period created a profound need for expanded city services, and several bond measures were placed on the ballot for the construction of fire stations, libraries, and schools. In 1952, the City put a \$440,000 bond measure on the ballot for the construction of a new fire station to replace the original downtown station on Eighth Street (now University Avenue). Cal Construction Company broke ground on the new fire station in April 1956, and the building was completed by March 1957.

The Central Fire Station is a rare local example of the International Style. In 1932, the Museum of Modern Art hosted its first architecture exhibit, titled simply "Modern Architecture." The exhibit included buildings from around the world that shared a stark simplicity and vigorous functionalism. The term International Style was coined by Henry Russell Hitchcock and Philip Johnson in their catalog for the exhibit. Within the International Style, two trends emerged after World War II. In the first post-war trend, the emphasis was on the expression of the building's function. These buildings have more in common with the early work of Walter Gropius than Mies van der Rohe. Gropius created innovative designs that borrowed materials and methods of construction from modern technology. His advocacy of industrialized building carried with it a belief in teamwork and an acceptance of standardization and prefabrication. Gropius introduced a screen wall system that utilized a structural steel frame to support the floors and which allowed the external glass walls to continue without interruption.

State of California DPR 523 form; excerpt. The full document is reproduced in the Appendix 8, Section A.2

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 32/71



GTL | MHA, October 2019 photodocumentation, Fire Station number 1; first and second floor windows including Brise Soliel shade structures field reconnaissance; exterior west façade.

It should be noted that the precedent architects listed in the DPR 523 form - Ludwig Mies Van Der Rohe and Walter Gropius- while significant, are missing two equally influential architects who undoubtedly influenced the architects of the Fire Station No. 1 structure: Le Corbusier and William Lescaze. These designers of the "International Style" era have been used as reference sources in the design development stages of the Hotel development. Refer to Section 3.4.1 of this Assessment for details.

## **3.2** Summary of Integrity Analysis from Prior Assessments:

An important aspect of National Register review definition is the concept of "integrity," specifically, "integrity" of "location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association." Considerations of these factors have been made in this Assessment Report's evaluation of the Fire Station No. 1 structure and site context.

This Assessment considers the exterior façade to be the primary character-defining feature recommended to be rehabilitated and preserved at a Conservation level of work. Quoting from HRG's DPR 523 form;

The Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1) retains all seven aspects of integrity and continues to convey its historic significance. It was listed in the California Register in 2008. It also appears eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places at the local level of significance, and as a local landmark. It is eligible under the Modern Architecture theme as an excellent and rare example of an International Style fire station in Riverside that showcases advances in post-World War II fire station design. It is eligible under the Architects of Modernism theme as the work of the significant local architectural firm Moise, Harbach and Hewlett.

State of California DPR 523 form; excerpt. The full document is reproduced in the Appendix 8, Section A.2

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 33/71

Feasible repairs and the development of related historical specifications and detailing will be a necessary part of the construction documents development to support the recommended Rehabilitation Standards program. Refer to Section 4 of this Assessment.



GTL | MHA, March 2019 photodocumentations, Hose drying tower, exterior south façade. Original brise soliel window shade structures are character- defining elements of the historic façade composition.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 34/71

### • <u>3.3</u> Recommendations for defining the period of significance:

## **3.3.1** Definition:

The period of significance is defined as the span of time during which a site or property attained the significance for which the resource meets the criteria used for National Register evaluation. National Register criteria do not differ significantly from the California Register.

Period of Significance: 1957

State of California DPR 523 form; excerpt. The full document is reproduced in the Appendix 8, Section A.2

We concur with HRG's analysis of the Significant period.

However, we suggest that the absence of any reference to the design influence of early-modern architect Le Corbusier, who codified the language of the "International Style" in his five points of a new architecture, represents a serious lack of academic analysis. Refer to Section 3.4.1.

## 3.3.2 Summary of review and comments:

Despite the lack of specific definition that could be provided by the availability of original contract documents or period photographs, it is recommended to consider the date of 1957 as the starting and ending date of the period of significance. This represents the condition at the time of completion of the Fire Station No. 1 façade. This structure was not subsequently modified following the date of its initial construction. This represents a conservative approach, recommended here as it allows for the simplest definition of what possesses sufficient integrity for interpretation. Any modifications made at a date later than 1957 would not generally be able to enhance the significance and are not recommended to have achieved significance on their own merits.

#### <u>3.4</u> Historic District Data

The Project Site of the Fire Station No. 1 and its adjacent surface parking lots falls within the boundaries of two City of Riverside's Historic Districts. These are:

Seventh Street Historic District (1889-1945) (Mission Inn Avenue from Rubidoux Drive to Vine Street) This district includes a grouping of some of Riverside's finest commercial and residential architecture, as well as the historic citrus tree pergolas, Raincross streetlights, and the Buena Vista Bridge. Also known as City Landmark No. 40, it was named before Seventh Street was changed to Mission Inn Avenue and prior to the designation of the Mission Inn Historic District, which encompasses the eastern portion of the district.

Mission Inn Historic District (1871-1946) (Bounded roughly by Sixth Street, Eleventh Street, Market Street and the Riverside 91 Freeway) This commercial district is the old downtown core, and is comprised primarily of commercial and government buildings. It encompasses part of the Seventh Street Historic District and is distinctive for its embodiment of the Mission Revival style. Other styles

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 35/71

include Spanish Colonial Revival and Art Deco with a variety of building materials such as ceramic brick, terra cotta and rough-hewn granite. Well-known architects of the district include Arthur Benton, Julia Morgan, G. Stanley Wilson, and Myron Hunt. Major focal points include the Mission Inn, the Riverside County Courthouse, the First Congregational Church, and the Fox Theater. The district features numerous resources listed in the National Register of Historic Places.



Mission Inn & Seventh Street Historic Districts Historic District definition, from City of Riverside

# <u>3.5</u> Summary of City meetings review comments, historic structure and site treatment

Pre-submittal Meetings with partial members of the Cultural Heritage Board and City of Riverside Community Development Department Planning Division were held during the development of the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property project. These meetings were very helpful and informative. A summation of review comments is provided:

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 36/71

3.5.1 Reviewed the proposed design consisting of two- brands of hotels: Residence Inn (extended stay) and AC Marriott (more of a boutique/ European / modern "design-led" influenced hotel.) Total number of rooms is 225.

3.5.2 Height of structure is proposed to be a combination of seven and eight floors, minimal floor to floor height, with four underground parking levels.

3.5.3 Key reinforcement of the hotel design is a relation to the Riverside "Arts District." This includes proposed new identification signage on roof. Recommendation was to incorporate the Raincross Symbol into the Arts program, and to incorporate an exterior sculptural element at the eastern side of the property.

3.5.4 Reviewed the State Historic Resource designation of the 1957 Riverside Fire Station number 1 and the character-defining elements: "International Style" design, defined by early twentieth century Modern Architecture Le Corbusier. For reference, an excerpt from his book Vers Une Architecture where Corbusier first diagrammed and codified the "Five Points" of a Modern architecture:

Les 5 Points d' une architecture nouvelle, which Le Corbusier formulated in 1926 included (1) the pilotis (columns) elevating the mass off the ground, (2) the free plan, achieved through the separation of the load-bearing columns from the walls subdividing the space, (3) the free facade, the corollary of the free plan in the vertical plane, (4) the long horizontal sliding window and finally (5) the roof garden, restoring, supposedly, the area of ground covered by the house.



Copied text and images from Yahoos' Geocities site, referencing Vers Une Architecture.
Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 37/71

3.5.5 Design review of the proposed work should be coordinated with, and compatible in design character with the immediate Historic Context- specifically as a part of the City of Riverside's Seventh Street Historic District. Immediately proximate structures that should be part of project design review include the Congregational Church Tower, across Lemon street from the west side of the property; Julia Morgan's YWCA directly across Mission Inn Avenue, and The Mission Inn a block west down Mission Inn Avenue. Perspective renderings should include immediate site context structures.

3.5.6 The contemporary design employed in the proposed schematic presented was tweaked to better "fit in" contextually with the Historic Districts.; the massing was enlivened and broken up.

3.5.7 Initial design for building colors were considered to generally be too dark as and were subsequently revised, using lighter colors of browns, sepia browns, off white and cream colors; and specific reference to the existing brick color. Research into the original stucco color of Fire Station plaster façade will be made. A color strategy will be developed for review, including materials and textures.

3.5.8 Some references to the masonry color and material in the Fire Station façade should help tie in the proposed design to the existing landmark. The datum lines of existing floors, roofs and willow sills are transposed across from the proposed design. Alterations to the Fire Station No. 1 structure is limited to rehabilitation and replacement of existing metal apparatus room doors.

3.5.9 Proposed massing and height were generally considered acceptable.

3.5.10 Suggested to lower the western side building mass from eight stories to seven stories overall to better reveal the viewshed to the Congregational Church tower. A benefit of a rooftop terrace was considered an opportunity to create an architectural theme, with graphics showing what historic buildings were viewable towards the southwest and north. Creating a "History Deck."

3.5.11 Innovative exterior lighting design such as a pergola of lighting along the sidewalk was well - received.

3.5.12 "Tweaks" to the façade design were expected, with references to the original fire station colors and design.

3.5.13 Based on the color rendering and preliminary color chronology analysis, the plaster elements of the Fire Station No. 1 are a whiter color than the crème color shown. Accepted suggestion to consider plaster wall surfaces in lieu of a manufactured material with a wood appearance.

3.5.14 Incorporated suggestion to consider the brick masonry be applied at the piers from grade up to the horizontal surface/signage band, which could be in precast or concrete material.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 38/71

3.5.15 Incorporated suggestion to add murals to the south alley façade.

3.5.16 The unsheltered Roof deck trellis was further developed in response to the massing articulation.

3.5.17 Additional comments on the façade image:

a>The thin diameter piloti columns of the Fire Station No. 1 appear to be widened; these are character – defining features where such alteration of dimension may prove problematic.

b>Color rendering of the Fire Station No. 1 surfaces does not reference the existing brick masonry and plaster surfaces.

c>Wall sconce light fixtures shown will require review of design, locations, extent, and finishes.

d>The appearance of the glazed apparatus garage door replacement is appropriate as schematically shown.

e>Clarify that the color of the Fire Station No. 1 second floor window framings will be referenced in the Hotel design.



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study; North Exterior façade. Context View from west façade to east.



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study; West exterior façade. Context View from east

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 39/71

# 4 EXISTING CONDITIONS/ ARCHITECTURAL SUMMARY Existing Architectural Summary with Evaluation of existing conditions, Fire Station No. 1

## • <u>4.1</u> Summary of Existing Conditions, Exterior Architectural Elements:

Existing architectural design characteristics can be summarized broadly as follows:

Original construction conditions of the Fire Station No. 1 structure have been minimally modified at the exterior with limited construction alterations and no substantive additions. In some area deferred maintenance has occurred over time beyond the defined period of significance; these actions have created some conditions that have led to sub-standard performance of this Modern-styled building envelope. In some instances, there are modified features located at the primary street facing façade, namely replacement of original storefront exterior doors that have marginally affected the character of the original Modern design. There are several locations of skylights that may provide a desirable feature in the future adaptive reuse program.

Exterior façade walls and building volumes of brick masonry and plaster surfaces have generally maintained their overall appearance as elements of the original construction, while exhibiting requirements for cleaning and needs for minor repairs. It may be considered that the nature of this structure is that it supports such modifications without compromising its overall historic character.

It is the recommendation of this Assessment that additions to the original building complex do not justify consideration for eligibility on their own merit. The limited later additions to (and removals from) the Fire Station No. 1 structure do not detract from the character of original construction of this significant resource, nor do they compromise its State landmark designation.

Analysis of the CEQA considerations and criteria against which this structure is reviewed as a potential historical resource is presented in the Regulatory Data Excerpts, in Section 1.



Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 40/71

GTL | MHA, March 2017 photodocumentations, Brick masonry details, including offset head joint bond pattern, Exterior north façade.

#### • <u>4.2</u> Summary of Existing Interior Architectural Elements:

Interiors throughout this building are non-public spaces and have been remodeled and subdivided numerous times. A consequence is that there are few apparent surviving elements with integrity of place, association and setting from the original condition of the structure, with a defined period of significance dated at 1957. Due to the multiple remodelings observed, the existing character of the interior spaces, finishes, and features is very limited.

Original industrial metal louvered fluorescent light fixtures are non-contributing features. Other non-contributing elements represent often-repeating notes on an existing review assessment. These include but are not limited to the extensive presence of added equipment, including electrical and communications conduits and wireways, signal devices, alarms, plumbing fixtures; partitions; equipment; painted finishes; dropped ceilings and related acoustic tiles; fluorescent lighting fixtures, signage; and various mechanical equipment.

## • <u>4.3</u> Summary of Modifications and Deteriorations:

## **4.3.1** Modifications:

The "CENTRAL FIRE STATION" pin- mounted letters have been removed from the Mission Inn Avenue façade over the Apparatus Room door;

Replacement of the presumed original Apparatus Room garage roll up doors is likely;

Alterations to the public entrance door;

Chain Link fencing enclosure around Mechanical / Electrical equipment at the south façade.

The extent of structural modifications is unknown as of the date of this Assessment.

While the interior spaces are not a part of the current scope of reviews, modifications to the interior include but are not limited to: removal of the traditional fire fighters' pole: the circular floor opening remains

removal of the traditional fire fighters' pole; the circular floor opening remains.

## **4.3.2** Deteriorations:

While condition or deterioration has no necessarily direct bearing on defining significance, the notes in this section describe limited elements where previous alterations, physical deterioration and material loss are present. Exterior elements are proposed to be addressed with the current Hotel Project.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 41/71

Feasible repairs and the development of historical specifications and detailing will be a necessary part of the construction documents development to support the recommended historical rehabilitation and mitigation program. These are recommended to include, at a minimum:

- Masonry cleaning, repair and repointing;
- Concrete repair and cleaning;
- Metal window rehabilitation;
- Metal *brise soliel* sun shades rehabilitation;
- Storefront doors rehabilitation or replacement
- Window glazing
- Unit skylights
- Landscaping materials.

## • <u>4.4</u> Conclusions of Rehabilitations:

These are considered reversible actions, and later modifications are recommended to be removed and replaced with compatibly designed elements based on photographic documentation research. Upper level window exteriors are in fair condition, with operational functions limited. Replacement with new operable units that match the original in physical appearance, function, dimension and material are recommended only should repair and rehabilitation prove infeasible.

## **4.4.1** Current description of deteriorated and/or incompatible features:

Following are a list of incompatible and/or deteriorated features present at the exterior façade that have a potential impact on some of the character-defining elements of the building:

- Standard flush, painted hollow-metal doors
- Penetrations of façade by later added conduits and electrical equipment.
- Deteriorated original or later replaced brick masonry wall elements, especially at the south and west façades.
- Non-conforming infill replacements of louvres.

## • <u>4.5</u> Conclusions and Recommendations:

It is clear that there are some features in the Fire Station No. 1 structure that have suffered from combinations of factors. Multiple stages of infrastructural upgrades made over time have created an additive quality to some interior spaces and exterior surfaces. Some of these alterations are no longer functional or functioning as intended.

The present conditions with a lack of significance or deteriorated conditions indicates that original integrity is lacking at most interior spaces. The exterior north façade maintains limited integrity in the overall storefront design at the Fire House public entrance, and is the element recommended to be evaluated for repair or replacement in the proposed project design. The exterior roll-up Apparatus Room doors at the south and north façades are proposed to be replaced with sectional panel overhead doors, without change to the original opening sizes. This

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 42/71

detail is developed in the proposed exterior work of the adaptive reuse portion of the new hotel construction.

As the west façade portion of the original Fire Station No. 1 structure is proposed to be encapsulated in place, the remainder of the structural connections to it are proposed to be modified as a part of the new hotel structural design. Special care for the adequate bracing of the façade during construction, and the structural detailing necessary for its support and connection to the new structural design will be required.

A proposed rooftop-mounted design for the "RIVERSIDE ARTS DISTRICT" signage at the northeast corner of the Fire Station No. 1 structure will require new structural faming that will coordinate with the Apparatus Room high-bay structure.

Structural design for the shoring of the structure will be required. These designs typically follow the development of the construction documents, and are performance based, provided by the subcontractor.



GTL | MHA, March 2019 photodocumentations, Apparatus Room high-bay interior space, view south. Vision panels on the south doors do not match the north doors.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 43/71



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study; Exterior façade with Arts District signage.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 44/71

# 5 ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

Summary of Primary Conveyance of Significance, referencing CEQA Criteria and previous Historical Assessments Evaluation of historical resources

# • <u>5.1</u> Summary of Recommendations for Significance and Prior Assessments

Existing architectural design characteristics of the Fire Station No. 1 can be summarized broadly as Significant, appropriately designated as a California Register-listed property. This proto-modern, "International Style" designed structure is a highly unusual example of a public building, designed in that associated minimally- detailed stylistic methodology, and having retained over its 63-year history an extraordinary degree of Integrity. Original construction conditions of the Fire Station No. 1 structure have been minimally modified at the exterior with limited construction alterations and no substantive additions.

The proposed design for an Adaptive - Reuse project is required to be performed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. It follows from Secretary's Rehabilitation Standard Number 10 that all alterations of the proposed work within this structure be performed in a "reversible" manner, where the lightest touch of any new work scope will not alter significant, character-defining materials and detail conditions. As such, removal of any new, later work will not impair the value of this State- Listed Historic Resource of this extraordinary property.

It also follows that the effective addition of the proposed new hotel construction to the west of the Fire Station No. 1 equally possess a "reversible" quality in order to adhere fully to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and consequently CEQA.

## • <u>5.2</u> Conclusions:

We find the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel project design is in substantial conformity with *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. This proposed project preserves the significant elements of the Fire Station No. 1 façade and its distinctive early modernist character, as listed on the California Register, while allowing a change to meet reasonable new needs. This emphasis on a stylistic compatibility with the proposed Hotel design represents an "appropriate treatment."

The Fire Station No. 1 structure will be retained in-place with the design for the new hotel immediately adjacent to it; this approach will lessen a chance that the proposed action would detract from the character-defining features of the Fire Station No. 1 façade, or to the historic character of the environmental Context.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 45/71

It is recommended that the overall character of the Fire Station No. 1 building be maintained as an example of a high level of integrity of the early Modern "International Style" design example, while adapting it to a compatible new creative use for an adaptive re-use project.

It is recommended that the alterations and additions of the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel project made to this structure be designed in a compatible style. A method of construction that has a "reversible" or "retreatable" character, so that the original function of the structure can be perceived and appreciated as well as stabilized, is suggested in concept.

It is recommended that an interpretive derivation of the Fire Station No. 1 structure be employed in the façade design of proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property. This proposed construction at the adjoining parking lot to the west is recommended to not directly copy this highly unusual style, but to form a design cohesiveness on its own site. It is recommended to have these two halves of a future whole incorporate a "hyphen" type of revealed connection, to distinguish the two properties adequately.



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design studies;

Exterior north façade detail study of hyphen connection between Fire Station No. 1 and the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel project. Pending development of details and coordination of existing planter bed construction.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 46/71

# 6 CHARACTER-DEFINING FEATURES

<u>Coordinated recommendations of Character-Defining elements of</u> <u>Design</u>, <u>Materiality</u>, and <u>Cultural Resources Present</u>

• <u>6.1</u> Historical assessment and listing of character defining features:

# 6.1.1 Introduction

Commencing in August 2019 GTL | MHA performed as part of this Assessment Report a reconnaissance of the site and structure. GTL | MHA conducted visual observations at the site of the interior and exterior conditions, noting probable original conditions and details and later modifications. A review of the proposed design development documents provided by the office of Axis/GFA Architecture + Design enabled verification of site observations.

Character-defining elements of the Fire Station No. 1 are here listed.

## "Character-Defining Features" of Fire Station No. 1 include:

Observed character-defining elements of the "International Style" design, not limited to:

- 6.1.1 thin diameter piloti columns.
- 6.1.2 horizontal emphasis for massing elements, brick walls and office level windows.
- 6.1.3 glazed fenestration corner of office strip/ribbon window.
- 6.1.4 cantilevered metal framed louvred sun shades at the south and west facing façades.
- 6.1.5 flush material detailing, limited projection of window sills.
- 6.1.6 landscaping planting bed, Mission Inn Avenue façade.
- 6.1.7 parkway/landscaping at east / Lime Street façade.
- 6.1.8 steel framed windows and proportion/orientation of divided lites.
- 6.1.9 brick masonry unit finishes, mortar color and coursing/ tooling detail design.
- 6.1.10 hose drying tower and louvred termination capital, alley façade.

This Assessment considers the exterior façades to be the primary character-defining features recommended to be preserved and repaired per the Secretary's Standards. The second floor steel framed windows at the primary façades and the first floor storefront and associated trim are "essential" features considered to be repairable for maintaining original integrity. Similarly, the balance of solid brick wall massing elements with limited window openings is a critical design motif of this modernist composition.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 47/71

## 6.1.2 Historical Assessment/ Context Summary statement & Conclusion:

As historical significance associated with this site is in regard to CEQA Criteria (C), the character-defining features tend to represent physical features of the structure. Individual elements such as the north main entrance façade details and massing volumes are a specific character-defining feature as well as a conglomeration of multiple details.



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study; Exterior façade detail of northwest corner entrance

Conclusion:

Context reiteration:

Design review of the proposed work should be coordinated with, and compatible in design character with the two immediate Historic Contexts- specifically as a part of the City of Riverside's Seventh Street Historic District and Mission Inn Historic District. Immediately proximate structures that should be part of project design review include the Congregational Church Tower, across Lemon street from the west side of the property; Julia Morgan's YWCA directly across Mission Inn Avenue, and The Mission Inn a block west down Mission Inn Avenue. Perspective renderings will include the context structures.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 48/71

# 7 CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDED APPROACHES <u>Concluding Recommendations for a compatible design of a</u> <u>proposed addition to the Fire Station No. 1 Building, including</u> <u>minor alterations of structure for adaptive reuse:</u>

• <u>7.1</u> Summary of a recommended adaptive-reuse project approach:

## <u>7.1.1</u> Historical Assessment and Character-Defining features Summary:

Following are summaries for a recommended, compatible approach. These are in general conformance with the guidelines of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and therefore in accord with mitigating project impacts under the CEQA. Per the Standards language, a project should be performed in a "*reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility*."



# • <u>7.2</u> Summary of recommendations:

Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study; Exterior façade, northwest view.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 49/71

## 7.2.1 Recommendations for reuse of rehabilitated character-defining features:

The character-defining features of the Fire Station No. 1 structure are recommended in general to be retained *in situ* and remain as part of the adaptively-reused rehabilitation design on site. As previously referenced, adopting a project approach that is deemed compatible with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards under the Rehabilitation Guidelines definitions will be found conforming to CEQA requirements. These Rehabilitation standards are the most widely adopted historical project approach. They are the most accepting of project parameters that includes new, compatibly-designed construction differentiated from the original, while meeting contemporary needs. Historic-era construction can be modified as a part of a rehabilitation documentation plan allowing for "…*alterations or additions to the property (that) are planned for a new or continued use*….." (Reference Section 1.1.4.)



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study; Exterior façade sample board of proposed materials and colors.

The scale of the proposed new Hotel structure design, the articulated massing and its height are recommended to be considered consistent with the City of Riverside's Downtown Specific Plan goals. The proposed adaptive reuse design is recommended to be considered conforming with other immediately adjacent and nearby historical buildings within the Mission Inn Historic District, with the referenced examples given, and the "average" scale concept as conveyed.

Modern Historical Architecture

 $\label{eq:Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA \\ Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 50/71$ 

• <u>7.3</u> Summary of recommendations for a compatible project approach:

While most of the building elements are in repairable condition, the intent of the project is to document the site history by incorporating certain salvageable detail elements such as the shade structures within the new construction proposed. It is the project intent to develop appropriate repairs and rehabilitations of the selected elements, including appropriate locations within the structure. Examples of rehabilitated historic shade structures and skylights are not yet illustrated in these design studies.



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, context design study; Southeast exterior façade.

This south façade design study shows the concept of relocating the existing apparatus bay roll up metal doors to serve as framed surfaces for artwork at the ground floor level of the Hotel garage façade. Glazed paneled window wall and entrances will replace and reference the original doorways at the Apparatus Room openings. Repair and reincorporation of original historic features such as the *brise soliel* window shade structures are part of the final historic detail development within the Construction Documents.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 51/71

# 7.3.1 Recommendations for a compatible design, using Character-Defining Features:

As the Construction Document set for the new hotel is developed, incorporation of historical detail sheets and specifications into the Contract Documents is recommended to emphasize the differing aspects of appropriate historical design documentation, and rehabilitation in accordance with the Secretary's Standards.

The exact details for the repairs and reintegration of proposed re-use elements are to be further developed in the detailing phase of the Construction Documents.

It is recommended to maintain a vocabulary of material use- specifically, for elements- that are consistent with and are deferential to, while differentiated from, the original character of the Fire Station No. 1 structure. The exact details for the repairs and reintegration of proposed reuse elements are to be further developed in the detailing phase of the Construction Documents.

Enhance a similar massing appearance to the existing Fire Station No. 1 structure's individual style that follows the eccentric, asymmetric rhythm of window and parapet placement, that translates to the proposed Hotel structure's façade adjacent.

It is recommended to employ a similar inventiveness with compositional juxtapositions that reference similar yet differing elements of modern design components consistent with the Fire Station No. 1 structure.

Where the addition of a reveal wall, partially detaching the new hotel façade from the Fire Station No. 1 structure is planned at the juncture between new and old to allow for "cipher" style connection. Use offsets in façade planes with defined seismic separation joints, so that the Fire Station No. 1 structure can be differentiated from the proposed new Hotel construction.

New construction of the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property should conform materially to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards nos. 9 and 10 regarding additions to historical or historically-eligible structures:

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The related new construction of the Two Hotel project is performed as an addition in a manner that presents limited impacts for the Fire Station No. 1. Consequently, there is limited destruction of historic features by the related new construction.

Differentiation and compatibility of the proposed two-hotel scheme with the Fire Station No. 1 structure is accomplished in the following manners:

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 52/71

7.3.1: Horizontal datum lines created by the two-story volume of Fire Station No. 1 are continued across to the two-story plinth design of the proposed project. This two-story base design element references the masonry color and material in the Fire Station façade and will reinforce a compatible tie into the proposed design adjacent to the existing landmark. The datum lines of existing floors, roofs and window sills are transposed across from the proposed design;

7.3.2: The brick masonry façades of the Fire Station No. 1 are referenced at the ground floor level of the proposed project, continuing similarities of color, texture and character;

7.3.3: Continuous "ribbon" horizontal windows evident at the Fire Station No. 1 are compatibly reintroduced at the upper levels of the proposed hotel project;

7.3.4: Compatibility with the historic materials: brick masonry, smooth plaster finishes, steel and glass panels of the Apparatus Room doors, storefront door and windows;

7.3.5: Compatibility with the historic features: Second floor projecting volume, hose-drying tower as a vertical element, flat roof massing elements, landscaping provisions at grade;

7.3.6: Compatibility with the size, scale and proportion, and massing is addressed in the project context location that consists of two overlapping historic districts. Reference to Section 3.4, pages 34-35;

# 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The related new construction of the Two Hotel project is performed as adjacent addition; as so detailed this approach presents limited impacts for the Fire Station No. 1. Consequently, there is limited destruction of historic features by the related new construction resulting in a theoretical "reversibility" of the proposed addition with an unimpaired essential form and integrity of the historic property.

Conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Rehabilitation Standards equates to a project compliance with CEQA.



Plan showing "Cipher" recess at ground floor and upper floor plans:

Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, schematic design study; ground and upper floor level.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 53/71



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study; Exterior façade colors and materials; partial view of Fire Station No. 1 structure.

## • <u>7.4</u> Summary of Recommendations:

As previously referenced in Section 1 and 2 of this Historical Assessment Report, Sections 1.6 (City Municipal Code, Section 20.25.050.G; Principles and Standards of Site Development and Design Review) and 1.7 (the Principles of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties), the Cultural Heritage Board and the City of Riverside's Historic Preservation Officer *"shall make findings of the following standards when applicable to approving or denying a Certificate of Appropriateness."* (City Ord. 7108 §1, 2010; Ord. 6263 §1 (part), 1996.)

The Rehabilitation standards are the appropriate definition for this project. Following is a summary review of these Standards, including comments for how this Report assesses this proposed project and its review:

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 54/71

# The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

- The project continues an appropriate commercial use of the property;
- In the adaptive-reuse project, minimal changes are proposed to distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships. New uses are accommodated with construction and detailing practices that represent a reversible approach.

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

• The proposed project preserves the historical character of the property and structure. Rehabilitation and repair of the distinctive, character-defining features does not alter the character of the building. Features that are being removed are not definable as distinctive nor appropriate.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

- There are no additions of features from other historic properties, or conjectural features that could create a false sense of historical development. New construction is readily identifiable.
- Alterations to this structure recognize and record its physical history, which includes a series of additions and alterations over time including changes in its use.

## 4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

• The façade of the Fire Station No. 1 structure will be retained, rehabilitated and preserved; this acknowledges that various minor alterations made over time have not acquired significance.

# 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

 Such distinctive features are proposed to be preserved, whether they are exposed to view or not.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 55/71

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

Repair of features is a primary approach; where features are deteriorated beyond repair the replacement materials will be constructed to match the original materials in design, profile, material color, and concept. The exact details for the repairs and reintegration of proposed re-use elements are to be further developed in the detailing phase of the proposed AC Marriott/Residence Inn two-hotel property Construction Documents. Particular attention will be focused on the primary character- defining features: the elements and details of the north, south and east façades.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

 Cleaning procedures will be specified to not cause damage to historical materials, nor the natural environment.

8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

• Where limited areas of excavations for the miscellaneous sitework are planned, an archaeologist should be retained for observation and analysis as needed.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

- Additions proposed for the new hotel are distinctive from the original Fire Station No. 1 structure. The proposed design is clearly differentiated from the old, while the character of the massing and volumes demonstrate compatibility with the original structure character.
- Alterations to the exterior do not destroy historic materials or spatial relationships.
- The integrity of the property and its overall environment has been preserved.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

- The extent of additions planned are considered to embody the "reversibility" concept, where the structural demands of the alterations and additions will not impact the essential form, nor the material and physical integrity of this structure.
- The proposed main entrance façade modification will be detailed so that the impact on original historical features remain unaffected. The exact details for the repairs and reintegration of

Modern Historical Architecture

 $\begin{array}{c} \mbox{Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:} \\ \mbox{AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA} \\ \mbox{Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page } 56/71 \end{array}$ 

proposed new and re-used elements are to be further developed in the detailing phase of the Construction Documents.



Axis/GFA Architecture + Design, design study; East exterior façade.

End of Historical Assessment Report Issue date 13 January 2021

## George Taylor Louden AIA, inc.

Historical Architect Historical Architecture/Design Consulting

# 8 APPENDICES

- A1 > Detail existing conditions GTL | MHA photographs
- A2 > Research & Reference sources cited
- A3 > Author's qualifications.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 57/71

Project: Assessment of proposed AC Marriott hotel at 3466 Mission Inn Boulevard, Riverside CA 92501on the adjacent lot adjoining Central Fire Station / Fire Station No. 1 at 3420 Mission Inn Avenue as façade rehabilitation and a future Adaptive Reuse project

# 8 APPENDICES

	A1 >	Detail existing conditions GTL   MHA photographs
•	<u>8.1</u>	A1 Central Fire Station Number 1 Details



GTL | MHA, August 2019 photograph of Riverside Fire Station #1;

View of Character-defining primary north exterior façade, from northwest corner showing the intersecting and interlocking spatial volumes, apparatus door and projected second floor volume on piloti with planter wall beneath.

Modern Historical Architecture

 $\begin{array}{c} \mbox{Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:}\\ \mbox{AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA}\\ \mbox{Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page } 58/71 \end{array}$ 



View of Character-defining primary exterior façade features, from northeast corner showing the intersecting spatial volumes, apparatus door and projected second floor volume on piloti; steel and wood framed windows.



GTL | MHA, March 2019 photograph of Riverside Fire Station #1;

Perspective view of Character-defining primary and secondary exterior façade, from northeast corner showing the intersecting spatial volumes, projected second floor volume on piloti; hose drying tower behind. Roof access ladder and antenna mast are later additions.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 59/71



GTL | MHA, March 2019 photograph of Riverside Fire Station #1; Oblique view of Character-defining secondary exterior west and partial south façades, from southwest corner showing the intersecting spatial volumes, bries soliel sun shades of different details on west and south façades, projected second floor volume on piloti; hose drying tower at far right; later equipment enclosure and roof access ladder are noncompatible additions.



GTL | MHA, March 2019 photograph of Riverside Fire Station #1;

Interior view of Character-defining primary exterior façade, public entrance showing interior window sill details and possibly later modified exterior door.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 60/71



Character-defining secondary exterior façade of south elevation, from southwest corner showing the intersecting spatial volumes, exquisite concrete placement and finishing work at the hose drying tower, steel louvre panels, continuous at top of tower; presumed later apparatus room doors.

GTL | MHA, March 2019 photograph of Riverside Fire Station #1; Primary exterior north façade view of character-defining elevations from northeast corner, showing the intersecting spatial volumes, projecting masonry wing wall, eccentrically placed window, offset running bond coursing, and edge of apparatus room door. Note offset cracking at masonry wall adjacent to the apparatus door lintel. Detail of offset window in background, steel framing, and brick coursing detail.

Modern Historical Architecture

## Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 61/71



GTL | MHA, October 2019 photograph of Riverside Fire Station #1;

West façade, character-defining secondary exterior façade, from west showing the intersecting spatial volumes, planter under projected second floor volume on piloti, shade screen (brise soliel over windows); antenna tower behind.

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 62/71



GTL | MHA, March 2019 photograph of Riverside Fire Station #1; Detail view of Character-defining secondary exterior façade, from northwest corner showing the intersecting spatial volumes, fixed brise soliel sun shades and fenestration detailing.



GTL | MHA, March 2019 photograph of Riverside Fire Station #1;

Perspective view of Character-defining primary exterior façade, from northeast corner showing the intersecting spatial volumes, open apparatus door and projected second floor volume on piloti; hose drying tower behind. Approximate view used in 1956 rendering.

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 63/71

# • <u>8.2</u> A2 > Research & References cited

# A2 >

- City of Riverside website and Planning documents, Downtown Specific Plan
- DPR 523 form,
- Proposed project schematic design studies, Axis/GFA Architecture + Design
- January 2001 Historic Resources Survey, Wayne Donaldson

(CEQA Guidelines, § 15354.) The "Class 32" exemption is one such class promoting "shovel-ready" urban infill development projects through categorical streamlining. Established in 1998, this urban infill exemption requires projects to be consistent with applicable general plans and zoning designations, located within a city's limits on a site five acres or less, bordered by urban uses, and without significant impacts to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality. The project site itself can be either vacant or previously developed, but must be devoid of sensitive habitat and adequately served by public utilities. (CEQA Guidelines, § 15332).

# 18.36.330 Class 31—Historical resource restoration/rehabilitation (CEQA Guidelines, Section 15331).

Class 31 consists of projects limited to maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation, or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitation, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings (1995), Weeks and Grimmer. (Ord. 5119-B, 2001

#### PRC section 21084.1

A project that may cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource is a project that may have a significant effect on the environment. For purposes of this section, an historical resource is a resource listed in, or determined to be eligible for listing in, the California Register of Historical Resources.

Modern Historical Architecture

#### Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 64/71

State of California — The Re		Primary #				
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS A	ND RECREATION	HRI#				
PRIMARY RECOR	D	Trinomial				
		NRHP Status Code	1CS, 3S, 5S3			
	Other Listings					
	Review Code	Reviewer	Date			
Page 1 of 4 *Resource Name or #: Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1)						
P1. Other Identifier:						
*P2. Location:  Diversified Not for Publication Unrestricted *a. County: Riverside						
and (P2b and P2c or P2d. Attach a Location Map as necessary.)						
*b. USGS 7.5' Quad: River	rside East	Date: May 17, 2012				
c. Address: 3420 Mission	n Inn Avenue	City: Riversid	le Zip: 92501			

e. Other Locational Data: APN 213-281-005-0; Alternate address 3466 Mission Inn Avenue.

\*P3a. Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries) This property is located on the southwest corner of Mission Inn Avenue and Lime Street and contains the Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1) constructed in 1957. The Central Fire Station exhibits characteristics of the International Style. It is one to two stories in height, with a flat roof, and composed of groups of rectangular masses that house separate functions. The firemen's quarters are on the second floor, housed within a discrete, stucco box; the second floor overhangs the first floor and is supported by metal posts. Fenestration on the firemen's quarters consists of a band of flush-mounted, divided light steel sash windows that wrap the corner on the primary (north) façade. The windows appear to be a combination of fixed and hopper windows. On the secondary (west) façade are single or grouped flush-mounted, divided light, metal sash windows; the lowest sash appears to be an operable hopper window. The windows on the west façade all have operable metal louvers mounted on the façade. The engine bays and apparatus room are located in the one-story volume to the east. Cladding is a combination of brick in a running bond and smooth stucco. There are three engine bays with metal roll-up doors. The primary pedestrian entrance is centered on the first story beneath the firemen's quarters and consists of a double, fully-glazed, metal door. There are integrated brick planters to the west of the door.

#### \*P3b. Resource Attributes: HP14 - Government building

\*P4. Resources Present: Building Structure Object Site District Element of District Other (Isolates, etc.)



P5b. Description of Photo: (View, date, accession #) View looking Southeast (March 2013)

\*P6. Date Constructed/Age and Sources: ■Historic □Prehistoric □Both 1961, building permits

\*P7. Owner and Address:

\*P8. Recorded by: Historic Resources Group 12 S Fair Oaks Ave, Ste 200 Pasadena, CA 91105

\*P9. Date Recorded: February 20, 2013

\*P10. Survey Type: Intensive

#### \*P11. Report Citation:

Historic Resources Group, Citywide Modernism Intensive Survey, September 2013.

\*Attachments: □NONE □Location Map □Sketch Map ■Continuation Sheet ■Building, Structure, and Object Record □Archaeological Record □District Record □Linear Feature Record □Milling Station Record □Rock Art Record □Artifact Record □Photograph Record □ Other (List):

Modern Historical Architecture

#### Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

GTL | MHA

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 65/71

State of California — The Resources Agency	Primary #					
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION	HRI#					
BUILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJECT RECORD						
Page 2 of 4	*NRHP Status Code 1CS, 3S, 5S3					
*Resource Name or # Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1)						
B1. Historic Name: Central Fire Station						
B2. Common Name: Central Fire Station						
B3. Original Use: Public B4. Pro	esent Use: Public					
*B5. Architectural Style: International Style						
*B6. Construction History:						
Completed in 1957. Existing underground fuel tanks were removed and replaced with above-ground fuel tanks in 1993. Roof replaced in 1996. Exterior access ladder to roof added in 2008.						
*B7. Moved? ■No □Yes □Unknown Date:	Original Location:					
*B8. Related Features:						
B9a. Architect: Moise, Harbach and Hewlett	b. Builder: Cal Construction Company					
*B10. Significance: Theme: Modern Architecture & Architects of Modernism						
Area: Riverside						
Period of Significance: 1957	Property Type: Public					
Applicable Criteria: C/3/c. d						

The Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1) located at 3420 Mission Inn Avenue is an excellent and rare example of an International Style fire station in Riverside. It was designed by noted local architectural firm Moise, Harbach and Hewlett and constructed in 1957. The growth in population in the immediate post-World War II period created a profound need for expanded city services, and several bond measures were placed on the ballot for the construction of fire stations, libraries, and schools. In 1952, the City put a \$440,000 bond measure on the ballot for the construction of a new fire station to replace the original downtown station on Eighth Street (now University Avenue). Cal Construction Company broke ground on the new fire station in April 1956, and the building was completed by March 1957.

The Central Fire Station is a rare local example of the International Style. In 1932, the Museum of Modern Art hosted its first architecture exhibit, titled simply "Modern Architecture." The exhibit included buildings from around the world that shared a stark simplicity and vigorous functionalism. The term International Style was coined by Henry Russell Hitchcock and Philip Johnson in their catalog for the exhibit. Within the International Style, two trends emerged after World War II. In the first post-war trend, the emphasis was on the expression of the building's function. These buildings have more in common with the early work of Walter Gropius than Mies van der Rohe. Gropius created innovative designs that borrowed materials and methods of construction from modern technology. His advocacy of industrialized building carried with it a belief in teamwork and an acceptance of standardization and prefabrication. Gropius introduced a screen wall system that utilized a structural steel frame to support the floors and which allowed the external glass walls to continue without interruption.

See Continuation Sheet.

B11. Additional Resource Attributes:

\*B12. References:

See Continuation Sheet.

B13. Remarks:

\*B14. Evaluator: Christine Lazzaretto

\*Date of Evaluation: February 20, 2013

(This space reserved for official comments.)



\*Required information

Modern Historical Architecture

#### Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 66/71

State of California — The Resources Agency DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION	Primary # HRI#				
CONTINUATION SHEET	Trinomial				
Page 3 of 4 *Resource Name or # Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1)					
*Recorded by: Historic Resources Group	*Date: February 20, 2013■ Continuation □ Update				
Significance Statement Continued.					
The Central Fire Station (1957) in Riverside is a classic example of the first International Style trend, and it exhibits significant character- defining features of the style, including groups of rectangular masses with a clear expression of form and function, cantilevered volumes, flat roofline, horizontal bands of flush windows that meet at the corners, and absence of ornamentation. In the layout of the new building, Moise incorporated the stacking of the domitory quarters atop the ground-level offices – while still maintaining immediate access to the engines – thereby allowing for an adjacent, column-free engine bay (a necessity for modern fire equipment). The new building also included modern fire communication equipment and updated living amenities. The design of Central Fire Station incorporated all of the modern necessities and conveniences made possible by postwar technology.					
Bolton Moise, Jr. was born on August 17, 1905 in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania and attended the architecture school at Harvard University, where he received a B.A. in 1927 and M.A. in 1931. While at Harvard, he earned the Cram Award, the AIA School Medal, and was elected to Alpha Rho Chi. Following graduation, Moise studied abroad for three years, spending most of his time in Paris, along with England and Germany. While in Paris, he spent time studying under French architect Eduard Leon. Upon his return to the United States, Moise worked for Edward Durrell Stone as a draftsman in 1934, moving to the firm Franklin and Brown to be a designer in 1936. In 1938, he became a designer for the firm Desmond and Lord in Boston. While practicing on the east coast, Moise was involved in high profile projects including the Museum of Modern Art, the New York World's Fair, and as a structural engineer on the wartime defenses of Boston Harbor. He also worked as a designer for General Motors. During World War II, Moise served as a Captain in the Aviation Engineers, working as an engineering officer in the United States. After his military discharge in 1946, Moise moved to Southern California. He worked briefly for an architect in San Bernardino before setting up his own practice in Riverside in 1947 in offices in the Lewis Building in downtown Riverside. He practiced in Riverside until his retirement in 1970. He is responsible for the design of many prominent buildings in Riverside, including numerous public and educational buildings. His most prominent commission is the Main Branch of the Riverside Public Library (1963-1965), which he designed with Edward Fickers. Bolton Moise died at the age of 84 in Riverside on November 8, 1989.					
Wendell M. Harbach was born on December 12, 1923 in San Bernardino. By 1930, the family was living in Riverside. Harbach attended Poly High School in Riverside in the 1940s, and graduated from the USC School of Architecture in the early 1950s. After graduation, Harbach returned to Riverside and began practicing architecture, with a primary focus on school design. Harbach worked in various partnerships throughout his career, including with Bolton Moise in the late 1950s and early 1960s. Wendell Harbach died in Riverside on June 3, 2007.					
There is little available information about James A. Hewlett. Hewlett was born on November 26, 1921 in San Bernardino. In 1943, he enlisted in the Air Corps as an Aviation Cadet and was stationed at the Santa Ana Army Base. Following the war, Hewlett practiced architecture in Riverside, either independently or as part of various local firms. He designed a number of local schools.					
The Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1) retains all seven aspects of integrity and continues to convey its historic significance. It was listed in the California Register in 2008. It also appears eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places at the local level of significance, and as a local landmark. It is eligible under the Modern Architecture theme as an excellent and rare example of an International Style fire station in Riverside that showcases advances in post-World War II fire station design. It is eligible under the Architecture for Modernism theme as the work of the significant local architectural firm Moise, Harbach and Hewlett.					
References.					
"Architect of Riverside Landmarks Dies at 84," Press-Enterprise, November	11, 1984.				
City of Riverside Building Permits.					
City of Riverside Modernism Context Statement, prepared for the City of River November 2009.	rside by Christopher A. Joseph & Associates, Los Angeles, CA,				
County of Riverside Property Information Center.					
Riverside County Land Information System (LIS).					
Sorrell, Tanya. "Central Fire Station (Fire Station No. 1) California Register Nomination Form," 2008.					
"Spotlight: Central Fire Station, "modernriverside.com. <u>http://www.modernriv</u>	verside.com/wordpress/?p=9. Accessed March 2013.				
DPR 523L (1/95)	*Required information				

Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report: AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 67/71



Modern Historical Architecture

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 68/71

# **8.3 A3** > Author's Qualifications

George Taylor Louden AIA, inc.

Architect and Historical Consultant

Los Angeles, California e: taylor@historicalarchitect.com mobile: 310 874 8783

#### EDUCATION

Columbia University, Master of Architecture, 1980 Teaching Assistant, Historical Preservation Program, 1978-1980

University of Virginia, Bachelor of Science in Architecture, 1976 Polytechnic of Central London, Diploma Program, 1975

#### REGISTRATIONS

Licensed Architect in California 1992 (license C-24087) and New York 1982

#### Independent Historical Architectural Consulting Practice, GTL | HA, Los Angeles, CA

Principal, Sole Practitioner, Project Manager and Historic Preservation Specialist, 2004 to present

#### Exceeding qualifications as a historic architect and meeting the Secretary of the Interior's Standards of 36 CFR 61

#### **CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS**

- El Pueblo Historic Monument LA Plaza de Cultura (1883 & 1888), LA County Department of Public Works, 2004-2010
- Will Rogers State Historic Park, Ranch House Rehabilitation and Restoration; 2002-2006
- Will Rogers State Historic Park, Guest House Restoration and Interpretive Center remodel, 2008
- Will Rogers State Historic Park, Jim's Barn Restoration; 2006-2007
- Montecito Country Mart, rehabilitation and fire reconstruction, Rosenfield Properties, Santa Barbara CA, 2010-2015
- John Marshall High School, (1930), façade repair assessment and Rehabilitation Approach, LAUSD, 2013
- "le Trianon" Serrano Avenue Chateauesque 28 unit apartment building, rehabilitation and restoration, 2014-2015
- The Ellington" Hobart Avenue Art Deco 31 unit apartment building, rehabilitation and restoration, 2014
- Fountain Avenue Mid Century Modern 18 unit apartment building, rehabilitation and restoration, 2013-2014
- Rouse Building (1895 & 1924) Adaptive Reuse/ Barbara and Art Culver Center of the Arts, UC Riverside 2006-2010
- Imperial Hardware Building, adaptive reuse and façade rehabilitation, Riverside, Ratkovich Development 2015-2017
- Stalder Building, adaptive reuse and façade rehabilitation, Riverside, Regional Properties Inc, 2016-2017
- Wadsworth Chapel / All Faiths Chapel (1900) Department of Veterans Affairs, West Los Angeles, 2002->
- Merle Haggard Family Box Car Home, (1937-1946) Kern County Museum's Pioneer Village, Bakersfield 2016-2017
- "Almidor House" (1926-27) rehabilitation private residence, Woodland Hills, CA, 2004-2006
- Chamber of Commerce Building (1929,) rehabilitation & restoration; Kern County Museum, Bakersfield, 2005-2008
- 218 South Alta Vista residence, additions and alternations in Miracle Mile North HPOZ, Los Angeles, 2013-2016
- 101 South Alta Vista residence, additions and alternations in Miracle Mile North HPOZ, Los Angeles, 2015-2016
- 242 South Alta Vista residence accessory structure, alternations in Miracle Mile North HPOZ, Los Angeles, 2017>
- 6400 Hayes Drive residence, additions and alternations in Carthay Circle HPOZ, Los Angeles, 2016->
- Los Angeles County Hospital, Patient's Building adaptive reuse, County of Los Angeles, 2013-2014
- El Pueblo / LA Plaza de Cultura, museum interior modifications, LA County Department of Public Works, 2015-2017
- Veterans Administration West Los Angeles Bob Hope Memorial Chapel (1940), Construction Documents, 2015-2018
- Rustic Canyon Rec Center/ Uplifter's Clubhouse (1923), Rehabilitation & Restoration, 2014-2017
- Leona Valley Schoolhouse (1915), rehabilitation and entrance tower reconstruction, Leona Valley CA, 2014-2017

Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 69/71

- Bartlett Lofts HCM façade reconstruction and interior restoration, Los Angeles, CA 2016->
- Alta Drive residence and accessory structure addition and rehabilitation, Beverly Hills, CA 2017-2018
- Hardison Ranch, stabilization and rehabilitation of historical barn; accessory structures relocation, Santa Paula, CA, 2018>
- Hardison Ranch House, interior repairs and rehabilitation construction, Santa Paula, CA, 2018>
- The Brine LP, relocation and rehabilitation of three historic residences, adaptive reuse, Los Angeles, CA, 2018>

#### **DESIGN / BUILD CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS**

- "Artemesia" Residence (1913,) rehabilitation, compatible new site reconstruction, fine arts conservation, Hollywood, 2012
- Will Rogers State Historic Park, Jim's Barn Restoration; construction, detailing and finishing work, 2006-2007
- "Almidor House" (1926-27) rehabilitation, private residence, fine arts restoration, Woodland Hills, CA, 2005-2006

#### HISTORICAL ASSESSMENT RESOURCE REPORTS AND DOCUMENTATION PROJECTS

- Hawthorne Grammar School (1928,) historical assessment and memorandum report, City of Beverly Hills, 2012
- Mann National Theater historical assessment and memorandum report, City of Los Angeles, 2007
- Town of Amboy Historic Structure Report, Route 66/ Mojave Desert, CA; National Park Service, 2007-2009
- Veterans Administration San Francisco Medical Center, Vivarium project, Section 106 Review Request, 2010
- Will Rogers State Historic Park, Equestrian Facilities Master Plan document, 2010-2012
- Mapleton Building, 1954, historical assessment and memorandum report, City of Beverly Hills, 2012
- Equinox proposed tenant improvements, Beverly & Wilshire (Gruen, 1960), City of Beverly Hills, 2011-2013
- Veterans Administration San Diego Medical Center, Garage project, Section 106 Review Request, 2013
- SolarMax Adaptive Reuse assessment and project documentation for FMC Plant No. 2, Riverside CA, 2013
- Former William Morris Agency building, 1954, 150 el Camino historical assessment report, City of Beverly Hills, 2013
- Former William Morris Agency building, 1968, 151 el Camino historical assessment report, City of Beverly Hills, 2013
- North Camden Single Family Residence, historical assessment report, City of Beverly Hills, 2013
- Lexington Avenue Single Family Residence, historical assessment report, City of Beverly Hills, 2013
- North Camden Single Family Residence, historical assessment report, City of Beverly Hills, 2013
- Burton Way, Multi family Residence (Paul Williams) historical assessment report, City of Beverly Hills, 2013
- James Wood & Vermont development, relocation of 1930 Apartments, City of Los Angeles, 2013-2014
- Laurel Lane/Taylor Swift Single Family Residence historical landscape assessment report, City of Beverly Hills, 2016
- Grand Avenue Residence historic assessment memo, City of South Pasadena, 2014
- 8665 Wilshire Boulevard office building historical assessment report, City of Beverly Hills, 2014
- Veterans Administration West Los Angeles Bob Hope Memorial Chapel, Section 106 Review Request, 2015-2016
- EKCO Manufacturing Facility, Whittier CA; Historic Assessment Report, 2015-2016
- Rustic Canyon Rec Center/ Uplifter's Clubhouse (1923), Preservation Master Plan / Historical Society, 2014-2016
- Imperial Hardware Store, Assessment Report, Adaptive reuse and façade rehabilitation, Riverside CA, 2015-2016
- Bartlett Lofts, HCM assessment report and rehabilitation, (1911-1937-1982), Los Angeles CA, 2016->
- Pasadena Unified School District, San Rafael Elementary School assessment report, Pasadena CA 2016-2017
- Pasadena Unified School District, Linda Vista Elementary School assessment report, Pasadena CA 2016-2017
- West LA VA, Building 33 rehabilitation of 1893 Superintendent's residence for 1887 Fund, Los Angeles CA 2017->
- West LA VA, Wadsworth Chapel restoration construction documentation for 1887 Fund, Los Angeles, CA 2017>
- LAUSD, Hamasaki Elementary School Accessibility Impact study, Los Angeles CA 2018
- LAUSD, 107<sup>th</sup> Street Elementary School Accessibility Impact study, Los Angeles CA 2018
- Port of Long Beach, "Smokes" structures evaluation and relocation assessment, Mitigation project, Long Beach, 2018>
- Benedict Canyon Drive, Single Family Residence (Paul Williams) Historical Assessment report, City of Beverly Hills, 2017-2018
- Iredell Street, Single Family Residence Historic Resource Assessment Report, Studio City, CA 2018
- Sunset Boulevard, Single family Residence (Paul Williams) Historic Resource Assessment Report, City of Beverly Hills, 2018
- Knollwood United Methodist Church (1967) Historic Resource Assessment Report, Los Angeles CA, 2018
- 301 North Rodeo BH,
- 609 North Alta Drive

HISTORICALLY REFERENTIAL DESIGN, CONTEMPORARY CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS

Richard Neutra's Hailey House, 1961, rehabilitation: research and design detailing, Los Angeles, 2013-2014

Modern Historical Architecture

#### Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 70/71

- 501 N Cahuenga, design of a compatible addition to a 1953 John Lautner addition to a 1924 residence; 2014
- Durant Drive residential condominium, proposed compatible design, Beverly Hills, 2009-2011
- Le Trianon, 1928 Historical Cultural Monument, master rehabilitation construction plan, Los Angeles, 2013-2014
- 292 South La Cienega, Preservation master plan, restoration and rehabilitation, City of Beverly Hills, 2013-2014
- First Responder's Fire Station House, Amboy California, compatible design in eligible district, 2009-2010
- Montecito Country Mart, 1960's thematic shopping center rehabilitation, JR Rosenfield, Santa Barbara, 2010
- West Adams Specific Plan District, new 12-unit apartment structure design, Los Angeles, 2013
- Weisman Development, design consultant for multiple condominium projects, West Los Angeles, 2008-2011
- Interpretive 1924 façade reconstruction design, HCM/Mills Act Property, Whitley Heights, Los Angeles, 2013
- Entitlements study for proposed multifamily building development, Hawthorne Avenue, Los Angeles, 2014
- Fountain Avenue mid-century modern apartment building, rehabilitation and alteration, 2013-2014
- 8665 Wilshire Boulevard, historical design recommendations and restoration, City of Beverly Hills, 2014
- Barron Residence Compound, Bellagio Drive, Paul Williams residential remodel, Beverly Hills CA, 2014-2015
- Ninth & Main Mixed-Use Development, Ratkovich Properties, Riverside CA, 2016-2017
- Riverside Mission Heritage Plaza, Wakeland Housing & Development Corp, Riverside CA, 2016-2017

#### EXPERT WITNESS TESTIMONY, HISTORICAL PROJECTS

- 717 Schumacher Drive, Carthay Circle HPOZ, Residential reconstruction/poria, research and design detailing, Los Angeles, 2011-2012
- Alpine Drive SFR Assessment Report, Beverly Hills, 2013-2016

#### PRIOR WORK EXPERIENCE

In association with: Fields Devereaux Architects & Engineers (now Harley Ellis Devereaux,) Los Angeles, CA Associate, Senior Project Architect, Project Manager and Historic Preservation Specialist, 1999-2004

- Doheny Memorial Library, 1927, Voluntary Seismic Upgrade, University of Southern California, Los Angeles
- Old Administration Building Restoration, 1903, Los Angeles County/USC Medical Center, Los Angeles
- Will Rogers State Historic Park, Ranch House Preservation and Mitigation, 1927-1935, Pacific Palisades CA

In association with: Hardy Holzman Pfeiffer Associates (now Pfeiffer Partners,) Los Angeles, CA Project Architect and Historic Preservation Specialist, 1997-1999

- Griffith Observatory, 1933, Historic Structure Report and Schematic Design, Los Angeles, 1997-1999
- King Street Railroad Station, 1905, Rehabilitation and Design Development, Seattle WA 1998-1999
- Encina Hall, Stanford University, 1891, Restoration and Rehabilitation, Palo Alto, CA, 1997-1999

In association with: Peter Marino + Associates, Architects, New York, NY Project Architect, Designer, and Construction Manager, 1990-1994

- Barneys New York Retail Stores, Beverly Hills, Manhattan, Westport, Manhasset, 1991-1994
- Whittle Corporate Headquarters, Knoxville Tennessee, 1990-1991

In association with: Mitchell/Giurgola Associates Architects (now MGA Architects,) New York, NY Construction Project Architect, Designer, Draftsman, 1985-1990

- IBM, Customer Executive Education Center/ Advanced Business Institute, Palisades, NY, 1986-1989
- 300 Atlantic Street, new 14 story commercial office building, Stamford CT, 1985-1988

In association with: James Stewart Polshek and Partners (now Ennead Architects,) New York, NY Historic Project Survey Team Leader, Assistant Project Architect, Designer, Draftsman, 1981-1982, 1990

- Carnegie Hall, 1891-2, Rehabilitation, Manhattan, New York, 1981-1982
- United States Customs House, Rehabilitation, 1899-1907, Manhattan, New York, 1981-1982
- New York Bar Association, Rehabilitation, 1905, Manhattan, New York, 1982

In association with: Architectural Resources Group, Pasadena CA Historic Project Assistant Project Architect, 2006-2007

Robinson Astrophysics Laboratory, Caltech, 1935-37, Rehabilitation, Pasadena CA

GTL | MHA

Modern Historical Architecture

#### Historic Resource Evaluation Assessment Report:

AC Greens Two-Hotel addition to and Rehabilitation of Fire Station #1, Riverside CA

Document issue 13 January 2021 / Page 71/71

In association with: Barbara Lamprecht, Pasadena CA

- Hailey House rehabilitation (Richard Neutra, 1958-1961,) Los Angeles, CA: Historic Project Architect, 2013-2014
- Laurel Lane/Taylor Swift Residence historical landscape assessment report, City of Beverly Hills, 2016
- Plummer Park Historical Research and Assessment of Community Hall and Fiesta Hall, West Hollywood CA, 2017-2018

#### **PROFESSIONAL MEMBERSHIPS**

American Institute of Architects; National Trust for Historic Preservation;

California Preservation Foundation, member, Board of Trustees, 2015->;

Los Angeles Conservancy; The Association for Preservation Technology International;

Institute of Classical Architecture & Art;

DSW Volunteer, State of California EMA, Safety Assessment Program;

Partial list of Preservation Offices, City of Los Angeles Planning Department;

Approved Historical Architecture Consultant, City of Beverly Hills

Professional Business License, City of South Pasadena

Board Chair and two-term Architect representative for the City of Los Angeles Planning Department, Miracle Mile North Historic Preservation Overlay Zone Design Review Board 2002-2011

#### AWARDS / RECOGNITIONS

Certificate of Recognition, City of Los Angeles, commended individually for dedicated service in historic preservation efforts of the community, 2010.

Preservation Design Award, LA Conservancy 2001 (Doheny Library)

Preservation Design Award, LA Conservancy 2004 (Old Administration Building)

National Trust for Historic Preservation, Stanford University Projects Recognition 2001 (Encina Hall)

Historic Preservation Award, The Old Riverside Foundation for Historic Preservation, 2010 (Rouse/ Culver Center)

#### PROFESSIONAL ACTIVITIES / LECTURES / WORKSHOPS / SEMINARS / WEBINARS

California Preservation Foundation, member of Board of Trustees, Chair of Conference Program Committee, 2015-present;

California Preservation Foundation, Education Committee member, 2009-present;

California Preservation Foundation, Annual Conference Programs Committee member, 2008 (Napa), 2009 (Palm Springs), 2011 (Santa Monica), 2012 (Oakland), 2013 (Orange County), 2014 (Monterey), 2015 (San Diego), 2016 (San Francisco), 2017 (Pasadena), 2018 (Palo Alto), 2019 (Palm Springs)

End of Historical Assessment Report, Appendices Issue date 13 January 2021

George Taylor Louden AIA, inc.

Historical Architect Historical Architecture Consultant